





Finn Church Aid



Skills and labour market transitions for refugees and host communities

Case studies and country practices on the inclusion of refugees in Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) and employment



© Finn Church Aid / Erik Nyström



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This report was drafted by Nicola Giordano, Federico Ercolano and Marta Makhoul at Action Against Hunger UK, and reviewed by staff from UNHCR, ILO, FCA and GIZ on behalf of BMZ. It benefited from financial support from UNHCR and ILO under the PROSPECTS partnership funded by the Government of the Netherlands and technical support from GIZ and FCA. The core team of the four collaborating agencies is grateful to the field and regional colleagues and other humanitarian and development partners who provided valuable information and documentation to this study, and joined national validation events in each of the countries covered.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACRONYMS	6
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	9
	15
OBJECTIVES AND SCOPE OF THE REPORT	17
ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK AND RESEARCH APPROACH	17
REGIONAL REFUGEE RESPONSE FRAMEWORKS	18
REGIONAL INITIATIVES FOR THE COUNTRIES COVERED	19
COUNTRY FINDINGS: JORDAN	23
JORDAN CONTEXT	24
TVET PROGRAMMES AND ACTORS IN JORDAN	28
CONCLUSIONS	35
COUNTRY FINDINGS: SUDAN	39
SUDAN CONTEXT	40
TVET PROGRAMMES AND ACTORS IN SUDAN	47
EMERGING PRACTICES IN TVET IN SUDAN	52
CONCLUSIONS	53
COUNTRY FINDINGS: ETHIOPIA	57
ETHIOPIA CONTEXT	58
TVET PROGRAMMES AND ACTORS IN ETHIOPIA	63
CONCLUSIONS	70

COUNTRY FINDINGS: KENYA	75
KENYA CONTEXT	76
TVET PROGRAMMES AND ACTORS IN KENYA	79
CONCLUSIONS	88
COUNTRY FINDINGS: UGANDA	93
UGANDA CONTEXT	94
TVET PROGRAMMES AND ACTORS IN UGANDA	98
CONCLUSIONS	107
GLOBAL RECOMMENDATIONS	111
PARTNERSHIPS	112
INCLUSION OF REFUGEES AND IDPS	112
TEACHER TRAINING AND TRAINING OF TRAINERS	113
LABOUR MARKET ORIENTATION	113
LIFE/CORE SKILLS AND SUPPORT SERVICES	115
GENDER EQUALITY AND INCLUSION OF VULNERABLE GROUPS	115
RECOGNITION AND ACCREDITATION	116
BRIDGING TO THE LABOUR MARKET	116
TECHNOLOGY, ENVIRONMENT AND INNOVATION	117
REFERENCE LIST	. 119
PUBLICATIONS	120
OTHER WEBSITES	123
ANNEX	. 125
KEY ANALYTICAL DIMENSIONS	126
KEY INFORMANT INTERVIEW TOOL	128

ACRONYMS

ADRA	Adventist Development and Relief Agency
AU	African Union
AWYAD	African Women & Youth Action for Development
BMZ	Bundesministerium für Wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung (Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development)
CRRF	Comprehensive Refugee Response Framework
CRRP	Comprehensive Refugee Response Plan
CSOs	Civil Society Organizations
FCA	Finn Church Aid
GIZ	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit GmbH
GRF	Global Refugee Forum
IDPs	Internally Displaced Peoples
IGAD	Intergovernmental Authority on Development
ILO	International Labour Organization
INGOs	International Non-Governmental Organizations
lOs	International Organizations
KII	Key Informant Interview

MTI	Medical	Teams	International
-----	---------	-------	---------------

- NGOs | Non-Governmental Organizations
 - PPP | Private Public Partnership
 - REC | Regional Economic Communities
 - RPL | Recognition of Prior Learning
- TVET | Technical and Vocational Education and Training
- TVSDC Technical and Vocational Skills Development Commission
- UNHCR | United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
 - VT | Vocational Training
 - VTC | Vocational Training Centres
 - WBL | Work-based learning
 - YAN Youth Allied Network



© Finn Church Aid / Erik Nyström

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This study is a joint collaboration of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR), International Labour Organization (ILO), Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) and Finn Church Aid (FCA) to identify good practices related to access to Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) programmes for refugees and internally displaced people (IDPs), as well as their host communities, and their transition to the labour market. The study reviews TVET systems and programmes implemented by national ministries, private sector actors, development agencies and non-governmental organizations (NGOs) across five countries - Ethiopia, Jordan, Kenya, Sudan and Uganda – prior to and during the COVID-19 pandemic, which has created additional challenges for the livelihoods and inclusion of forcibly displaced people around the world.



With regard to emerging practices and recommendations, this study identified:

- Solutions to overcoming barriers in accessing TVET for refugees and host communities.
- Success factors regarding access to, retention in, and completion of TVET programmes.
- **3.** The conditions for an effective transition to the labour market.
- **4.** Programmatic approaches that seem most successful and innovative and can be replicated.

The analysis considers a number of dimensions such as: inclusion of refugees in the national TVET system, market orientation of programmes, support services from TVET actors, accreditation of completed courses, teacher training and professional development, life/core skills, technological innovations, bridging to labour market, gender equality and inclusion of vulnerable groups, and successful partnership models.

To frame the study, a number of global and regional initiatives are presented, most importantly the Global Compact on Refugees (GCR), which is the guiding document in recognizing that a permanent solution to refugee crises cannot be accomplished without international collaboration. Alongside the Global Compact, several regional platforms and bodies play an important role in advocating for the rights of refugees, such as the Nairobi (2018) and Kampala (2019)¹ Declarations of the Inter-Governmental Authority on Development (IGAD).

To conduct the analysis in each country, two or three flagship programmes were chosen to illustrate some of the main considerations relating to TVET programmes and to what extent they enable a transition to the labour market for those aspiring to find decent work. The information was collected through key informants from the five countries and a thorough review of relevant and available programmatic information and secondary literature.

¹ Nairobi Declaration and Call for Action on Education; and UNHCR - Kampala Declaration on jobs, livelihoods and self-reliance for refugees, returnees and host communities in IGAD Region.



© Translieu/Nyaberi

The following table includes the global recommendations of the study:

PARTNERSHIPS

- Learn from each other and work together.
- Strengthen horizontal exchange.
- Seek innovative financing solutions for TVET.

LIFE/CORE SKILLS AND SUPPORT SERVICES

Include life/core skills within skills standards and TVET courses.

- Offer career guidance, counselling and mentoring.
- Offer language, literacy and cultural courses where needed.
- Build confidence.

INCLUSION OF REFUGEES AND IDPS

Understand barriers to access and participation with more and better disaggregated data to define prior qualifications of refugees and IDPs.

Translate inclusive national policy documents into regulatory frameworks.

Strengthen TVET bodies for inclusive TVET systems.

Support non-formal training and the upgrading of informal apprenticeships as pathways to formal TVET.

Value the socioeconomic potential of refugees and IDPs.

- Include refugees and IDPs in programming cycles.
- Scale-up inclusive TVET programmes with multiple partners.
- Value prior learning.

Provide psychosocial support and promote social cohesion through TVET.

GENDER EQUALITY AND INCLUSION OF VULNERABLE GROUPS

- Consider specific access barriers.
- Set-up financing schemes for vulnerable groups.
- Promote female enrolment.
- Ensure a safe learning environment.
- Consider the needs of students with disabilities in providing TVET.

RECOGNITION AND ACCREDITATION

Bring forward recognition of prior learning and mutual recognition of skills and qualifications at national, regional and global level.

Make sure courses are accredited and recognized.

TEACHER TRAINING AND TRAINING OF TRAINERS

Value teachers and trainers.

Support formalized TVET teacher training.

Develop skills for conflict-sensitive teaching, psychosocial support and inclusive education.

BRIDGING TO THE LABOUR MARKET

Build stronger linkages to the private sector.

Support self-employment.

Facilitate transitions to work for the most vulnerable.

LABOUR MARKET ORIENTATION

Improve the image and perception of TVET.

- Understand labour markets better.
- Involve the private sector in the design of learning content.
- Encourage work-based learning schemes.

TECHNOLOGY, ENVIRONMENT AND INNOVATION

Consider high-tech and low-tech solutions.

Invest in digital skills.

- Support connectivity and ICT courses.
- | TVET for a transition to green economies.



© Finn Church Aid / Erik Nyström



INTRODUCTION

In 2019, UNHCR promoted TVET at the global level with three key stakeholders: FCA, GIZ on behalf of Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ) and ILO. These agencies joined their efforts at the TVET for Impact Roundtable (Finland, October 2019) and the Global Refugee Forum (Geneva, December 2019) where TVET was one of the focus areas under the Global Framework for Refugee Education. The need to establish a more systematic and organized approach to the sector emerged as a result of these meetings, especially since many activities and initiatives are active at the national level. To strengthen coordination, UNHCR, together with ILO, GIZ and FCA, commissioned a multi-country study aimed at identifying and collecting good practices related to access to and participation in TVET programmes for refugees, internally displaced people and host communities, which are implemented by national ministries, private sector actors, development agencies and NGOs. The study offers an excellent opportunity to consolidate the partnership between these stakeholders and to involve additional actors.

The strategic approaches and orientations of each organization with respect to TVET for refugees emerged clearly through the iterative dialogue with representatives and review of documents.

Coordination of international protection, assistance and solutions is at the heart of UNHCR's refugee mandate. The <u>Global Compact on Refugees</u>, which was adopted by UN Member States in December 2019, makes specific reference to TVET and further education. UNHCR is also leading on the <u>Refugee Education 2030 Strategy</u> and the <u>15by30 roadmap for</u> <u>refugee higher education</u>. There is a clear interest from UNHCR in collaborating with other agencies on TVET to ensure the inclusion of refugees into existing TVET programmes and their preparation for work and durable solutions, whether refugees will stay in the country of asylum, get a resettlement opportunity, or return to their country of origin.

In 2016, the ILO, as the only tripartite UN agency, adopted the <u>Guiding principles on the</u> <u>access of refugees and other forcibly displaced persons to the labour market</u>. These principles, in line with ILO's decent work agenda, highlight the need for a governance framework on access to labour markets, economic and employment policies for inclusive labour markets, labour rights and equality of opportunity and treatment. They call for access to skills development and upgrading, skills recognition and tailored vocational and entrepreneurship training for forcibly displaced people. Based on the Human Resources Declaration Recommendation 2004 (No. 195) and the Employment and Decent Work for Peace and Resilience Recommendation, 2017 (No. 205), and reinforced through the ILO Centenary Declaration for the Future of Work, 2019, the ILO supports its constituents in strengthening skills and lifelong learning systems and making them inclusive for all, including in fragile contexts. In 2017, ILO and UNHCR developed a <u>guide</u> to market-based livelihood interventions for refugees.

GIZ is a global service provider in the field of international cooperation for sustainable development and international education work. As a public-benefit federal enterprise, GIZ supports the German Government – in particular the Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ) – and many public and private sector clients in around 120 countries in achieving their objectives in international and development cooperation. On behalf of BMZ, GIZ supports partner countries in expanding and improving the quality of technical and vocational education and training systems. In doing so, GIZ activities are committed to equal access, inclusive, high-quality and labour market-oriented vocational training. German engagement in TVET is strengthened in multilateral and international processes, supporting the Agenda 2030 and achieving the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). GIZ represents a strategic partner for multilateral and bilateral accors working in TVET programmes for refugees and host communities. Its interest in this study arises from the aim to share best practice and improve existing strategies and approaches regarding access to vocational training and transition into the world of work for refugees and internally displaced persons.

Finn Church Aid is another critical partner in this study given its field experience in TVET. FCA is the biggest provider of international aid in Finland with experience of more than 70 years. FCA is a rights-based organization focusing on the three strategic focus areas of Right to Peace, Right to Livelihood and Right to Quality Education. Their work on TVET links to FCA's orientation to ensure the Right to Quality Education. FCA contributes to improved access and better quality of learning through four pillars: Education in Emergencies (EiE), TVET, Linking Learning to Earning (LL2E) and Education Sector Development and Teacher Education. The Linking Learning to Earning approach is FCA's bridge between TVET and livelihood. For this particular study, FCA draws on its work in Uganda and an innovative model for developing creative industries skills among refugees, an emerging practice area for TVET across the board.

OBJECTIVES AND SCOPE OF THE REPORT

The study aimed to review TVET systems across five countries (Ethiopia, Jordan, Kenya, Sudan and Uganda), identify success factors for refugees to access, participate in and complete TVET programmes, and look at how TVET leads to employment opportunities. The overarching objectives of this study are:

- To identify good practices in each country that can inform and guide TVET programming at the national level, particularly those that emphasise partnerships.
- To build an evidence base for the successful inclusion of refugees and IDPs into TVET programmes, and their transition to the world of work.

Good practice and evidence identified through this study relates to:

- The barriers in accessing TVET for refugees and host communities and the differences between these two groups.
- The success factors regarding access to, retention in, and completion of TVET programmes.
- The success factors for an effective transition to the labour market and/or further studies.
- The programmatic approaches that seem most successful and can be replicated.

Each country chapter starts with a general outline about the context, inclusion of refugees, governance of TVET and labour market structures and ends with a series of emerging practices and recommendations to support future analysis or programmatic improvement.

ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK AND RESEARCH APPROACH

The definition of technical and vocational education and training used here is in line with UNESCO: TVET is understood as comprising education, training and skills development relating to a wide range of occupational fields, production, services and livelihoods. TVET, as part of lifelong learning, can take place at secondary, post-secondary and tertiary levels and includes work-based learning and continuing training and professional development which may lead to qualifications. TVET also includes a wide range of skills development

opportunities attuned to national and local contexts. Learning to learn, the development of literacy and numeracy skills, transversal skills and citizenship skills are integral components of TVET.²

The analytical framework contained in Annex 1 considers how labour market information influences the design of TVET programmes from a market supply and market demand perspective. The mismatch between skills supply and demand dimensions should lead to decisions and actions addressed at minimizing this gap as a starting point for the analysis.

The analysis covers various components related to a broader labour market information system, skills needs assessments, and the capacity of institutions to choose adequate methods and tools to deliver quality and relevant training. A detailed semi-structured interview guide (see Key Informant Interview tool in <u>Annex 2</u>) helped to frame the analysis of TVET programmes along with enabling contextual conditions for linkages with the labour market.

The initial step was to conduct a thorough desk review of existing and recent TVET programmes across five countries focusing on two to three featured interventions. In addition to this, the team of consultants sourced relevant documents from other actors including United Nations (UN), civil society organizations (CSOs), media, research institutes and other organizations. A preliminary document review led to the identification of principal stakeholders involved in key TVET interventions focused on refugees. A more systematic review of strategic and planning documents followed. The programme evidence for the selected TVET interventions and their contexts contributed to the generation of shared evidence about the barriers and success factors regarding TVET across Sudan, Jordan, Kenya, Uganda, and Ethiopia.

Following a thorough review of secondary evidence, the analysis to identify key issues for further investigation led to multiple iterations with a number of key informant interviews and new conversations with previously unidentified partners. This qualitative data helped explain the emerging findings from the direct experience of the implementing partners. The process of collecting and compiling information resulted in over 50 calls with various key informants across the five selected countries between October and December 2020.

REGIONAL REFUGEE RESPONSE FRAMEWORKS

In December 2018, after two years of comprehensive consultations led by the UNHCR with Member States, international organizations, refugees, civil society, the private sector and experts, the United Nations General Assembly affirmed the Global Compact on Refugees. Recognizing that a permanent solution to refugee crises cannot be accomplished without international collaboration, the Global Compact on Refugees is a mechanism for more equitable and predictable responsibility-sharing. Its four key objectives are to: 1) ease

² UNESCO, revised recommendation concerning TVE (2015), https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000234137

the pressures on host countries; 2) enhance refugee self-reliance; 3) expand access to third-country solutions; and 4) support conditions in countries of origin for return in safety and dignity.

In December 2019, the Global Refugee Forum Education Co-Sponsorship Alliance prepared the Global Framework for Refugee Education for the first Global Refugee Forum in Geneva. The Framework aims to create conditions for refugee education stakeholders and initiatives to meet the commitments of the Global Compact on Refugees and the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), particular SDG4, which aims to "ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all" by 2030. The goal of the framework is to foster collaboration and approaches that lead to all refugee, asylum seeker, returnee, stateless and host community children and young people, including the internally displaced, to access inclusive and equitable quality education. Access to education can enable them to learn, thrive and develop their potential, build individual and collective resilience, contribute to peaceful coexistence and experience returns on livelihood stabilisation as well. The Framework complements UNHCR's Refugee Education 2030 strategy and served as a basis to mobilise and articulate education pledges, contributions and evidence-based good practice for presentation at the Global Refugee Forum (GRF).

Ultimately, 204 pledges were lodged on the theme of education at the GRF, including 30 listing education as one of multiple areas of focus. Pledges affirmed that access to secondary, tertiary and vocational opportunities serves as the link to labour opportunities and better livelihoods and shall be supported in all possible ways.

REGIONAL INITIATIVES FOR THE COUNTRIES COVERED

IGAD

The Intergovernmental Authority on Development (IGAD) is one of the eight Regional Economic Communities (RECs) regarded as building blocks or pillars of the African Union (AU). IGAD seeks to facilitate inter-State, regional and international cooperation in promoting social, economic, political and cultural development. IGAD consists of eight Member States in the Greater Horn of Africa, namely: Djibouti, Eritrea (membership suspended), Ethiopia, Kenya, Somalia, South Sudan, Sudan, and Uganda.

In 2012, IGAD was the first regional organisation to agree on a Regional Migration Policy Framework and a subsequent Migration Action Plan. The 2014 revised draft Treaty of IGAD underlines the importance of regional cooperation on human resources, science and technology. To this effect, it calls on its members to "undertake concerted measures to foster cooperation in human resources development, and greater utilization of human, technical know-how and institutional capabilities." In March 2017, IGAD adopted the Nairobi Declaration, which pledges to improve protection space and solutions, and to provide educational and economic opportunities for refugees and forcibly displaced people in the region. Not long after, IGAD Member States signed the Djibouti Declaration, addressing the need for a standardized approach to refugee education, including opportunities for tertiary education. In 2019, IGAD again signalled its engagement with refugee issues in the region, signing the Kampala Declaration, which aims to expand livelihood opportunities for refugees and host communities.

In addition, IGAD leads in one of only three areas in the world promoting a regional approach to implement the Global Compact on Refugees. With the adoption of the Protocol on Free Movement and Transhumance in February 2020, IGAD has also laid the foundation for regional integration.

The seven IGAD Member States present at the Global Refugee Forum collectively and individually pledged to continue with and expand their respective policies regarding the reception and admission of refugees.

GRF pledges submitted by IGAD countries.

COUNTRY	SELECTED PLEDGES
ETHIOPIA	Create up to 90,000 socioeconomic opportunities through agricultural and livestock value chains that benefit both refugees and host communities.
	Provide quality and accredited skills training to 20,000 host nationals and refugees on an equitable basis, considering the labour market demand and linkages with existing and new commitments in expanding socioeconomic opportunities.
KENYA	Strengthen support to refugee and host community education.
	Strengthen institutions that manage asylum, provide protection and deliver services in refugee-hosting areas.
SUDAN	Continue to maintain and implement an open-door policy for refugees.
	Create and enhance an enabling environment for the return of refugees and facilitate their reintegration.
	Integrate refugee education in national education systems in a gradual manner.
UGANDA	Include all refugee children in the national education system by implementing the Education Response Plan. Specifically, Uganda will immediately increase access to education for 579,000 refugee and host community students.
	Improve access to equitable health services for 1 million refugees and 7 million members of host communities through the Health Sector Integrated Refugee Response Plan (HSIRRP).

REGIONAL REFUGEE AND RESILIENCE PLAN IN RESPONSE TO THE SYRIAN REFUGEE CRISIS

The Regional Refugee and Resilience Plan (3RP)³ is a strategic, coordination, planning, advocacy, fundraising, and programming platform for humanitarian and development partners to respond to the Syria crisis. It comprises one regional plan, with five stand-alone country chapters covering Turkey, Lebanon, Jordan, Iraq and Egypt. In 2015, recognizing the unique challenges facing host countries and communities in so generously hosting Syrian refugees, the international community instituted a new, comprehensive approach, combining humanitarian and development responses to the Syria crisis into a single coherent plan in line with national plans and priorities, under the co-leadership of UNHCR and United Nations Development Programme (UNDP).

The 3RP has two interconnected components. The refugee component addresses the protection and humanitarian assistance needs of refugees, while the resilience component addresses the resilience, stabilization and development needs of impacted individuals, communities and institutions, aiming to strengthen the capacities of national actors. Other agencies, such as the ILO, GIZ or FCA, have developed their own programmes in line with the 3RP.

PROSPECTS

Partnership for improving prospects for forcibly displaced persons and host communities (PROSPECTS)" is a global partnership that aims to improve the access of host communities and forcibly displaced people to education, social protection and decent work. Spearheaded by the Government of the Netherlands, it brings together the International Finance Corporation (IFC), the International Labour Organization (ILO), the UN Refugee Agency (UNHCR), the UN Children's Fund (UNICEF) and the World Bank to help transform the way in which governments and other stakeholders, including the private sector, respond to forced displacement crises.

Prospects is currently being implemented in eight countries of the Middle East and North Africa (MENA) and the East and Horn of Africa regions. To know more visit <u>https://ilo.org/prospects</u>.

^{3 &}lt;u>3RP Syria Crisis – In Response to the Syria Crisis</u>



Young Syrian women in sewing training in Jordan $\ensuremath{\mathbb{C}}$ GIZ / Ghassan Sela



COUNTRY FINDINGS: JORDAN

JORDAN CONTEXT

REFUGEE ENVIRONMENT AND LEGAL FRAMEWORK

Jordan is one of the countries most affected by the Syrian crisis, hosting the second highest share of refugees per capita in the world. During 2020, the country was severely impacted by COVID-19. According to UNHCR, as of 31 December 2019, Jordan hosted about 747,000 people, nearly 654,700 of whom are Syrian refugees. In addition, Jordan hosts Palestinian, Iraqi, Somali and Sudanese refugees, as well as many labour migrants from Egypt and South Asia. The Government of Jordan views fleeing populations as guests, not as refugees. Consequently, the country is not obliged to recognize the rights guaranteed by the 1951 Refugee Convention unless other international treaties, such as the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, include these rights. In turn, refugees' well-being is dependent solely on the largesse of the host country and international agencies. This guest approach partly aims to prevent the integration of refugees and ensure their eventual return to their countries of origin. In February 2016, a new approach to dealing with protracted displacement was signed: the EU-Jordan Compact.⁴

GOVERNANCE STRUCTURE FOR TVET

Since 2019, the Technical and Vocational Skills Development Commission (TVSDC) has been responsible for TVET in Jordan, as a result of merging the E-TVET Fund and the Centre for Accreditation and Quality Control (CAQA). While the Ministry of Education is the ultimate steering authority for TVET in the country, TVSDC acts as the steering body for TVET in Jordan. TVSDC includes a council as a governance body chaired by the Minister of Labour. As a tripartite entity, the TVSDC Council has representatives from stakeholders including training institutions, chambers of commerce, associations, trade unions and employers. The division of the TVET mandate between the ministries of education and labour also includes a division of their respective responsibilities in design, delivery, financing, accreditation, certification, and quality assurance.

The Vocational Training Corporation, a semi-autonomous entity under the supervision of the Ministry of Labour, oversees 42 training centres. The Al-Balqa Applied University (BAU), supervises around 30 private and public community colleges in Jordan. These colleges offer two-year diploma programmes in many technical and vocational fields (technician level) that enable students who pass to progress onto bachelor's degrees. Both entities are responsible for non-formal and formal TVET at the secondary and post-secondary non-tertiary level. Private training providers also offer vocational training programmes, but there are very few private training providers in Jordan, and not all of them are certified by the TVSDC. The Ministry of Education with its 43 subdivisions is responsible for comprehensive secondary education TVET in Jordan. The Ministry of Higher Education and Scientific Research (MoHESR) oversees the BAU technical colleges and the tertiary education system, including TVET.⁵

^{4 &}lt;u>https://ec.europa.eu/neighbourhood-enlargement/sites/near/files/parternship_</u> priorities_2016-2018_and_their_annexed_eu-jordan_compact.pdf

^{5 &}lt;u>https://unevoc.unesco.org/wtdb/worldtvetdatabase_jor_en.pdf</u> and ILO. State of Skills Jordan, <u>wcms_754492.pdf</u> (ilo.org)

INCLUSION OF REFUGEES

Rights granted to Syrian refugees are under the Jordanian Labour Law as it applies to non-Jordanian workers. In 2016, Jordan began to facilitate Syrian refugees' access to the labour market. This milestone, achieved through the signing of the Jordan Compact, lifted some of the barriers to the legal and formal employment of refugees in the kingdom. This includes easing procedures, delinking the work permit from employer sponsorship and waiving the fees to obtain work permits in selected sectors, allowing Syrians residing in the camps access to jobs in host communities. In the light of these changes, Syrian refugees can work in the occupations open to non-Jordanians and can register and operate a business. However, many sectors of work are closed, including health, teaching, engineering, and technical professions. As part of the Jordan Compact, the Programme for Results: Economic Opportunities for Jordanians and Syrian Refugees was designed by the World Bank and the Government of Jordan, in close cooperation with the <u>ILO</u>, <u>UNHCR</u> and other development partners involved in Jordan.

Since 2016, this programme for results has supported Syrian refugees' formal access to the Jordanian labour market, enabling them to be self-reliant and contributors to the Jordanian economy. In June 2020, this \$300 million four-year programme benefited from a two-year extension and additional financing of \$100 million. This extension will support the Government of Jordan in providing Syrian refugees with more flexible work permits to reduce potentially exploitative informal labor market structures and ensure they are protected under the labour law. Only a third of Syrian workers hold a work permit and between 4 and 8 percent benefit from social security coverage. Moreover, work permits for Syrians are issued when they renew their ID cards or where they work through mobile work permit stations organized with the support of ILO. Outreach through UNHCR and ILO remains key, including through the two active employment centres in the refugee camps of Zaatari and Azraq and the 11 employment centres outside the camps.

Government quotas for livelihood programmes restrict access to TVET among refugees. According to government rules, livelihood programmes are restricted to 30 percent refugees and 70 percent Jordanians (for education and protection it is 50/50). For NGOs, the quota of refugees in programmes depends on donors. There has been little analysis of the current TVET opportunities and outcomes for Syrian refugees in Jordan and no available data about enrolment rates of Syrian refugees in Jordan. With regard to gender, the <u>E-TVET</u> <u>strategy (2014-2020)</u> of the government seeks to enhance the inclusion of vulnerable groups, especially of Jordanian and refugee women, by encouraging them to work in nontraditional occupations and by preparing gender-sensitive curricula and training programmes through, for instance, class groups exclusively open to women. Despite a number of notable exceptions, some of which are presented in this chapter, the current service provision for refugee youth is mostly oriented towards project-based interventions by NGOs that provide access to non-formal vocational training opportunities.

MARKET STRUCTURE

The issue of refugees' legal right to participate in the Jordanian labour market has been one of the most contentious policy issues not only for the Jordanian Government but also for its relations with Jordanian citizens, refugees and donors, as it intersects with the country's demographic dynamics, economy development vision, and relations with external actors.

From the perspective of international donors, ensuring Syrian refugees' legal access to the labour market in the immediate host country in Jordan is the most effective way of keeping refugees in their region of origin. The general perception about their inclusion relates to competition for already scarce job opportunities in closed sectors. For Syrians, access to a diversified labour market is a way of gaining sustainable livelihood opportunities, self-reliance, and dignity. The Jordanian labour market is very fragmented. Great numbers of Jordanians work in a large public sector and the armed forces.⁶ Non-Jordanians, including Palestinian and Iraqi refugees as well as Asian and Egyptian migrant workers, dominate in the private sector.

Jordan also has a substantial informal economy with low and declining wages, long working hours, and poor working conditions and regulations.⁷ The overall TVET provision in Jordan is insufficiently prepared for an effective collaboration with the labour market and employers, given the weak coordination and collaboration between TVET and the private sector. This results in graduates who do not necessarily have the right skills for their profession, and is reflected in the low responsiveness of TVET curricula to local labour markets, leading to a skills mismatch between TVET qualifications and the needs of the labour market. In many cases, those interviewed have stated that TVET programmes provided by government institutions are often misaligned with the demand and skills required to best match the requirements of the labour market.

Laws governing what sector Syrians can work in continually change and Syrians working in what is a formal job one day, may find it is illegal the next day because of a change in the law. Skills gaps, labour market regulations and structural issues such as wages, working hours and transport all contribute to the difficulty Syrians may have in accessing market structures. UNHCR and ILO, among others, are working on these issues to search for solutions in providing better livelihood and security.

COVID-19 AND ITS IMPACT ON TVET PROGRAMMES

Since January 2020, the Government of Jordan has taken strict measures to prevent the spread of COVID-19. This included movement restrictions in refugee camps from mid-March, with access limited only to essential staff. By July 2020, most restrictions no longer held but

6 <u>https://arabdevelopmentportal.com/publication/employment-and-labor-law-arab-mediterranean-countries-and-euroromediterranean</u>

⁷ http://turkishpolicy.com/files/articlepdf/syrian-refugees-status-in-the-jordanian-labor-market_en_9210.pdf

precautionary measures remained in place and were enhanced.⁸ Since the beginning of the pandemic, refugees in Jordan (both in urban areas and in camps) have been included in the National Health Response Plan and are able to access national health services on par with Jordanian nationals, including referral of suspect cases to quarantine sites and requisite treatment.

UNHCR Jordan is supporting the Ministry of Education in the provision of distance/online learning for students and working closely with educational providers and partners across Jordan in developing the technology and modalities to facilitate access to e-learning and support refugee and Jordanian students in continuing their studies from home. The Ministry of Higher Education and the Ministry of Labour have initiated several policies and provided guidelines, and have started the development of a portal for virtual training. Teachers received online training courses on how to use MS Teams, Google classrooms and other facilities for their online training sessions.⁹ Electricity provision was enhanced in most camps and accommodated remote education access. UNHCR also supported students by providing internet bundles and e-wallet services to enable them to attend remote sessions and career readiness courses.

- 8 https://reliefweb.int/report/jordan/unhcr-jordan-covid-19-response-and-preparedness-september-2020
- 9 https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_emp/---ifp_skills/documents/publication/wcms_754935.pdf



Bidibidi refugee settlement © Finn Church Aid / Erik Nyström

TVET PROGRAMMES AND ACTORS IN JORDAN

FEATURED ACTORS AND PROGRAMMES: RECOGNITION OF PRIOR LEARNING (RPL)

AGENCY	ILO
FUNDER	US Department of State's Bureau of Population, Refugees, and Migration (PRM)
TIMELINE	30 September 2018 — 30 September 2019
TARGET	13,550 workers (10,795 Syrians and 2,755 Jordanians)

INTRODUCTION

Through the <u>Recognition of Prior Learning (RPL) programme</u> by ILO, both refugees and workers from the host community receive certified training and access to formal work permits so they can enter the formal economy, including access to skills and vocational training opportunities. The project supported 13,550 workers (10,795 Syrians and 2,755 Jordanians) to access formal employment and decent work in the sectors of construction, confectionery, and garment. The main actions of the programme are: 1) supporting Syrian refugees in obtaining work permits; 2) supporting job seekers in enhancing their skills or certifying existing skills through training and recognition of prior learning in the sectors of construction, confectionary and garment, and 3) addressing gender disparity in labour force participation.

The RPL scheme includes a four-day theoretical training course to participants (Syrians and Jordanians) provided by a local institution recognized by the (former) Centre of Accreditation and Quality Assurance (CAQA) and provides access to a formal recognition, allowing for the legalization of the worker's status (ILO, 2018). By allowing refugees to obtain skills certificates and formal work permits, in addition to training on occupational safety and health, refugees and host community members are more likely to enhance their self-reliance and have access to formal and decent work.

MARKET ORIENTATION

The project has already trained and certified 5,000 Jordanian and Syrian refugee job seekers using RPL methodology in the construction sector. In this phase of the project, RPL models apply to seven new occupations in the construction and manufacturing sectors. Preferential trade access for firms that employ Syrians, and a World Bank programme using disbursement-linked indicators, incentivized the government to issue work permits for refugees in agriculture and construction outside of the '*kafala*' system (which prevents workers from leaving a job without the employer's permission).

SUPPORT SERVICES

A new web-based employment platform in Jordan was established through this programme to enable Jordanian and Syrian job seekers and workers, as well as employers in Jordan, to access labour market information, job and training opportunities, career guidance and other support to enhance their businesses and livelihoods. This means that Employment Service Centres have gone digital with the newly-developed, web-based E-Counselling system (with 5,503 job seekers and 92 companies registered in December 2020 and a total of 840 job vacancies available).

ACCREDITATION

TVET participants receive a certification, which provides access to a formal recognition, the occupational licence, allowing for the legalization of the worker's status and hence a work permit.

TEACHERS' QUALIFICATIONS

Teachers' qualifications have been expanded through work safety training and teachers were helped to create an updated competency-based curriculum, new test questions and practical tests. With regard to supporting Syrian refugees in accessing work permits in targeted sectors, teachers were trained online in counselling services and usage of new technologies. To date, two Training of Trainers (ToT) workshops for RPL instructors and assessors have been conducted.

LIFE/CORE SKILLS

The RPL scheme includes a four-day theoretical training course provided by a recognized local institution over four weeks on weekend days, to minimize participants' opportunity costs of foregoing income. It covers trade-specific content, occupational safety and health and basic labour rights. In addition, four-day mentoring and coaching visits by a certified trainer provide the beneficiary with technical feedback on his\her work performance at the workplace.

TECHNOLOGY, INNOVATION AND NEW SECTORS

The ILO designed a web page for registration. The weak accreditation and licencing system was tackled through providing intensive capacity-building to the former CAQA, including developing and piloting the assessment procedures jointly. Training providers received training on RPL and other technical support, including the development of training materials and assessment tools to respond to certification requirements.

GENDER EQUALITY

Overall, 45 percent of beneficiaries were women. Construction sector occupations targeted through RPL, however, are either limited to male workers by law, or engage only a few female workers in practice. Advocacy to open construction sector occupations to women is expected to lead to regulatory change.

BRIDGING TO THE LABOUR MARKET

The project has provided a clear and efficient pathway to formalise, develop and accredit skills for workers of both communities, and improved access to decent work. It has also helped Syrians to obtain work permits, formalising their employment in the country. In addition, preferential trade access for firms that employ Syrians and a World Bank programme incentivized the government to issue work permits for refugees in agriculture and construction outside of the '*kafala*' system (where workers cannot leave a job without the employer's permission), hence reducing the risk of exploitative forms of work.

FEATURED ACTORS AND PROGRAMMES: LUMINUS

AGENCY	Luminus
FUNDER	Various
TIMELINE	Ongoing programmes with no end date
TARGET	Depends on length and choice of TVET programme and partner support

INTRODUCTION

Luminus Technical University College (Luminus/LTUC) is a private institution belonging to Luminus Education Group which supports refugee youth. It receives funds to launch scholarship programmes so that young people can enrol free of charge and receive the same services as fee-paying students, regardless of nationality, including career counselling and coaching. Due to the restrictions on employment for refugees in the Jordanian labour market, Luminus provides counselling and guidance about the programmes that would lead to legal employment in Jordan. They also support refugees who seek labour mobility. For example, as there is a high demand for nurses in Germany, LTUC is investigating the option of providing German language classes.

Although Luminus is private sector, it has an outcomes-based delivery model, supported at financial and programmatic level by the international development community. For example, at the beginning of 2020, UNHCR launched a 10-month TVET diploma scholarship programme for 58 students (50 percent refugees) in cooperation with Luminus Technical University College. Focusing on vocational training, it is the first time that UNHCR has supported both the local population and refugees – of all nationalities – in accessing a higher education diploma through a provider like Luminus.

MARKET ORIENTATION

Luminus has focused on TVET for the Arab region since 1999 and embarked on a mission to change the perception of TVET in Jordan by providing high-quality, market-oriented programmes for all, including the most vulnerable and refugees aged 16 and above, regardless of prior qualifications. Luminus provides an end-to-end solution from education to employment. The programmes are directly linked to the labour market's needs. Areas of specialisation include business; advanced computing; construction and engineering; hospitality; arts and creative media; hair and beauty; and healthcare. To ensure that learning is linked to employment, Luminus partners with educational institutes and private firms across Jordan. For example, their partner in the creative media and arts programme is SAE International, a global digital media arts college with 57 campuses.

Another example is the tripartite agreement between Luminus, the Jordanian Government and UNICEF which is supporting 1000 young people through coding and TVET qualifications. The key pillar of this initiative is to build the capacity of a sector the government has identified as of strategic importance but where the private sector reports a lack of suitable skills.

SUPPORT SERVICES

Luminus aims to support access to employment based on their partnerships with companies, the students' prior qualifications and experience, relevant education programmes they provide, and the results of the career counselling offered to students. Research is conducted to capture outcomes of their programmes, including tracking the progress of graduates.

ACCREDITATION

The curriculum is regularly updated in line with market needs. For instance, Code Fellows, Luminus' partner for coding boot camp programmes, provides biweekly updates to the curriculum to ensure graduates are ready to work in this fast-changing sector. In terms of accreditation, Luminus is accredited locally by the Ministry of Higher Education and Ministry of Labour in Jordan, and internationally by Pearson and other sector-appropriate actors.

TEACHERS' QUALIFICATIONS

Teachers are qualified through higher education studies in the field of expertise offered for each occupation. They undertake regular assessments, receive the opportunity to enrol in continuous training courses and undergo regular skills training in emerging technologies, didactics, and pedagogies. Most teachers have industry experience as well as their subject matter qualifications and undertake teacher training and continuous professional development throughout their tenure at Luminus to ensure they are able to implement the latest tools, techniques and technology.

LIFE/CORE SKILLS

Each Luminus programme offers various life and core skills to its graduates, such as study skills, communication, conflict management, marketing and IT skills, as well as design thinking and up-to-date e-training methods. Towards the end of their programme, students undertake a career readiness course to prepare them for their job search and the workplace.

TECHNOLOGY, INNOVATION AND NEW SECTORS

Luminus also hosts McDonald's Academy, which is a joint venture with McDonald's in Jordan where students learn the business operations of the quick service sector and so can become supervisors on graduation, in Jordan and across the region. Other industry partners include Coding Academy in Seattle for Advanced Computing, Bosch in Germany for automotive technology, Haaga Helia Applied University for Hospitality and L'Oréal for hair and beauty. In anticipation of labour market demands, Luminus has increased its focus on digital skills training. It has established an Advanced Computing School, as well as the Creative Media School, to teach programmes such as coding, cybersecurity, artificial intelligence (Al), data science, digital marketing, and game design. Luminus is now working on scaling up this model, including extending support to refugee communities via coding boot camps in Gaza.

GENDER EQUALITY

Female enrolment was initially a concern. When the hospitality school began, the enrolment was less than 5 percent female and, following a survey, Luminus identified transport as a barrier to female participation. Providing secure, safe transport, together with other changes such as flexible and blended learning options, has meant that in less than 5 years female participation has risen to nearly 45 percent of the total student population. There are still challenges preventing women from entering the labour market but Luminus is working with employers and the government to address these too.

BRIDGING TO THE LABOUR MARKET

A key priority of Luminus is employment for graduates. All students enrolled in Luminus programmes have access to internships. For students on scholarships, there is a guarantee that 80 percent of participants will get jobs. However, there is no data available to indicate whether this percentage is met. Participants benefit from three months of employment post-graduation and over 70 percent of participants reported an expected positive employment outcome for longer periods. No data is available to demonstrate the concrete employment outcome beyond this three-month period. It is worth mentioning that under Luminus' 10-month TVET training diploma programme, Luminus links the majority of trainees to legal advice from UNHCR and the Employment department at Luminus. Currently, Luminus is developing an additional module for their integrated management information system, which will automate employment tracking, and provide data for assessing the longer-term impact of programmes.

FEATURED ACTORS AND PROGRAMMES: EMPLOYMENT-ORIENTED VOCATIONAL TRAINING IN SKILLED CRAFTS IMPLEMENTED BY GIZ

AGENCY	GIZ
FUNDER	BMZ
TIMELINE	October 2017 — September 2024
TARGET	3,400 young people of which 20 percent women and 50 percent refugees

INTRODUCTION

GIZ supports Jordanian citizens and Syrian refugees via various programmes funded by BMZ and the EU. One example is the <u>Employment Oriented Vocational Training for Skilled</u> <u>Crafts programme</u> which aims to: 1) improve the quality of TVET in selected skilled crafts professions, 2) ensure training opportunities are more accessible to young people including refugees and, 3) provide career guidance and counselling services to support them in their transition from training to employment. The targeted and tailored support to each individual makes these programmes successful with a high employment rate. The project aims to enable young people and young adults from vulnerable Jordanian target groups, as well as Syrian refugees, to increase their employment opportunities in skilled crafts professions. The project's implementation takes place in various regions and covers different skilled crafts occupations as defined by the project in consultation with the Jordanian partner.

The close partnership with German skilled crafts organizations and businesses is a core element of the project. The German Confederation of Skilled Crafts (Zentralverband des Deutschen Handwerks, ZDH) provides the interface between the project and skilled crafts organizations in Germany. It supports the project in establishing cooperation arrangements and advises the quality development of vocational training courses in the supported skilled crafts occupations. The development and implementation of vocational training modules in various locations take place in cooperation with the partnering organizations. The Jordanian Ministry of Labour is the project's political partner. Other stakeholders include selected public and private vocational training providers, NGOs, chambers and associations seeking to improve information, counselling and qualification services, as well as the involvement of the private sector in the field of vocational training.

MARKET ORIENTATION

Given the focus on TVET and the skilled crafts sector, the project has a clear market orientation component. A labour market study was conducted to identify the key sectors of intervention. A recent tracer study conducted in 2019, aimed at assessing employment conditions of TVET participants, identified that occupations with high employment prospects are those in electricity (industrial electrics and domestic electrics), hairdressing, ventilation, and air conditioning, as well as barbershop assistants. Based on an assessment study conducted to assess the impact of GIZ's efforts in the skilled crafts sector, 95 percent of graduates (from a total of 1,237 graduates) surveyed found these skills compatible with the Jordanian labour market. Among the barriers identified were the gap between theory and practice and the lack of technical pre-requisite given the short duration of some courses.

SUPPORT SERVICES

Based on a tracer study from 2019 with a sample of 681 students, the reasons that prevented respondents from enrolling in vocational training centres included a lack of finance (61 percent), transportation (50 percent), lack of knowledge about vocational training institutes, and lack of minimum qualification for accessing the system. Support services were therefore integrated, including a nationwide media campaign to improve the image of TVET, and career guidance and counselling services to support learners in bridging to the labour market.

ACCREDITATION

GIZ supports the Technical and Vocational Skills Development Commission in accreditation and certification processes.

TEACHERS' QUALIFICATIONS

As part of the GIZ capacity development strategy, training of trainers is offered on different modules.

LIFE/CORE SKILLS

The findings of a tracer study from 2019 show that due to the project and the vocational training courses that were offered, young people have improved their employment-related competences. This was done through career guidance and counselling (CGC) services, e. g. career planning and trainings in soft skills. GIZ report that a total of 95 percent of 1,237 surveyed students confirmed that vocational training, career guidance and counselling help them in finding employment, according to the most recent figures.

TECHNOLOGY, INNOVATION AND NEW SECTORS

Jordan can benefit from Germany's experience in the skilled crafts sector. Their widely recognised practical and theoretical knowledge makes partnering with the German Confederation of Skilled Crafts (ZDH) a core element of the project. Three German skilled crafts organizations are supporting partners through various capacity development activities (e.g., training of trainers and curricula development) and further training for institutions to improve the quality of training and enhance cooperation between public and private sector institutions in this field.

GENDER EQUALITY

In almost all module indicators of the project it is stated that at least 20 percent of the beneficiaries should be women and 50 percent of them refugees. They should use the supported information and counselling services to better transition to vocational training and the labour market, make use of the supported training measures, and increase their personal employment opportunities aiming to find employment in a relevant field of work six months after completion.

BRIDGING TO THE LABOUR MARKET

High shares of beneficiaries (86 people / 42 percent of employed beneficiaries) had been working for more than six months at the time they were interviewed. Considering the challenging situation in the Jordanian labour market this is regarded as a positive result. 26.2 percent of the employed beneficiaries were working for between four and six months, 12.1% were working for between one and two months and 7.8 percent were working for up to a month.

CONCLUSIONS

EMERGING PRACTICES

- **TVET** providers need a thorough understanding of participants' living conditions and care responsibilities to ensure retention: a <u>study by UNHCR found that</u> refugees consider transport, stipends, accreditation and duration of the training as the most relevant factors to enrol in training. For women refugees, childcare facilities and proximity rank among the most important factors enabling participation.
- Programming TVET requires an assessment of labour market demands and employment preferences: alignment between supply and demand preferences ensures that workers benefit from relevant expertise and also find professional fulfilment. It is critical to enable an adequate match between demand and supply while also considering the gender perspective. For example, in the programme implemented by GIZ illustrated earlier, market demands and employment preferences are assessed at the beginning of the programme and tracked through tracer studies.

NATIONAL RECOMMENDATIONS

- **Favour digital skills among refugees to unlock economic opportunities.** Several NGOs and bilateral agencies found that digital skills training has better outcomes in terms of employment outcomes for refugees, but there are limited training opportunities in digital skills. The tech sector, an important driver of economic development in Jordan, can open new sectors for refugees and potentially change the TVET landscape. World Bank's investment of US\$200 million to increase access to jobs for Jordanian young people and expand government digital services will certainly accelerate interest and further investment in this sector.¹⁰
- Improve curricula of public TVET institutes through stronger focus on soft skills and practical training. Employers express concern that public TVET provision does not sufficiently focus on soft skills and practical training. Agencies that addressed this (GIZ, Luminus etc.) were perceived as more successful.
- Explore private public partnerships (PPP) to improve the quality of TVET equipment and instructors. The Vocational Training Corporation tends to suffer from poorly qualified trainers with relatively low wages, and there is no investment in equipment. PPPs offer more successful models of vocational training whereby companies fund equipment for training centres (for welding, carpentry, etc.) and provide training for trainers. This model can yield better outcomes than purely government-run centres. The Amman Chamber of Commerce, for example, will take over four centres under this PPP model.

10 World Bank, 2020

- Ensure that the TVET system provides skills recognition services for skills in demand. At the start of the Syrian refugee crisis, restrictive labour laws prevented refugees from fully accessing the labour market. Over recent years, new types of work permits became available to refugees. Initiatives such as the <u>Recognition of Prior Learning (RPL) programme</u> build on skills, experience and prior learning of refugees and host communities, and improve transitions to formal employment. These initiatives should expand to more sectors.
- Strengthen inclusion of refugees in national TVET programmes. Current service provision for refugee youth is dominated by NGO project-based interventions that provide access to non-formal vocational training opportunities. The current vocational training taskforce in place should strengthen coordination between NGOs, INGOs and local providers, and reinforce advocacy for the inclusion of refugees in national TVET programmes.
- **Promote more and better employment opportunities for refugees**. Informal employment remains an important feature among refugees. The majority of jobs open to Syrian refugees, in and out of camps, only pay the minimum wage as they are in low-skilled sectors. This reduces mobility and formal job trajectories; it also exposes refugees to protection risks and may increase tensions between refugees and host communities. ILO, in partnership with other organizations, has addressed this issue through targeted interventions to set up incentives for both employers and employees towards formalization and social protection schemes.
- Improve TVET administrative data and employment outcome tracking of graduates. As stated above, there is no administrative data on enrolments of refugees in formal TVET programmes at national level. More evidence to better analyse the effects and impact of TVET programmes for refugees at the medium and long-term level also remains necessary. This can be achieved thorough regular and representative tracer studies, ex-post evaluations or randomized surveys on job trajectories.

SUMMARY TABLE

SUMMARY

In Jordan the challenges that exclude refugees from TVET are similar to those that discourage the enrolment of the native population, namely the quality of TVET, its lack of connection to the labour market, and negative perceptions of the sector. At the start of the Syrian refugee crisis, restrictive labour laws prevented refugees from fully accessing the labour market. This has changed in recent years. Syrians can now access more open sectors such as agriculture, construction, manufacturing, retail and food services.
ACTOR 1 KEY CONTRIBUTIONS

The ILO-funded initiative dealing with recognition of prior learning (**RPL**) ensured:

- Both refugees and the host community receive certified training complementing skills they already possess.
- They access skills recognition services for skills in demand leading to occupational licenses.
- Refugees have access to formal work permits to enter the formal economy.

ACTOR 2 KEY CONTRIBUTIONS

Luminus Technical

<u>University</u> with its College TVET diploma scholarship programme focusing on vocational training (from 3 to 12 months) allowed for:

- Refugees enroll free of charge and receive the same services as fee-paying students.
- The integration of career counselling and coaching services regardless of nationality.

ACTOR 3 KEY CONTRIBUTIONS

GIZ <u>Employment</u> <u>Oriented Vocational</u> <u>Training for Skilled Crafts</u> <u>programme funded</u> <u>by BMZ</u> is enabling:

- Training in skilled crafts professions that are in high demand.
- Information and advisory services for over 1,000 participants, including refugees.
- Bridging to the labour market: 42 percent of all employed beneficiaries were working for more than six months according to a recent assessment.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The main areas of recommendations at the national level emerging from the analysis relate to:

- 1. favouring digital skills among refugees.
- 2. aligning curriculum of public TVET institutes with market demands.
- **3.** exploring private public partnership to improve the quality of TVET equipment and instructors.
- 4. ensuring that the TVET system provides skills recognition services for skills in demand.
- 5. reinforcing the inclusion of refugees in TVET programmes.
- 6. promoting more, and better employment opportunities for refugees.
- 7. improving TVET administrative data and employment outcome tracking of graduates.

MOST RELEVANT EMERGING PRACTICE

The programme providing an adequate match between demand and supply, while also considering the gender perspective, led to the most results verified through tracer studies.



Howaida, a refugee from Sudan, works at the UNHCR supported MADE51 project in Cairo © UNHCR / Pedro Costa Gomes

COUNTRY FINDINGS: SUDAN

SUDAN CONTEXT

REFUGEE ENVIRONMENT AND LEGAL FRAMEWORK

Sudan has a long history of hosting refugees and asylum seekers. Refugees from countries including the Central African Republic, Chad, the Democratic Republic of Congo, Eritrea, Ethiopia, Somalia, South Sudan, Syria and Yemen, have arrived in search of safety from violence, persecution and other hazards in their countries of origin. The country maintains a generous open border policy, hosting both protracted and newly displaced populations. It has the fourth largest refugee population in the world, counting 26 refugees per 1,000 inhabitants. 70 percent of Sudan's refugee population lives outside of camps. South Sudanese refugees benefit from the government's extension of certain freedoms, like the freedom to work and to move, which remain limited for other refugees. There are also around 2.55 million internally displaced persons in the country, as well as stateless, Sudanese refugee returnees and IDP returnees.

Localities hosting refugees are categorized into a severity ranking from very low to very high needs based on a projection of the refugee population for December 2021 and sectoral assessment data.¹¹ Refugee camps, the newly established refugee sites in Gedaref and Kassala, reception points and parts of the Khartoum Open Areas are categorized as having severe needs; needs are very high in camp-like settlements and in urban areas, and high in protracted situations in and off camps. Eastern Sudan, one of the poorest and most underdeveloped regions in the country, is categorized along with Central Darfur camp locations as having high needs. The causes of the ten-year armed conflict in eastern Sudan were only partially resolved by the 2006 Peace Agreement, so peace remains fragile. In early 2020, the Refugee Consultation Forum, co-chaired between UNHCR and the Commission for Refugees, launched the first comprehensive Country Refugee Response Plan (CRRP) covering the needs of the whole refugee population in Sudan, which includes South Sudanese refugees, Chadian refugees, Central African Republic refugees, refugees living in urban settings and refugees living in East Sudan. A COVID-19 addendum was made to the plan, and a revised CRRP was released in 2021. An escalating conflict in Ethiopia's Tigray region led to a high influx of refugees fleeing to neighbouring Sudan. Next to the overarching refugee plan mentioned above, the Regional Refugee Preparedness and Response Plan for the Ethiopia Situation (Tigray) covers the period from November 2020 to June 2021 and will reach up to 115,000 refugees and 22,000 people from host communities. It aims to maintain and facilitate access to asylum and provide life-saving assistance to those who have been forced to flee.

¹¹ Sudan Country Refugee Response Plan January – December 2021



Figure X. Sudan: UNHCR Operational Reference Map (06 September 2021).¹²

12 Source: UNHCR Operational Data Portal <u>https://data2.unhcr.org/en/documents/details/88708</u>

GOVERNANCE STRUCTURE FOR TVET

TVET falls under the responsibility of two different ministries: the Supreme Council of Vocational Training and Apprenticeships (SCVTA) under the Ministry of Labour and Administrative Reform (MOLAR) is in charge of vocational training centres across the country, and the National Council for Technical & Technological Education (NCTTE) is under the Ministry of Higher Education and Scientific Research. Technical schools are under the Ministry of Education and this track leads to both diploma and bachelor's tertiary qualifications.¹³ Craft schools also fall under the Ministry of Education but do not include a tertiary level track.

The Vocational Training and Apprenticeship Act (2001)¹⁴ introduced the establishment of a tripartite coordination committee, which includes the SCVTA, the NCTTE, and employers' and workers' organizations, to oversee TVET strategy implementation, coordinate among stakeholders, develop a National Qualifications Framework (NQF), and build capacities of TVET providers. The NCTTE initially assumed this coordination role, resulting in the SCVTA's refusal to join the council and ensuing tensions between the NCTTE, Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Higher Education, which assumed a supervisory role over the NCTTE. While suggestions to resolve the deadlock exist, no concrete solution has yet been implemented.

The Sudanese federal system splits the responsibility for education, including TVET, between the federal and state levels. While unified curricula and examinations are determined at national level (by the two councils, SCVTA and NCTTE), ministries of education at the state level run TVET schools and are responsible for generating and mobilizing resources from state revenues, in addition to an annual federal support budget. This is seen as a mechanism for focusing on local development priorities. However, the effectiveness of these decentralization mechanisms is highly questionable, in particular in the light of the lack of appropriate funding at state level (UNESCO, 2016). Many schools and centres are closed, destroyed or non-functional due to years of conflict. Although technical education is a fully-fledged part of secondary education in the country, the total enrolment is 31,000 representing about 3 percent of the total enrolment in secondary education. The small size of technical education has hampered the formal development of polices that intend to expand access to these forms of education. What is more, technical education is witnessing negative growth (about -2 percent annually) (TVET strategy Paper, MoE). Vocational training is offered in the form of three-year apprenticeship programmes, provided by public VTCs under the SCVTA. These VTCs also offer short courses, upgrading and skills testing. Privately run VTCs also offer a number of training programmes often with a focus on

¹³ The Sudanese vocational training system received its definition by the <u>Apprenticeship and</u> <u>Vocational Training Act (1974)</u>. Then, a series of acts of decentralization in 1994 enacted in 1998 introduced the federal government system. Under the new Constitution and Acts, the <u>Vocational Training and Apprenticeship Act (2001)</u> replaced the previous one.

¹⁴ According to the <u>Vocational Training and Apprenticeship Act (2001</u>), vocational training means "the systematic training that aims at providing the necessary skills, knowledge and attitudes required for productive employment in any fields of economic activity. It includes initial training, up-grading training, and retraining provided in any enterprises, public institutions, or vocational training centres established by the government or a public enterprise or the private sector".

short duration courses and relaxed entry requirements. Responsibility to provide on-the-job training and apprenticeships defined by the <u>Guideline for Apprenticeship System</u> of SCVTA aims to ensure the appropriate management of apprentices to match market demands. The formal TVET system is designed for those who are enrolled in secondary school or who have left the formal education system, and as such, there are significant barriers to the majority of the population, and refugees and IDPs in particular, many of whom have not completed secondary education or are forced to earn a living in the informal economy.

The most widespread mode of training is informal apprenticeships. According to ILO estimates almost 80 percent of master craftspeople and skilled workers obtain their skills through informal apprenticeships (ILO, 2021). These are governed by social norms rather than contractual agreements, are of unspecified duration and they neither follow recognized curricula nor apply occupational safety and health measures. For many refugees and vulnerable host communities in remote areas, where there are no formal VTCs, informal apprenticeships provide the only training opportunities available.

Larger private companies offer training courses to host community members and to refugees in their own Vocational Training Centres as a way to accelerate their own recruitment procedures. Examples include Spark VTCs, DAL group, Sayga training centre for bakery, and CTC group LG Academy. Training happens on a day-to-day basis either through on-the-job or off-the-job training, for company employees and apprentices from the host community and refugees. This vocational training may fill gaps in provision from public and other conventional providers, yet available opportunities are largely insufficient. Since companies determine their own admission criteria, these courses are in principle available for refugees and host communities.

Sudan's vocational training also faces various challenges, such as insufficient public budget due to austerity measures, enrolment growth in higher education which limits the budget available for TVET, supply-driven training courses, lack of adequately skilled trainers, outdated curriculum and inadequate and insufficient infrastructure. The orientation of vocational training in accordance with the needs of the labour market falls under the responsibility of the vocational training centres. VTCs are expected to coordinate with the private sector and prepare strategic plans to meet the labour market needs and expand training services to refugees,(with the support of the international community. Despite the existence of structures for a collaboration mechanism under the formal apprenticeship scheme, VTCs lack resources to implement it, and numbers of enrolled apprentices are very small (UNESCO 2016).

Four priority areas for TVET reform are defined in the **Sudan TVET Policy** (2013):

- Pillar 1: Enhance governance and equity.
- Pillar 2: Improve the responsiveness of TVET to the labour market.
- Pillar 3: Strengthen the role of social partners.
- Pillar 4: Upgrade the quality of delivery in TVET establishments.

TVET reforms are considered to largely depend on donor funding. The sector has been receiving recent support from several donors and international organizations. With support from Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) and UNESCO, the government is preparing a new TVET strategy that aims, among other things, to enable SCVTA and state government to define the strategies for VTC management and updating training standards. The ILO, United Nations Industrial Development Organisation (UNIDO), UNESCO, JICA, GIZ and other international development partners have been advocating the importance of TVET and conducting research about the skills development system in Sudan.¹⁵ The *Handbook of Vocational Training System in Sudan* has been recently published by the SCVTA.¹⁶ Other advancements include the establishment of the Institute of Training of Trainers and Supervisors (ITTS), the Sudanese-Turkish Vocational and Technical Trainers Education Centre, and UNESCO's support for the preparation of Sudan's unified National Qualification Framework, and the development of a new TVET strategy.

INCLUSION OF REFUGEES

The Government of Sudan made nine pledges at the Global Refugee Forum in 2019, including in the area of self-reliance/access to work and education. The government pledged, for instance, to gradually integrate refugee education into the national education system, to adopt a self-reliance policy for host communities and refugees, to facilitate movement and work for refugees, and to maintain the open-door policy for persons fleeing conflict and persecution whilst supporting durable solutions for refugees and IDPs.

Lessons from previous interventions on the ground underlined that targeting and reaching out to individual refugees or displaced populations without the close involvement of the host community has limited impact in achieving social cohesion and peaceful coexistence between all communities. Hence, an area-based approach is key, striking a balance between assistance given to refugee and host communities.

Advocacy has been ongoing by several international organizations, and efforts continue to convince authorities in Sudan to include refugees in the national education system and to allow refugees freedom of movement and access work permits during their stay in Sudan.

The Ministry of Education responded to the request for inclusion of refugees in the national system and its commitment to the Djibouti Plan of Action on Education by establishing a refugee education strategy which included TVET for all refugees, IDPs, returnees, stateless and host communities and aimed at:

1. Preparing skilled technical labour capable of contributing in the fields of industrial, agricultural and service production to achieve development goals and keep pace with technological development to increase production.

¹⁵ ILO and UNDP "Skills Development in Sudan" (2013) and <u>A Tracer Study of Technical and Vocational Education and Training Institute Graduates in Khartoum State (ilo.org)</u> (2016); ILO and UNDP "Report of the Empirical Research on Informal Apprenticeship for the Darfur States" (2014).

¹⁶ https://unevoc.unesco.org/up/HANDBOOK_OF_VOCATIONAL_TRAINING_SYSTEM_IN_SUDAN.pdf

- **2.** Developing abilities, upgrading skills, encouraging creativity and innovation, gaining scientific knowledge, and curriculum research.
- **3.** Providing learners with the skills and abilities that enable them to reach technical and scientific levels that meet the need for work and production and train them in the economics of work and behavioural habits related to the profession in order to achieve the highest production at the lowest cost and shortest time.
- **4.** Providing educational opportunities and adapting the scientific and technological knowledge base to allow the student to move easily from one educational stage to another.

Access to work for non-Sudanese people is governed by the 2001 Act on the Employment of Non-Sudanese, which stipulates the need for a work permit as a prerequisite for employment. Refugees' obtention of work permits has been a challenge due to complex processes, high fees, and the encampment policy applicable to some refugees. Following intense discussion with the Ministry of Labour, in early 2020 a steering committee decreed by the Governor of Khartoum proposed a simplified procedure for refugees to obtain work permits. Work permits are now available for refugees and UNHCR and the Commission for Refugees (COR),¹⁷ which provide support and facilitate access to work permits. The Ministry of Labour opened a special window in the Khartoum labour office to process work permits for refugees. As a result, some 1,780 refugees managed to obtain a work permit. Most refugees in different parts of the country, however, continue to work in the informal sector, mainly in agriculture, construction, cleaning and housekeeping.

MARKET STRUCTURE

Sudan's labour market remains highly informal. According to the African Development Bank, Sudan is among the six least resilient economies in Africa and has also been hit hard by the effects of the COVID-19 pandemic. Real GDP was estimated to have shrunk by 8.4 percent in 2020 after shrinking by 2.5 percent in 2019. Sudan's economy is projected to remain in recession in 2021, with a return to modest growth expected in 2022, mainly based on agriculture and mining. The improved political outlook and Sudan's recent removal from the State Sponsors of Terrorism List (SSTL) by the United States is expected to benefit growth, yet the economy remains highly vulnerable, posing major challenges to the economic inclusion of forcibly displaced people.¹⁸

¹⁷ COR is the government entity leading the coordination and oversight of refugee matters, under the Ministry of Interior, in collaboration with UNHCR; it is also one of the authorities processing travel permit requests for refugees. COR and UNHCR co-chair the Refugee Consultation Forum which includes different government entities and humanitarian organizations for the coordination of the refugee response in the country.

¹⁸ Sudan Economic Outlook | African Development Bank - Building today, a better Africa tomorrow (afdb. org); AfDB, African Economic Outlook (2021); AfDB, Private Sector-Led Economic Diversification and Development in Sudan | African Development Bank - Building today, a better Africa tomorrow (afdb.org) (2017); and ILO, A Roadmap Toward an Employment Policy for Sudan (2014) wcms_334878.pdf (ilo.org)

The Labour Code (1997) states that "Employers shall not assign a worker to perform a job before providing him with enough training or before making him work under the supervision of one or more experienced persons in the field" (article 95). Responsibility to provide on-the-job training and apprenticeship defined by the <u>Guideline for Apprenticeship</u> <u>System</u> of SCVTA aims to ensure the appropriate management of apprentices to match market demands. Apprenticeships in the informal economy are widespread among host communities and in several of the refugee hosting areas the only available skills development opportunities.

COVID-19 AND ITS IMPACT ON TVET

COVID-19 had a negative impact on TVET programmes throughout the country, as they have remained inactive for a series of months. Activities planned by UNIDO in collaboration with UNHCR targeting TVET graduates were suspended due to COVID-19 and the closure of facilities. An attempt in November 2020 to re-open schools failed as hygienic standards were below the requirement and COVID-19 cases were on the rise once again. Online teaching and e-learning modules did not compensate for the closure of TVET facilities. Instead, only students in their final year have the chance to sit final exams and graduate. For refugees and host communities, COVID-19 has become an economic crisis on top of a public health crisis.



Tailoring training in Bidibidi settlement, Uganda © Finn Church Aid / Erik Nyström

TVET PROGRAMMES AND ACTORS IN SUDAN

FEATURED ACTORS AND PROGRAMMES: UNHCR RESPONSE STRATEGY ON TVET AND EMPLOYMENT, UNHCR AND COR

AGENCY	UNHCR
FUNDER	Multiple donors
TIMELINE	2020 — 2023
TARGET	N/A

INTRODUCTION

UNHCR works with partners and national TVET agencies to design, adopt, and implement TVET curricula that facilitate mobility and portability of credits across institutions and borders. UNHCR is also engaged in policy dialogues for the inclusion of refugees in the formal economy in line with GRF pledges, including labour protections, remuneration, taxation, social security and financial services.

MARKET ORIENTATION

UNHCR Sudan is seeking to improve refugees' access to productive assets, financial services, markets and labour markets through advocacy with government, private and development partners, in line with <u>UNHCR's 2019-2023 Global Strategy Concept Note on</u> <u>Refugee Livelihoods and Economic Inclusion</u>. So far, the programme is at the beginning of the process and the goal is to support TVET programmes offered in Khartoum, Darfur and other regions considering emerging needs of national markets, market evaluations or assessments. Ongoing UNHCR-led studies have identified and anticipated specific hard and soft skills demanded in the labour market.

LIFE/CORE SKILLS

UNHCR supports educational facilities that can benefit from a formal link with the education system so that children beyond a certain age can learn livelihood skills alongside basic literacy.

TECHNOLOGY, INNOVATION AND NEW SECTORS

To increase the visibility of TVET programmes, the UNHCR strategy is in partnership development with the private sector, government, and development partners in TVET programmes to improve connectivity between TVET and the labour market. This support may include scholarship programmes and review of the technical curriculum, additional programmes/subjects as well as equipment to target improved quality of training at secondary schools. In the longer run, the government aims to ensure that all eligible schools are equipped to provide effective technical and vocational training.

BRIDGING TO THE LABOUR MARKET

The educational needs from an expected increase in secondary enrolment will require significant financial resources. To face this challenge, UNHCR interventions support the development of fund investments in education through incentives for the private sector to get involved in TVET education. In addition, UNHCR supports the advocacy of development partners and those agencies who implement TVET, and livelihood programmes for refugees and host communities such as the GIZ Employment Initiative for Khartoum State.

FEATURED ACTORS AND PROGRAMMES: STRENGTHENING VOCATIONAL TRAINING SYSTEM OF STATE VOCATIONAL TRAINING CENTRES (GENUINE EMPLOYABLE SKILLS: GEMS) JAPAN INTERNATIONAL COOPERATION AGENCY (JICA)

AGENCY	JICA
FUNDER	Japanese Government
TIMELINE	2016 — 2021
TARGET	N/A

INTRODUCTION

GEMS started in 2016, following JICA's efforts to improve vocational training services in host and refugee communities, which took place in Khartoum and Kassala state. The project's purpose is to improve the capacity of targeted state VTCs. In total, five Japanese experts were involved in strategic planning, curriculum development and skills training. The key partners are SCVTA, Kassala State Government, White Nile State Government, Kassala VTC and Kosti VTC with an overall budget of around \$4 million and a duration of four and a half years running from February 2016 to October 2021. The aim is to improve the function of SCVTA so that they can provide technical support to state VTCs and the state government in the administration of public VTCs and their accessibility to refugees and vulnerable groups.

MARKET ORIENTATION

GEMS' support is focused on trainees' employability through the adoption of entrepreneurship training called "Start Your Business (SYB)" across any short training courses. This is seen as particularly promising for women, since wage employment opportunities are limited by sociocultural norms in the labour market, and thus starting a business is seen as a more realistic path. Every training course targeting women includes the SYB session at Kassala and Kosti VTC. The session includes market visits to enhance understanding of where to purchase raw material, and how to determine commodity prices. Thanks to this approach, about 67 percent of course participants started their own business (Kassala 64 percent and Kosti 70 percent).

TEACHERS' QUALIFICATIONS

The GEMS project works with ITTS under SCVTA to enhance their training services. GEMS trained Kassala's VTC staff, for example, in the basics of pedagogy from an ITTS qualified trainer from Khartoum state, and rolled out the training locally with trainers in Kassala who volunteered to train their colleagues.

LIFE/CORE SKILLS

VTC's main training course is a three-year apprenticeship diploma course, with the first two years being delivered at the VTC and the third year in an enterprise, called in-person training (IPT). GEMS developed the IPT guideline, to improve the management of IPT and host companies from the VTC side. The guideline includes a monitoring format for the VTC trainers, but since public institutions are facing budget constraints, monitoring visits are almost impossible. Life and core skills are expected to be acquired at the workplace.

GENDER EQUALITY

JICA encouraged the two VTCs to accept female trainees for their regular three-year courses and Kosti VTC reserved 10 places for female trainees, but low attendance remains an issue. In addition, a section for food processing was established at Kosti and at Kassala VTCs, supported by JICA and UNHCR, to attract more women. Considering the constraints of women in the labour market, home-based activities are favoured for training, such as food processing, tailoring, handicrafts, and personal care.

BRIDGING TO THE LABOUR MARKET

GEMS conducted training to SCVTA staff on curriculum development methods involving industry experts (CUDBAS-a DACUM based method developed by Japanese experts), adding to earlier capacity built before GEMS. Despite a number of practical applications, a JICA Key Informant Interview (KII) reports that incentive structures at SCVTA still do not sustain this practice, so it is likely that this activity will remain dependent on support from development partners.



TVET Trainee © Finn Church Aid / Hugh Rutherford

VOCATIONAL TRAINING AND FOOD SECURITY FOR REFUGEES AND HOST COMMUNITIES IN EASTERN SUDAN (KASSALA AND GEDAREF) BY GIZ

AGENCY	GIZ
FUNDER	BMZ
TIMELINE	2016 — 2021
TARGET	1,000 graduates, 30 percent of them women and 50 percent refugees or migrants.

INTRODUCTION

A substantial proportion of refugees in Sudan, as well as many asylum seekers, live in the eastern states of Kassala and Gedaref. Due to a limited enabling environment, the refugees in the region are not sufficiently integrated socially and economically, which is placing a great burden on the labour market and the host communities in general. The objective of the project is to improve the living conditions of host communities and refugees in the states of Kassala and Gedaref. To provide young people with job prospects, GIZ supports vocational training in the trades and small-scale business sector and is helping to develop local businesses. In this context, GIZ is gearing its efforts to labour market needs and employment potential by providing business creation opportunities through training for 500 young men and women that has been put in place for 50 local small enterprises. Training is enabling private business associations to meet their members' needs for more advanced and locally generated technical and business skills.

This project is being implemented in collaboration with the Intergovernmental Authority on Development (IGAD). Important partner organizations are SCVTA, responsible for curriculum development, certification, and teacher training in Kassala and Gedaref, the Department of Labour and Vocational Training Centres and the state Ministry of Finance, as well as the technical and vocational schools under the Ministry of Education.

MARKET ORIENTATION

There is underutilized potential for promoting small and medium-sized enterprises to stimulate economic growth and create new jobs. Kassala VTC partners with local business associations to link vocational training with the private sector and to promote small business. One of the aims of the project is to develop one-year dual training courses (e.g. curricula, standards, testing, teaching materials) under the direction of the SCVTA, with the involvement of both national and state levels, as well as the private sector.

To promote local entrepreneurship and in-company training, GIZ has included individual modules such as business start-up and business basics training to participate in business incubators. Here, company founders are advised on the business plans and are supported in accessing micro and bank loans. Companies can also use the training courses to improve their processes and increase their sales. The project is also examining cooperation potential for partnerships with the private sector in Gedaref and Kassala, which could help open new markets and create new jobs.

SUPPORT SERVICES

GIZ encourages the responsible government bodies in Kassala and Gedaref to establish a multi-stakeholder dialogue platform for the local anchoring of employment promotion measures. As a result, a model platform should continuously support exchange and cooperation between relevant actors to promote employment for TVET graduates.

ACCREDITATION

Since the government does not fund training for refugees and migrants, TVET courses offered to refugees are initially funded by the project and developed in cooperation with the SCVTA. As part of the project, 120 companies/workshops have been identified as training companies within the framework of the new one-year training courses based on SCVTA standards. Out of 120, the students received practical training from 43 workshops. In addition, vocational school teachers and company trainers, 15 percent of whom are women, are certified by SCVTA to teach the new training courses.

TEACHERS' QUALIFICATIONS

SCVTA supports teacher training with very limited funding, which only allows the necessary infrastructure (teaching rooms, training machines, etc.) and quality assurance to be carried out to a limited extent in Khartoum. Teachers can rely only on limited training options.

LIFE/CORE SKILLS

Since curricula for the planned courses were developed in cooperation with the SCVTA and the technical team, the project was able to ensure that life and core skills were included alongside vocational skills. For example, problem-solving skills, innovation skills and the skills required to set up a business, i.e. legal framework, registration, taxes, development of business plans, and access to credit.

TECHNOLOGY, INNOVATION AND NEW SECTORS

At least 40 percent of the training period takes place in a company, which is above the usual rate for Sudan. In contrast to the three-year state apprenticeship programme (mentioned above), curricula are also developed for the practical part of the training together with companies. Company trainers receive further skills training so that the quality and provision of the training can be ensured in accordance with the developed standards.

GENDER EQUALITY

Women are structurally disadvantaged and have only limited access to education in Sudan. According to UNICEF in 2018, 49 percent of girls are missing out on primary education in Sudan. The aim of the project's advisory services is to ensure that women and men have equal access to vocational training. Through gender-differentiated monitoring of enrolment rates and the training of young women, if necessary in separate courses, the project contributes to gender equality in accessing TVET courses. From the 1,000 trainees in Kassala and Gedaref who are expected to successfully complete the newly established modular and dual training courses, about 30 percent are women and 50 percent are refugees or migrants. Ideally 15 percent of women will be certified to teach the new training courses as part of vocational schools and company trainers. The outcome was that a portion of women started their micro-businesses based on the knowledge gained without further support from the project. Another outcome was a change in parents' and prospective students' perception of vocational training, specifically for women. To boost this shift, the project used a grant agreement instrument to fund UNESCO for an awareness-raising campaign to promote vocational training which led to around 16,000 boys and 22,000 girls from 342 schools taking part in different activities. The significance of the event was marked by an increase of women's enrolment in trades traditionally dominated by men, such as welding or general electrical services.

BRIDGING TO THE LABOUR MARKET

To better integrate TVET graduates into the labour market, the "strategy to integrate vocational training graduates into the labour market in Gedaref and Kassala"¹⁹ was developed together with the local Small Industries and Crafts Unions and stakeholders in vocational education. GIZ also supported the establishment of two job centres in Gedaref and Kassala and the planning of two job fairs intended to take place in 2019 and 2020. These events were postponed for external reasons.

EMERGING PRACTICES IN TVET IN SUDAN

- Local capacity development and integration with national strategies is key. Skills development projects that are funded and run by donors, especially in remote rural areas where public TVET infrastructure is scarce, encounter an important challenge as it relates to integrating activities with capacity development of national actors and institutions. This may include efforts to rehabilitate infrastructure assets, yet should ensure that the feasibility of running and maintaining training centres – including under the auspices of which institution – is carefully assessed.
- Resources developed by TVET actors in Sudan are useful and should be disseminated more widely. The VTC Operation and Management Guideline developed by JICA, for example, is a valuable resource to organise training to accommodate disadvantaged groups, especially refugees.²⁰ The handbook of *Teaching Methods for Motivation and Self-Esteem* produced by a VTC institute in Sudan increases effective teaching methods and motivation.

¹⁹ https://data2.unhcr.org/en/documents/details/85698

²⁰ JICA (2018) Ex-Post Project Evaluation 2016: Package I-7 (Sudan, South Sudan, Rwanda) <u>https://libopac.jica.go.jp/images/report/1000036500.pdf</u>

- Information-sharing is critical for successful training of refugees. Proper advertisement and promotion of vocational opportunities is indispensable to achieve higher enrolment and completion rates, and employment after the training, including for women. SCVTA has a handbook which is distributed to new trainees on the apprenticeship programme. In Kassala and Gadaref, an awareness-raising campaign to promote vocational training among secondary students led to increased enrolment of women in trades traditionally dominated by men. JICA organized six months' training in welding, electricity and automotive with Technical Secondary Schools, and an additional information session reduced dropouts compared with earlier courses.
- Career guidance and employment services should be available at VTCs or job centres to link employers with TVET graduates. Career counsellors at both VTCs or job centres increasingly use web-based job matching platforms, such as Sudan Job and Orooma, to complement guidance and placement services.
- Linkage with the private sector is critical. An example of successful integration between VTCs and companies is the Bakery Development Centre, which implements the Sayga Mobile Bakery School. It purchased five mobile units with kitchen facilities for refugees across the country and trains refugee bakery shop owners to improve production (upgrade training) and to enable women in rural areas to start income generation activities in bakery (re-training). According to a key informant in November 2020, the mobile units were training about 4,000 people a month. This could be a scalable model given the needs in the communities for food security and food industry development.

CONCLUSIONS

NATIONAL RECOMMENDATIONS

 Strengthen and modernize the country's TVET system to respond better to labour market needs through the inclusion of disadvantaged groups such as refugees that have significant economic potential. Sudan's TVET system remains divided into technical education and vocational training, and lacks capacity and motivated staff to service the country's dire development needs. Private sector collaboration is mainly limited to the small-scale national apprenticeship system, with notable exceptions through partnership with international development agencies. Partnerships between VTCs and technical schools and business associations and enterprises including micro and small enterprises need strengthening, along with more flexible delivery models. The planned TVET policy is an opportunity to overcome incoherences in governance and work towards a better coordinated and unified TVET system.

- Introduce innovative TVET financing through public-private partnerships (PPPs) to address structural lack of financial resources for skills and employment in both refugees and host communities. The public financing system for TVET in Sudan concerns only a limited pool of public VTCs and technical schools. PPPs could help to improve training infrastructure or equipment, and promote work-based learning and dual programmes. Another option is to consider introducing training levies or taxes among private companies that could be used as a training fund to support both public and private training provision in the country. Rigorous monitoring and quality assurance mechanisms and procedures are required to guarantee transparency and efficiency. Funding to incentivise more public and private providers can be diversified through grants and loans from both international and domestic partners.
- Improve information and guidance for refugees and host communities about the content of training and careers available: More targeted and tailored communication can increase trainees' motivation and readiness to learn. Awareness campaigns or exposure to private companies through visits or job fairs could deepen their understanding of work, increase enrolments and reduce dropout.
- Invest in connectivity and digital infrastructure for refugees and host communities to benefit from remote learning, particularly during the current pandemic that restricts face-to-face interaction. A recent evaluation by Landell Mills on behalf of the EU Delegation in Sudan highlighted major constraints observed during the COVID-19 crisis, including little use of technology and an untrained workforce. Funding agencies and public resources can prioritize interventions focused on connectivity improvements and digital literacy to assist TVET in improving outreach and remote access to training.
- Advocate for facilitating refugees' access to work and work permits so that TVET programmes can lead to decent labour market opportunities.
 UNHCR and partners will continue their efforts to ensure registered refugees and asylum seekers enjoy general access to the labour market and that the current expensive and onerous work permit requirements are phased out.
- Integrate entrepreneurship training and business development services with TVET services and initiatives to ensure refugees' mobility and transition to work.

SUMMARY TABLE

SUMMARY

The integration of refugees in TVET programmes is feasible by law but depends in practice on donor support and on enhancing the enabling environment for all refugees. Given the fragmented labour market and a lack of work opportunities, both refugees and the Sudanese population face difficulties in finding decent jobs. A critical gap remains to improve the responsiveness of the national TVET system and link it closer to the needs of the private sector.

ACTOR 1 KEY CONTRIBUTIONS	ACTOR 2 KEY CONTRIBUTIONS	ACTOR 3 KEY CONTRIBUTIONS
 UNHCR actions are meant to increase access to national TVET systems for refugees. Some of key actions include: 1. Major advocacy campaigns. 2. Support in accessing apprenticeship programmes. 	 The Japanese International Development Agency (JICA) in <u>Sudan</u> has implemented a four-year project (<u>GEMS</u>) which: 1. Strengthened public TVET provision through policy review. 2. Reviewed curriculum development, and skills training in collaboration with SCVTA. 	A GIZ <u>initiative</u> , funded by BMZ, focuses on improving the living conditions of refugees and host communities in eastern Sudan by providing vocational training in the trades and small- scale business sector. The project created: 1. Business opportunities
 Services related to career counselling and job placement. 		through training given to over 50 local small enterprises.
 Receipt of qualifications upon completion of study or training. 		2. An enabling environment for private business to procure more advanced

technical and business

skills locally.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The main areas of recommendations at the national level and emerging from the analysis relate to:

- 1. Strengthening and modernizing the country's TVET system based on a cohesive and inclusive policy approach, and actual labour market needs.
- 2. Introducing innovative TVET financing through Public Private Partnerships (PPPs).
- 3. Improving information and guidance for refugees and host communities.
- 4. Investing in connectivity and digital infrastructure for refugees and host communities.
- 5. Advocating for facilitating refugees' access to work and work permits.
- 6. Integrating entrepreneurship training and business development services with TVET.

EMERGING PRACTICE

Reproduce a similar model to the Sayga Mobile Bakery School. This mobile approach to deliver training reached up to 4,000 individuals per month.



Entry-level work experience at local companies in Ethiopia $\ensuremath{\mathbb{C}}$ GIZ / Birhan.



COUNTRY FINDINGS: ETHIOPIA

ETHIOPIA CONTEXT

REFUGEE ENVIRONMENT AND LEGAL FRAMEWORK

Ethiopia has a long history of hosting refugees and maintains an open-door asylum policy, giving humanitarian access and protection to those seeking refuge. Ethiopia is currently hosting almost 800,000 refugees, making it the second largest host country in Africa.²¹

Ethiopia is one of the first five African countries participating in the Comprehensive Refugee Response Framework (CRRF). The intention of the Country Refugee Response Plan (CRRP) and of the work by the international community is to ensure durable solutions are advanced for refugees. In the case of Ethiopia, they include: voluntary repatriation, in which refugees return in safety and with dignity to their countries of origin and re-avail themselves of national protection; resettlement, in which refugees are selected and transferred from the country of refuge to a third state which has agreed to offer a permanent residence status; and local integration, in which refugees legally, economically and socially integrate in the host country. For local integration, one of the key objectives of the CRRP is to support the implementation of the Government's Pledges to expand access to rights, services, and self-reliance opportunities in the longer-term.

Ethiopia set out nine pledges at the Global Refugee Forum 2019, to improve the lives of refugees in line with a prospect of longer-term integration. One of the key pledges from Ethiopia on TVET at the Global Refugee Forum was to provide equitable, quality and accredited skills training to 20,000 host community members and refugees. This pledge highlights the intention underpinning the CRRP, which is to ensure a significant portion of refugees are absorbed by the labour market and social structures in Ethiopia. The Amended Refugee Proclamation, ratified in January 2019, has improved the framework for refugee integration in Ethiopia.

However, the sectoral implementation of this new legislation at federal and regional levels is yet to be realised. The financial commitment required is staggering and requires complex concertation across several donors and political interests. CRRP indicates that to implement the plan for 2019/2020 would require almost \$1.3 billion, of which at least \$130 million should be dedicated to livelihood and resilience activities. The inability to reach this full figure, compounded by the current pandemic, might restrain the actual achievements intended at origin.

GOVERNANCE STRUCTURE FOR TVET

Ethiopia adopted a <u>National Technical and Vocational Education and Training Strategy</u> in 2008 to improve the quality and relevance of the TVET system which is aimed at tackling the challenges of unemployment and low productivity through producing middle-level manpower. This strategy has been consistent with the government's five-year development

²¹ Qualifications and Employment Perspectives for Refugees and Host Communities in Ethiopia Programme (QEP)

plans. In 2008, the National TVET Strategy was aiming to make TVET an outcome-based system, which anticipates the skills needs of the economy (demand-based curricula) to inform the design and content of TVET programmes with special attention to quality and relevance. The government also adopted the Technical and Vocational Education and Training Proclamation No. 954/2016 which provides for the establishment of a national technical and vocational education and training qualifications framework by the Federal Technical and Vocational Education and Training Agency. As of 2018, the Ministry of Education has been split into the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Science and Higher Education (MSHE). Hence, the TVET programme now falls under the MSHE.

The TVET system consists of a two-pronged approach of offering formal and non-formal technical and vocational training programmes. The non-formal TVET system provides short-term technical and vocational training to a wide range of different groups, mostly from the ranks of unemployed young people and destitute women who have an interest in self-employment. The formal TVET system caters to students who complete at least grade 10 of their education and proceed to attend one to five years of TVET training courses. The federal TVET agency is responsible for financing the formal TVET system and the preparation of occupational standards, as well as training guidelines, handbooks and manuals.

The TVET system is mainly financed by the federal budget from the MSHE, and the regional Government Education Bureau. Despite the ambitions related to the labour market, federal funding for TVET education constitutes less than 10 percent of the total education budget.



© Finn Church Aid / Hugh Rutherford

The share of spending on TVET out of all public spending on education is about 5 percent, which is less than half in per capita terms compared to higher education (GIZ, 2018).²² Moreover, the national rate of TVET enrolment has remained quite constant in previous years, which also reflects limited investment in attracting more learners.

Research from the Ethiopian Development Research Institute in 2018 also identified a gap between TVET output and industry requirements and the fact that TVET is considered generally as a second-best option. The firms involved in this study do not regard graduates as technically competent. For example, even if nearly 80 percent of the firms in the metalworking industry employ TVET graduates,²³ the majority of them do not appear to be satisfied with the performance of the TVET graduates, suggesting a problem with quality of the trainees. The weak TVET-Industry linkage means that skills development provision is supply-driven, focusing on delivering against the curriculum without interpreting it in terms of current industry needs, and without adapting to the changing skills needs of the economy.²⁴

INCLUSION OF REFUGEES

The degree of access by refugees, returnees, asylum seekers and stateless individuals to TVET programmes is not easily quantifiable since there are many private and public providers co-existing and there is a lack of centralised information management. Yet, the delivery of refugee education in relation to the national education system is well evidenced and described as 'one system, two administrative bodies' where the Agency for Refugee and Returnee Affairs (ARRA) has overall coordinating and implementation responsibility for primary education for refugees.²⁵ This is an important pre-condition to access vocational training.

Another key criterion of inclusion of refugees in the formal economy relates to mobility in the country and across countries. The government pledged to expand its Out of Camp Policy (OCP) to benefit 10 percent of the current refugee population based on specific eligibility criteria. Following the change in legislation in the 'Revised Refugee Law' Proclamation No. 1110/2019, the law aims to improve, within available means, comprehensive protection and assistance to refugees, and therefore give more out-of-camp rights to refugees similar to locals as well as other legal foreign residents, including access to health service, education, work permits, irrigation land, and driving license, among others. A 'Right to Work' Directive (No. 02/2019) has also been issued as a secondary legislation, and which now enables refugees to take up economic activities.

²² State of Skills, ILO, 2019

²³ Abebe Girum, Tigabu Degu & Gebrehiwot Ageba, (2018b). "What drives productivity change in the manufacturing sector? Evidence from the metalworking industry in Ethiopia," Working Papers 020, Ethiopian Development Research Institute.

²⁴ Sector skills strategy for the garment sector in Ethiopia, ILO, 2019.

²⁵ Strengthening coordinated education planning and response in crises- Ethiopia case study, Joseph Wales, Amina Khan and Susan Nicolai, ODI, May 2020

The inclusion of refugees from an institutional perspective is enabled by a degree of cultural proximity between host community members and refugees.²⁶ In the context of the Somali and Tigray region, the two groups share the same language, culture and religion. This also led to a faster and greater integration, compared to other displacement settings and situations in Ethiopia.

The recognition of status also remains challenging, particularly when determining the level of double registration, or the number of people who are registered as both a citizen of Ethiopia and a refugee from Somalia.²⁷ In 2002, it was estimated that only around 50 percent of its population were bona fide refugees. According to a 2018 World Bank study, 30 percent of registered refugee respondents reported that they were also registered Ethiopian citizens, which indicates a significant overlap between these two categories in terms of status.²⁸ Other legal limitations still persist for refugees to access formal labour, although in some cases, personal networks can help refugees overcome status barriers to employment. A recent ILO labour market assessment indicates that the situation has often discouraged refugees from seeking employment in the formal sector, even if many bridges do exist, in particular with the new refugee law. Consequently, competition over low-paid jobs is rising since refugees reported more pressure to pursue opportunities in the informal economy.²⁹

MARKET STRUCTURES

Despite entry barriers in the formal economy, the latest <u>World Bank Poverty Assessment in</u> <u>Ethiopia</u> considers that increasing returns to self-employment (versus wage employment) and an increase in the share of urban self-employment were "important in explaining poverty reduction in Ethiopia's cities and towns". In addition, the report underlines how Ethiopia's labour force has more than doubled in the past 20 years, and in excess of 1.8 million people are entering the labour market each year. This increased pressure on creating jobs needs to be balanced with distribution of benefits in terms of adequate earnings; reservation wage, working time and work stability.

With the introduction of the first Growth and Transformation Plan (GTP I) in 2010, the Government expressed a clear orientation towards the industrial sector. In 2015, GTP II was launched, with a greater focus on the need to attract foreign investment and meet the Sustainable Development Goals. The Government's development framework is centred on structural transformation, with particular attention paid to the manufacturing sector. To achieve GTP ambitions, the quality of general education and TVET, as well as job creation in the formal sector, can foster entrepreneurship and facilitate the transition to the labour market. The plan puts an emphasis on TVET as skill development hubs for MSMEs and the need to improve quality and access to TVET programme.

26 Ibid.

- 28 Ibid.
- 29 Ibid.

²⁷ Integrated labour market assessment in Jigjiga and Kebribeyah, ILO, 2020

Several market assessments have been conducted in Ethiopia and several sectors have been identified as high potential for both refugees and host communities. A recent ILO study indicates a steep upward trend, driven by foreign investment into the industrial parks for skills related to the garment industry. A continuation of the trend established would mean reaching a demand of approximately 138,000 positions in 2020/21, up from 51,000 in 2015.³⁰ Other sectors that are expected to experience an increased demand in 2021 (up 74 percent) are construction, mining and energy.³¹

A recent ILO study in Jigjiga and Kebribeyah confirmed specific trends on how access to labour markets works for refugees more generally in Ethiopia. What emerged is that information about linkages to the labour market are often missing, such as with placement or job-search support.³² This missing link exists alongside a limited supply of jobs within refugees' communities and lack of capital to start a business favouring personal networks. All stakeholders involved agreed that personal connections are probably the most effective pathways to employment, particularly the formal, most-desired positions. This is especially true in the private sector where companies are still expanding, and prefer to rely on family business hiring practices leveraged by their communities.

COVID-19 AND ITS IMPACT ON TVET

Since the first case of COVID-19 was declared in Ethiopia on 13 March 2020, Ethiopian authorities have implemented a series of prevention measures, and the Ethiopian Government declared a national state of emergency amid the COVID-19 pandemic on 8 April 2020. Ethiopia's economic growth could be 2.5 percentage points lower next year and, according to the Job Creation Commission, 1.4 million jobs are threatened in the short term. COVID-19 has had a greater impact in areas of high prevalence of informal businesses and workers, which tend to be populated by refugees. The logistical challenges within supply chains, particularly cross-border and domestic restrictions of movement, may have led to disruptions in food supply, undermining informal workers' food security.³³

Anecdotal evidence from April 2020 suggests that the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on local economies led to the closing of many micro and small companies, as they were all directly impacted by governmental safety regulations. It is possible to imagine that the COVID-19 pandemic will have a long-term impact on these already fragile microenterprises, with the sudden drop in demand and shutdown of activity. Although the COVID-19 pandemic has disrupted the economy and will lead to the prioritization of more essential and shortterm outcomes, the longer-term role of TVET in strengthening value chains should remain central in the development of formal and informal sectors (agribusiness, construction, mechanics, etc.).

31 Ibid.

³⁰ Sector skills strategy for the garment sector in Ethiopia, ILO, 2019

³² Integrated labour market assessment in Jigjiga and Kebribeyah, ILO, 2020

³³ Sector skills strategy for the garment sector in Ethiopia, ILO, 2019

TVET PROGRAMMES AND ACTORS IN ETHIOPIA

FEATURED ACTORS AND PROGRAMMES: QUALIFICATIONS AND EMPLOYMENT PERSPECTIVES FOR REFUGEES AND HOST COMMUNITIES IN ETHIOPIA PROGRAMME (QEP)

AGENCY	GIZ
FUNDER	BMZ and Norad
TIMELINE	2019 — 2023
TARGET	8,000 persons (50 percent refugees and 50 percent host communities, in total 30 percent women)

INTRODUCTION

On behalf of the German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ), GIZ implements the programme "Qualifications and employment perspectives for refugees and host communities in Ethiopia" (QEP) to improve the employment perspectives of refugees and host communities in five regions: Addis Ababa, Benishangul-Gumuz (Assosa area), Somali region (Jigjiga area), Tigray region (Shire, Adwa, Myzebri areas) and Gambella region (Gambella Town area) between 2017 and 2023. The programme contributes to the special initiative Tackling the Root Causes of Displacement - Reintegrating Refugees and aims to promote the integration of refugees and to strengthen the resilience of host communities. The project logic is articulated in five pathways: improving the quality of TVET, the offer of vocational training, the offer of entrepreneurship and job advice, strengthening institutional capacities to put Ethiopia's refugee proclamation into practice in the sectors of vocational training, employment, and improving psychosocial support offers to lay the foundations for training, employment and (re-)integration. Thereby, the employment prospects of refugees and host communities will be improved, and contribute towards their integration and social cohesion.

So far, 280 vocational school teachers have taken part in further training and more than 14,700 trainees are benefiting from improved TVET. The programme is also implemented in cooperation with more than 200 companies to ensure the integration of skills acquired for 2,500 refugees, IDPs and Ethiopians through initial work experience.

MARKET ORIENTATION

QEP has conducted extensive market assessments (in three out of five regions) to ensure hard and soft skills were identified and to strengthen the alignment between market needs and the selection criteria of TVET programmes.

Before the most recent conflict outbreak, the Tigray region showed a comparatively stronger development of the TVET sector and industrial structure. With numerous micro, small and medium enterprises, as well as large-scale industry and an advanced TVET sector, the region has potential for integrated employment creation. The public TVET sector in Benishangul-Gumuz also showed strong potential and the refugee situation in the region seems guite stable. TVET actors could be linked to the refugee camps and further supported with technical training to benefit the refugee context. While Benishangul-Gumuz is still an emerging region, partner initiatives like the Centre of Excellence for Bamboo in the public TVET college are already available. The Gambella region is characterized by limited resources and capacities in the public TVET sector and other government institutions. The needs in refugee camps are characterized by predominantly humanitarian needs; livelihood approaches which link training and employment promotion would require substantial human and material support.³⁴ Industry development is a recent phenomenon with cotton processing and agricultural products industries (Saudi Star and Mango Production investment) are currently available and industry parks are planned to be constructed in 2021. The linkage with construction and automotive companies also shows great potential.³⁵

SUPPORT SERVICES

One of the key aspects of the project is to provide job orientation and entrepreneurship advice to refugees in order to broaden the range of support services. An essential activity is the establishment of exchange platforms on employment prospects for young people in the refugee camps and the host communities. On the one hand, they allow TVET programmes to be adjusted to labour market needs; on the other, they build the bridge between the vocational training system and the labour market and facilitate entry points into the world of work.

As part of the programme activities, QEP also seeks to bridge the capacity gaps of selected regional Urban Job Creation and Food Security Agencies to empower the public stakeholders in fulfilling their mandate in self-employment promotion. In alignment with Ethiopia's Technical and Vocational Education and Training Proclamation, QEP also supports its partner vocational colleges with the establishment of entrepreneurship centres aiming at enhancing their offers and the promotion of micro-entrepreneurs.

ACCREDITATION

During the selection process of participants, which is based on transparent criteria, relevant prior knowledge is considered. By giving graduates the opportunity to receive official certificates, refugees and the host communities are benefiting from TVET recognised by the Ethiopian education system. Activities include the implementation of new accreditation measures in employment-intensive sectors. Two training centres in the refugee camps – AwBarre and Shedder in the Somali region – were established and accredited. In the refugee camps, training is provided to refugees and Ethiopians using curricula according to the Ethiopian Occupational Standards.

³⁴ Gambella GIZ-QEP Implementation Opportunities and Limitations Assessment Report, Menelik Anbesse, GIZ, 2019

³⁵ Assessments for Integrated, Market-oriented Trainings and Partnership with Public TVET Colleges in Shire and Mai-Tsebri Towns, Tigray, Ethiopia, MEGEN Power (MGP) Ltd, 2020

TEACHERS' QUALIFICATIONS

An essential lever for QEP is the technical and didactic training of TVET teachers as well as trainers who are involved in NGO activities in refugee camps. This training is meant to strengthen the learning abilities of TVET staff, which will have a positive impact on the quality of the learning outcomes of refugees and the host communities. This priority stems from a lack of standardized curricula and teachers' teaching-learning materials (TTLM); unlike the Occupational Standard (OS), curricula and TTLM are left to instructors to develop for their respective occupational training fields.

While allowing flexibility to develop contextualised curricula, TTLM give room for instructors to design and implement market relevant training. Varying skill levels among instructors, however, may undermined their capacity to deliver quality training and take advantage of the built-in flexibility.³⁶ As per the TVET instructors, lack of basic instructional resources and guidelines to develop curricula and TTLM at the TVET level has led instructors to rely heavily on often inconsistent and diverse web-based resources. In line with QEP's objectives (improving quality of training, expanding market-oriented training offerings, and improving entrepreneurship and employment opportunities), capacity development needs for TVET is a core objective.

In Addis Ababa, Somali region, Benishangul-Gumuz region and Gambella region, over 280 trainers have participated in technical as well as soft skill training of trainer measures (including psychosocial aspects). In addition, curricula have been adjusted to Ethiopian Occupational Standards. Certified trainers that are in demand in the sectors can build the TVET's profile within the local business community and increase opportunities for TVET-industry linkages and cooperative training.³⁷

LIFE/CORE SKILLS

Throughout the further development or redesign of curricula, QEP intends to ensure that they are relevant to the labour market as well as conflict- and gender-sensitive. As a result, the needs of the local labour markets, as well as the needs of the refugees and the host communities are more strongly addressed in the curricula. Through market-oriented revision of curricula, Training of Trainers (ToT) and provision of teaching materials and facilities, refugees and host communities who complete TVET courses are expected to be more employable.

36 Ibid.

³⁷ Assessments for integrated, market-oriented trainings and partnership with public TVET Colleges in Shire and Mai-Tsebri Towns, Tigray, Ethiopia, MEGEN Power (MGP) Ltd, 2020.

TECHNOLOGY, INNOVATION AND NEW SECTORS

The initial assessment pointed out that deficient machinery and equipment affect the quality of skills training. Machinery being used for practical training sessions is both obsolete and deficient.³⁸ To address the infrastructural weakness, the expansion of vocational training colleges into inclusive vocational colleges comprises, among other measures, the procurement of material and equipment.

First and foremost, however, the development of inclusive vocational colleges creates a space where refugees and Ethiopian nationals learn together, thus creating conditions to build social cohesion. A successful pilot is the Nefas Silk Polytechnic College in Addis Ababa – Ethiopia's first Inclusive Vocational College established in 2018. The approach has been scaled up to Somali, Benishangul-Gumuz and Tigray regions.

GENDER EQUALITY

The programme contributes to gender equality through the gender-sensitive selection of TVET staff, the gender-specific design of the curricula and a gender-equitable selection of participants (30 percent to be women). The project focuses on employment-enhancing measures in rural areas for refugees and the host communities in various regions to contribute to poverty reduction. According to KIIs, QEP favours the inclusion of women in non-traditional gender roles skills areas like mechanics. Along with UNHCR protection policies, TVET training is funded to make it more accessible to women. One of the partnering TVET colleges provides child care to support for female teachers and incentivize more women to attend TVET training courses.

BRIDGING TO THE LABOUR MARKET

To ensure access to public vocational training for refugees, QEP provides technical advice to vocational colleges to set up the necessary institutional structure for an inclusive and market-driven training provision.

In Addis Ababa, Somali, Benishangul-Gumuz and Gambella regions, the Inclusive Employment Promotion Programme (IEPP) is being implemented. To date, more than 900 graduates have benefited from entry-level work experience at more than 200 local companies. QEP aims to target 2,500 refugees, Ethiopians and IDPs with this approach.

IEPP is an accelerator in creating pathways into waged employment for vocational training graduates (refugees and Ethiopians) and works in collaboration with vocational colleges and local companies. IEPP strengthens the cooperation between partnering vocational colleges and local companies to facilitate entry-level work experience for graduates of the colleges. Local companies select suitable candidates while the partnering vocational colleges cover their stipends. The college facilitates an exchange platform which builds strong networks between companies, the vocational system and potential future employees.

38 Ibid.

FEATURED ACTORS AND PROGRAMMES: ZOA

AGENCY	ZOA (ARC- HOPE)	ZOA (Increasing Job opportunities for Ethiopian and Somali Refugee Youth)
FUNDER	Various	Micah Network
TIMELINE	2017 — 2020	2016 — 2020
TARGET	5,500 received formal education through the programme	1,202 individuals

INTRODUCTION

ZOA is a critical actor in the TVET landscape operating a programme approach to target refugees and link them with the job market. ZOA implemented various projects with respect to refugees and linked to TVET, such as Hope Opportunities for People in Ethiopia (HOPE) and the initiative Increasing Job opportunities for Ethiopian and Somali Refugee Youth in the Somali Region of Ethiopia.

HOPE aims to provide employment to both Ethiopian and migrant workers (including refugees) by addressing obstacles in the labour market. Its total expected reach is 5,500 individuals (direct and indirect). The intended result of the project is to improve basic services and income generating and livelihood opportunities in an unstable area. This wider aim is articulated in the following results:

- Income generating and livelihood opportunities to prevent the (re) occurrence of conflicts, instability or irregular migration.
- Sustainable basic services to prevent the (re)occurrence of conflicts, instability or irregular migration.

The other relevant project Increasing Job opportunities for Ethiopian and Somali Refugee Youth targets the youth labour market and is implementing an operational solution considering the current restrictions imposed by the pandemic. The total expected reach is 1,202 individuals (direct and indirect). Its specific purposes are to improve access to market relevant skills training and learning experiences and to quality market driven training services connecting underserved young people, especially women, to employment and income opportunities.

MARKET ORIENTATION

Under the HOPE project, potential marketable skills such as smart and cell phone maintenance, solar installation, photo studio, refrigerator and AC maintenance, general metal fabrication and assembly skills were identified through market and labour assessments. The trainings are going to be conducted for 50 unemployed young people based on this orientation. In addition, ZOA conducted a rapid assessment on socio-economic and demographic profiles of unemployed youth in Buramino camp (100 respondents) and Dollo Addo town. The assessment had covered the labour market and the skills young people could bring into the market with the aim of identifying employment opportunities in Dollo Addo town. In addition, to avoid market saturation ZOA reported that it coordinates on vocational skills training interventions with other NGOs to ensure complementarity instead of duplication.

SUPPORT SERVICES

The different life skills training activities that ZOA is currently offering sit well within its mandate to enhance livelihoods and business skills training provision. While some training is still being contracted externally, staff who are involved appear committed and motivated.³⁹ More specifically, the training packages are:

- Life Kit for Girls (LKG): ZOA has been running a LKG pilot project which targets teenage refugee girls who are not attending school. Girls attending the project go through a structured seven-week programme that aims to help them become less socially isolated, and to foster their increased self-awareness, self-esteem and social resilience.
- Life skills as part of business coaching: The business skills training programme in Addis has developed a three-day life skills training component that is offered at the start of the business coaching programme.

ACCREDITATION

According to the KII, the training is delivered through certified institutes. ZOA works closely with institutional stakeholders as well to ensure all project participants, both host communities and refugees, receive a legitimate accreditation upon the completion of their studies.

TEACHERS' QUALIFICATIONS

In the context of HOPE, in 2018 almost 50 teachers received ToT training on topics such as interpersonal communication skills, refugee participation and cultural sensitivity. This was reported to have increased the awareness in schools and communities of the need for non-discrimination and equal access to schools for refugees. Aside from this specific activity, there was no mention of specific technical training. During the KII, the process for recruitment of TVET trainers follows a tender with eligibility criteria to ensure only qualified trainers apply. It is also understood that TVET teacher training is a primary responsibility of the government.

³⁹ Psychosocial Responsiveness in Livelihoods Programming: Report of the Working Group, 2019.

LIFE/CORE SKILLS

In the context of Increasing Job opportunities for Ethiopian and Somali Refugee Youth, ZOA closely works with four TVET centres. The centres have been providing short-term vocational skills training in different skills. The institutions have been actively supporting the experts from the TVET regional office who have prepared training curricula in the Somali language based on the regional TVET curriculum requirements.

In addition, in line with the objective to increase the capacity of local training and business service providers to integrate market driven employment, around 50 young people received business skills training (BST) at the end of 2019. This five-day training course was provided with the support of the cooperative promotion office in Dollo Addo Woreda. All trainees have developed a business plan and were reported to be applying what they have acquired, such as the use of cash book to record and track their income while using a financial institution for saving.

TECHNOLOGY, INNOVATION AND NEW SECTORS

As part of the Increasing Job opportunities for Ethiopian and Somali Refugee Youth initiative, ten days of vocational skills training (VST) on solar operation and maintenance were provided to 30 young people (two female and 28 male) in Dollo Ado town. As well as this training (50 percent practical), a solar maintenance kit was provided to the trainees. ZOA is also exploring partnerships with actors like Gebaya to ensure linkages between project participants and new in-demand markets. Gebeya is a centre of excellence for African software engineers striving to build a self-sustainable ecosystem that trains, hires and incubates African software engineers. Gebeya utilizes a hands-on style of learning and teaching (smart learning) with a model that has the characteristics of a software engineering academy offering modern practices and useful tools.

GENDER EQUALITY

ZOA reported that under HOPE consortium members provided specific VST to girls and women, such as hairdressing, catering, fashion and design. For many female participants these training opportunities were the first time that they received any education. The female graduates reported that they felt more motivated to develop their skills further. In addition, ZOA enabled the establishment of Village Savings and Loan Associations (VSLAs) that are primarily composed of women who started a small business. The partners in the projects also work to reduce gender barriers for women and girls by engaging through self-help groups (SHGs). The members of SHGs also received training on life skills and vocational skills.

Poor menstrual hygiene management (MHM) was also identified as a key reason for high dropout rates for girls from school and vocational training. Through the existing gender clubs in school, the project partner offered sanitary pad preparation made with local materials to girls and monitoring visits confirmed increased retention of girls.

BRIDGING TO THE LABOUR MARKET

Under HOPE, ZOA held roundtable talks with local private companies and government stakeholders. The engagement with private companies is oriented to understand patterns of job creation and strives to generate trainees with marketable skills in line with private companies' demand. In terms of hiring, host communities identified unmatched demand and supply as a problem that persists, which compels ZOA and partners to continue to hold consultative meetings with private companies to constantly align the labour demand with its supply.

In terms of sustainable linkages with the labour market, in the Increasing Job opportunities for Ethiopian and Somali Refugee Youth initiative, it is anticipated that the business cooperative groups will continue operating and generating income while providing services to the community. The start-up materials provided and the support of government stakeholders beyond the project implementation will ensure the sustainability of the actions. The linkage created with Woreda Cooperative Office is also expected to safeguard the sustainability of the business groups established under this project.

CONCLUSIONS

EMERGING PRACTICES

- **1. Cooperatives are an important step in transitioning to a formal economy.** These may start as informal units, but they can grow to become formal business entities. They also offer an accessible means of gaining legal recognition, since their capital requirements are minimal, and allow their members to take more financial risk and gain access to credit and other services collectively. Several profitable businesses interviewed in Jigjiga started as primary cooperatives, for example, SABATI textiles.⁴⁰
- 2. Mapping-out stakeholders from industry cultivates interest and support for the integration of refugees and host communities in cooperative training. Industry partnerships between TVET institutions and industry create employment opportunities for TVET graduates and an eventual partnership platform can be developed. Potential members of the TVET-Industry partnership platform may include: representatives of industry (potential employers), deans of TVETs, head of the Job Placement Centre (JPC), chair of the MSME Council (who is also the Mayor), youth representative – preferably from unemployed TVET graduates, representatives of Eritrean refugees.⁴¹:

⁴⁰ Integrated labour market assessment in Jigjiga and Kebribeyah, ILO, 2020.

⁴¹ Assessments for integrated, market-oriented trainings and partnership with public TVET Colleges in Shire and Mai-Tsebri Towns, Tigray, Ethiopia, MEGEN Power (MGP) Ltd, 2020.

- 3. The two-pronged strategy, as indicated in the Approach to Inclusive Market Systems (AIMS), should be adopted to strengthen local host community market systems and value chains (pull) and simultaneously prepare refugees and host communities to seize the economic opportunities that ensue from better functioning local value chains (push).
- **4. Upgrading technical, entrepreneurial and managerial skills** using the TVET education system will increase the soft and hard skills lacking in Ethiopia's industrial development, promote job creation and enterprise competitiveness. The industry extension packages designed to promote enterprise productivity and profitability should be mainly carried out by TVET institutes.
- **5.** Data collection, its analysis and utilization should feed into the achievement of Monitoring & Evaluation objectives. QEP has a sophisticated framework that also embeds a learning dimension to further focus on the initial assumptions of the programme. QEP also has a strong monitoring system to track progress of the programme and communicate the success of the initiative to internal stakeholders and external stakeholders (donors, general public, etc.).

NATIONAL RECOMMENDATIONS

- Scale up advocacy for the financial inclusion of refugees; identify and collaborate with financial services providers that could provide access to financial and non-financial services for refugees. Refugees find it difficult to access the legal documentation needed to connect them with financial providers and access capital, and have to rely on foreign funding which is potentially a missed opportunity to capitalise on market expansion and income generation in the national economy.
- Engage with the private sector (both employers and worker representatives) in the design of TVET courses, particularly in curriculum development, counselling and test preparation (CTP), to ensure a responsive and effective skills ecosystem and private sector buy-in. The Jobs Council's subcouncil on skills could act as a coordination platform, soliciting an updating information and involving representatives of employers and of works.
- Extend more fiscal incentives to companies that accept TVET trainees to enhance the engagement of the private sector and the image of TVET, so that companies can see the value of TVET trainees, not just graduates from tertiary education. This policy should be designed with the full participation of other government authorities, such as the Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs and Ministry of Education.
- Expand the spread of TVET centres to reach less densely populated, more remote areas where many refugees live with low connectivity, while continuing to improve the quality of key supply-side interventions. Extend access to students with disabilities and to the Somali, Gambella, Benishangul and Afar administrative regions. Employment services that deliver career counselling, guidance and job matching, and support TVET graduates in job search, could lessen the problem of skills mismatch and graduate unemployment.

- Consider the need for an organization that is dedicated to regularly conduct skills needs assessments of the economy in general and the industrial sector in particular to coordinate education and training to align with the skills needed for a motivated, productive and stable workforce. In the absence of such an organization, production of the right skills and matching with the right jobs becomes difficult and provision of education and training are likely to continue to be supply-driven. Examples of such organizations exist in Singapore and the Republic of South Korea.⁴²
- Clarify roles and responsibilities of each bureau or agency involved or mandated to ensure linkages between TVET and the labour market. Members that could contribute to these linkages are the Urban Job Creation and Food Security Agency, urban development and construction, agriculture and natural resource development, labour and social affairs and TVET bureaus, as well as Mayor of Gambella town, Dean of Openo Polytechnic DON BOSCO, and representatives of agro industry companies or Chamber of Commerce.

SUMMARY TABLE

SUMMARY

A growing consensus that TVET programmes are necessary to enable employment creation is enshrined in policy and Training Proclamation No. <u>954/2016</u>. Refugees who have participated in TVET face difficulties transitioning to decent employment since skills do not always match the market requirements in fields where demand for employees is high such as in garment, construction, mining and energy. The challenge that comes across as the strongest is the lack of access to financial services, because of the demanding requirements and relatively limited involvement of employers in competency standards design for vocational skills that can orient TVET providers when adjusting courses.

⁴² National TVET Policies and Systems in Ethiopia: Current Opportunities and Challenges, Girum Abebe and Tsegay G Tekleselassie, 2018
ACTOR 1 KEY CONTRIBUTIONS

GIZ implements the Qualifications and Employment Perspectives for Refugees and Host Communities in Ethiopia Programme (**QEP**), funded by BMZ.

- More than 280 vocational schoolteachers have taken part in QEP-supported training and more than 14,700 trainees are benefiting from this.
- QEP provides a number of support services to enhance the exchange between employers, refugees and host communities and other national authorities, thus enabling stronger links with local labour markets.
- Within Ethiopia's first Inclusive Vocational College, QEP successfully supports the joint education of refugees and the local population and the integration of refugees into the national education system. This makes QEP a best practice example.

ACTOR 2 KEY CONTRIBUTION

ZOA-led Hope Opportunities for People in Ethiopia (HOPE) and Increasing Job opportunities for Ethiopian and Somali Refugee Youth targeting the youth labour market led to:

- 1. The implementation of specific life skills training for girls and for business.
- 2. A recent partnership with Gebaya, a centre of African software engineers, that opened up the opportunity to provide advanced ITC training to refugees, unlocking new markets and income opportunities.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The main areas of recommendations at the national level and emerging from the analysis relate to:

- 1. Facilitating access of refugees to relevant documentation so that they can use financial services.
- 2. Engaging with private sector in curriculum design and test preparation.
- 3. Incentivizing employers to recruit TVET graduates.
- 4. Expanding TVET services to less densely populated areas and ensure access of vulnerable groups.
- 5. Strengthening skills needs assessment and clarifying roles and responsibilities to ensure linkages between TVET and labour markets.

MOST RELEVANT EMERGING PRACTICE

The QEP presents a number of emerging practices on connecting training providers and local companies. For instance, in Addis Ababa, Shire and Assosa the first Inclusive Employment Promotion Programme strengthened the cooperation between partnering vocational colleges and local companies to facilitate entry-level work experience for graduates of the colleges.





COUNTRY FINDINGS: KENYA

KENYA CONTEXT

REFUGEE ENVIRONMENT AND LEGAL FRAMEWORK

According to <u>UNHCR</u>, Kenya currently hosts roughly 475,00 refugees, one of the largest refugee populations in Africa. Most of the country's refugees come from Somalia (54.5 percent) and South Sudan (24.4 percent). Of Kenya's refugee population, approximately 210,000 live in Dadaab Refugee Camp, while approximately 190,000 live in Kakuma Refugee Camp (UNHCR, 2019). There is also a population of approximately 74,000 urban refugees in Kenya, the majority of whom live in Nairobi (UNHCR, 2019). Asylum seekers comprise another 50,000 individuals to the total count of people of concern in Kenya. Currently, refugees are only registered in the camps and are supposed to stay within them, especially if they require support from UNHCR and other partners.

GOVERNANCE STRUCTURE FOR TVET

The Government of Kenya created one ad-hoc authority (TVETA) the scope of which is explained in the <u>government's strategic plan</u> issued in 2018. TVETA registers and accredits TVET institutions and trainers, both public and private, along with overall oversight over TVET institutes. Currently, TVETA's financial resources are below what is required but the target is to reach approximately 500 million Kenyan Shilling (\$4.54 million) for its operations with contribution increases every year. According to TVETA's most recent estimates from 2020, there are 1,120 VTCs in the 47 Counties with a total enrolment of 128,947. The consolidated number of instructors in all the 47 Counties is 3,872. The Authority has so far accredited 1,829 trainers, as per August 2020 estimates.⁴³

Present curriculum reform seeks to improve the time spent by learners and TVET trainers in working environments by offering public TVET provision assured by TVETA and by the Curriculum Development, Assessment and Qualification Council (CDACC). CDACC establishes competence-based curricula along with methods of assessment, evaluation and qualification, some of which are already being piloted in technical and vocational colleges (VTCs). The Ministry of Education acts as a facilitator of curriculum development, and assurance of quality of curriculum implementation. The National Industrial Training Authority (NITA) accredits companies and in-company trainers as training suppliers in the industrial skills formation system and is in charge of curriculum development, assessment and certification.⁴⁴ The Kenya National Qualifications Authority (KNQA), set up in 2015, is meant to coordinate and harmonize education, training, assessment and quality assurance of all qualifications awarded in the country with a view to improving quality and international comparability.

⁴³ https://www.tveta.go.ke/wp-content/uploads/2020/08/TVETA-NEWSLETTER-ISSUE-2-min.pdf

⁴⁴ State of Skills, ILO, 2019.

INCLUSION OF REFUGEES

Kenya's policy of encampment persists and prohibits registered refugees in the camps from formally travelling to other parts of Kenya, unless they are in possession of special permission issued by the Refugee Affairs Secretariat (RAS) for reasons such as medical appointments and scholarships outside the refugee camps in Dadaab Complex. Refugees caught travelling outside camps without the proper documents are subject to a fine of 20,000 Kenyan Shilling or six months in prison. Refugees still struggle to open bank accounts, access loans to open up businesses, and access cell phones legally (obtaining an officially registered SIM card requires Kenyan ID). At the same time, Kenya has expressed an interest in closing individual camps (especially Dadaab), most recently in March 2021. UNHCR is currently awaiting feedback from the government on a roadmap to close the camps.

However, Kenya has already taken significant steps towards more opportunities for inclusion of refugees. The Kenyan Government has committed itself to the Nairobi Declaration and the Kampala Declaration as well as to the obligations arising from them, which could also make it possible to grant refugees freedom of movement and a work permit in the future. In 2019, a new Refugees Bill was presented, but has not yet been passed. A review of the education policy and health policy, and the 2020 Huduma Bill offering digital ID cards, take up the refugees' concerns. Moreover, specific development programmes such as the Kalobeyei Integrated Socio-Economic Development Plan in Turkana West (KISEDP) and Garissa Integrated Social Economic Development Plan (GISEDP) already follow GCR-principles such as perspectives for a self-determined and independent life and an integrated service delivery approach for refugees and host communities. Refugees were also included in County Integration Development Plans, as well as the United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) for Kenya. In 2020, the CRRF action plan was adopted.

Interviews conducted with county government officials in 2018 reiterate a constructive view of refugees' contribution to the local economy. One official from UNHCR further reinforced this view, sharing the fact that the county government is more inclusive of refugees than the national government, and viewing refugees as a resource in Garissa and Turkana counties.⁴⁵ There are also emerging ways, through a partnership with World Food Programme for example, for refugees to procure goods by being contracted as traders. This agreement was activated by the government and could serve as a possible model for the construction of potential movement permits and policies, as the government rather than other entities would take the initiative to fix movement and mobility limitations.

MARKET STRUCTURE

The Kenyan Government, faced with a growing population combined with high unemployment and unmet skills demands, has chosen to expand the country's education and training system. In Kenya, an estimated 40 percent of young people learn vocational

45 Ibid.

skills through this type of training, and the figure has increased over the years.⁴⁶ According to a recent TVETA newsletter,⁴⁷ skills shortages have been identified in construction and crafts, machine operation and assembly, clerical work and sales.⁴⁸

A recent study by ILO and UNHCR indicates that refugees in Dadaab (98 percent of Somali origin) share a common language, religion, and culture, and there is a sense of kinship and homogeneity with host communities.⁴⁹ Market exchanges between refugees and host communities are common, and some refugees are informally employed by host community members to look after their livestock in Dadaab. A similar account can be told about Kakuma, with a market potential of an estimated \$56 million in Turkana's economy.⁵⁰ The value chain areas with the potential to grow market exchanges in Dadaab are waste management, recycling and livestock.⁵¹ Yet, restrictions on mobility severely limit refugees' ability to effectively run their own businesses in cost effective ways.⁵² For example, the young people in Kakuma are reported to be over-reliant on their families and more vulnerable to illegal income generation.⁵³

Despite the restrictions, informal lines of credit and community-based savings and credit schemes, including Village Savings and Loan Associations (VSLA), are common amongst refugees in Dadaab and in other areas and are being supported by UNHCR. VSLAs have become go-to finance mechanisms as a means for them to accumulate savings which can be used as capital for business start-up. Where formal structures such as banks are inaccessible, or theoretically accessible but not adapted to the cultural, legal, or practical needs of refugees, VSLAs serve as effective informal financial service models. In addition, registered refugees are served by Equity Bank and Kenya Commercial Bank (KCB) (in partnership with UNHCR) that are providing bank accounts to all refugee households.

COVID-19 AND ITS IMPACT ON TVET

The Cabinet Secretary for Education, Prof. George Magoha, held a consultative meeting with stakeholders from universities, TVET colleges and Teacher Training Colleges (TTCs) on 30 July 2020 that reached consensus to re-open the tertiary learning institutions in January 2021. The Kenyan government has also developed a blended TVET strategy which includes

- 47 TVETA newsletter, August 2020
- 48 TVETA newsletter, August 2020
- 49 Doing business in Dadaab: Market Systems Analysis for Local Economic Development, UNHCR and ILO, 2019
- 50 Kakuma as a market place, IFC, 2018
- 51 Labor market scan report for technical, vocational and occupational skills training for refugees and host communities in Kakuma refugee camp and Kalobeyei settlement scheme in Turkana county, GIZ, 2020
- 52 Doing business in Dadaab: Market Systems Analysis for Local Economic Development, UNHCR and ILO, 2019
- 53 Labour market scan report for technical, vocational and occupational skills training for refugees and host communities in Kakuma refugee camp and Kalobeyei settlement scheme in Turkana county, GIZ, 2020

⁴⁶ State of Skills, ILO, 2019

nationalizing the learning management system of the Kenya Technical Trainers College, national TVET teacher training in online learning and central hosting of online courses for national TVET qualifications.⁵⁴

Some implementing partners reported that TVET programmes needing hands-on practice sessions seem to be struggling to fit the requirements of distance learning. On the other hand, the Regional Centre for Mapping of Resources for Development (RCMRD) reported that digital skills courses have weathered the storm with the introduction of e-learning⁵⁵ tools applied to specific modules like Geographical Information System (GIS) and the International Computer Driving License (ICDL), a world leading computer certification that takes three months. These examples indicate how digital competencies remain in high demand and can still expand through blended/remote approaches in a restricted environment that can also be offered for free (Coursera).

TVET PROGRAMMES AND ACTORS IN KENYA

FEATURED ACTORS AND PROGRAMMES: REFUGEE EMPLOYMENT AND SKILLS INITIATIVE (RESI)

AGENCY	Norwegian Refugee Council (NRC) and International Trade Centre (ITC) (with support of GIZ in Kakuma)
FUNDER	Government of Netherlands
TIMELINE	2017 — 2020
TARGET	150 people recruited

INTRODUCTION

The Refugee Employment and Skills Initiative (RESI) implemented by the Norwegian Refugee Council (NRC) has applied a creative trade-led and market-based strategy of the International Trade Centre (ITC) to protracted displacement contexts. In 2017, RESI first introduced its special and customized approach to the refugee camp of Dadaab. The project was extended to Kakuma in 2018 and expanded operations to neighbouring countries in East Africa in 2019. The TVET model implemented follows the approach articulated in the following eight aspects: community engagement, admission, technical training in technical skills, apprenticeship, MSME formation, technical mentorship and coaching, examination and graduation, and employment.

MARKET ORIENTATION

RESI provides online freelancing in recognition of a growing market-orientation of programmes that need to enable learners to find work no matter the venue. A constant internet connection, computer access, the right skills and motivation are the only 54 https://www.thecommonwealth.io/wp-content/uploads/2020/07/StrategiesforblendedTVETCOVID19.pdf requirements: The online freelancing sector provides a medium through which refugees can 55 https://rcmrd.org/weathering-the-storm-in-tvet-training-amidst-covid-19 earn income through self-employment, given the contextual challenges facing refugees in Kenya. RESI trained 100 participants chosen competitively and offered an extended period of mentorship and coaching, enabling trainees to apply their newly developed skill sets to understand the markets and get their first interviews and jobs. Via leading freelance platforms, RESI supports the connection to international customers. In the design field, demand for artisanal products is high; customers are searching for a handmade touch, whether in fashion or home décor.

SUPPORT SERVICES

RESI helped the creation of the first market linkages, and mentorship through a team of RESI experts, guiding the community to apply newly acquired business expertise. RESI experts acted as mentors to guide 48 women and two men in the artisanal company Nyota Farsamo.⁵⁶ RESI activities also included a number of training opportunities for refugees in Dadaab consisting of intensive courses focused on upgrading technical skills to operate online. At the end of these sessions, online freelancers reported to have learned how to upload their profiles on online platforms and start bidding for work. Post-training, the online freelancers accessed three months of mentorship and coaching to assist them in applying the knowledge learnt and actively start to working online.

ACCREDITATION

At the end of the project, an assessment of the learning progress is done through the national trade test certification. The participants passing the final exam will obtain an accredited certificate.

TEACHERS' QUALIFICATIONS

Following a competitive skills assessment, RESI picked 5 groups of 10 artisans for the programme and delivered training of trainers (TOTs) learning process. Trainers then share their newly acquired knowledge and production methodology to subsequent groups of artisans – activating a self-sustaining loop of exchange and sharing of learning within trades. Another example of professionalized artisans relates to the adaptations within the Kenyan social enterprises Tosheka Textiles and Master Artisans based in Isiolo. The introduction of contemporary art décor opened new markets and RESI-trained artisans to work professionally with clients and transfer skill sets in entry jobs.

LIFE/CORE SKILLS

In Kakuma, RESI aimed to invest in business growth and inclusive and self-sustaining market development for online freelancing. Results from the ITC have shown that many Kakuma refugees already have innovative digital skills, such as journalism, photography and film editing. However, there was no initial knowledge of how to market these services and grow a business. In order to counter this, the project facilitated access to online freelancing opportunities targeted to the mid-level creative sector talent present in Kakuma. For example, in the home décor component of RESI, Somali refugees and Kenyan artisans have

⁵⁶ The Refugee Employment and Skills Initiative in Kenya, Rebuilding lives through trade: Unlocking market opportunities for refugees and their hosts, NRC and RESI, 2019

received training to upgrade their skills and to expand their product repertoire based on current market trends and aesthetics. This product line facilitates market access in expansion and, ultimately, income generation.

TECHNOLOGY, INNOVATION AND NEW SECTORS

RESI activated a partnership with the online marketplace GrowthBond, which brought an online learn & earn platform to Kakuma to upskill refugees and host community members in using the much in-demand sector of digital marketing to secure jobs. The platform allowed new freelancers to test their skills by working with local companies on small projects. Over 170 interview requests for potential online jobs were received by online freelancers in just one month after launch.

NRC and ITC also significantly contributed to the infrastructural and equipment necessities of the RESI programme. Fast speed internet, computers and co-working spaces were ensured in all centres used for implementation. Connections to national and international markets were also facilitated by developing relationships with prominent online business process outsourcing platforms, such as Upwork, one of the largest online platforms for selling digital skills in the industry (396 proposals were submitted on Upwork by Kakuma freelancers by 2019).



© Finn Church Aid / Hugh Rutherford

BRIDGING TO THE LABOUR MARKET

RESI has provided trade-led and market-based solutions to foster income-generating opportunities for refugees and their hosts, helping to build self-reliance and foster economic resilience. RESI has tailored its activities with targeted private and public partnerships, building strong market connections, and taking capacity building to the next level through relevant network connections, coaching and mentorship. With this approach, RESI ensures newly acquired skill sets translate into actual income gains.

In the online freelancing and home décor industries, the RESI Dadaab project has created job opportunities for women and young people.⁵⁷ Through tailored preparation, the project has encouraged refugees and host community members to learn economically viable skills and then supported them to join relevant value chains.

FEATURED ACTORS AND PROGRAMMES: YOUTH EDUCATION PACK PROGRAMME



INTRODUCTION

The Norwegian Refugee Council (NRC) through its Youth Education Programme (YEP) has been offering vocational training on various skills in both short and long courses since 2008 in Dadaab refugee camps. YEP is a one-year programme of basic education and training for young people between the ages of 15 and 24 who have little to no formal education. Over the years, through the NITA programme and qualification, NRC has educated young people in different literacy and numeracy skills and provided them with start-up kits for the various skills taken up, thus minimising active recruitment in the camp area by the militias. The goal of the NRC was to reach more young people with relevant professional and life skills, teaching a curriculum that would be relevant in Dadaab or if they return home.

MARKET ORIENTATION

Interviews with the vocational training providers involved in the YEP programme in Dadaab revealed that the place of origin has a great influence on the type of vocational skills preferred by the young people.⁵⁸ The assessment conducted in 2014 found a mismatch

58 Assessment of Youth Education Pack (YEP) Program in Dadaab & its relevant replicability in Somalia, Infoscope Consulting Ltd, 2014

⁵⁷ Ibid.

with the demand for employable skills. From the tracer's assessment conducted in 2019, with almost 1,000 TVET graduates, the skills that have been acquired by the majority of YEP graduates (21 percent) were in tailoring and dress-making while 16 percent had studied Computer Secretarial. Generally, there was a high retention rate for the learners since almost all the respondents (99.7 percent) reported having completed their training successfully.⁵⁹

SUPPORT SERVICES

From the assessment conducted in 2014, it emerges that in the past young people were often asked to make decisions or be placed into a TVET programme without sufficient information about how training will translate into a post-training livelihood.⁶⁰ While encouraging young people to decide seems to be consistent with a rights-based approach pursued by NRC, adequate knowledge, resources and support are required to make an informed decision and should also be provided to young people.⁶¹ The evaluation of the YEP programme reinforced the importance of boosting career guidance that avoids the reinforcement of existing bias by focusing on the capabilities of each trainee as an individual.

ACCREDITATION

NRC has a training, assessment and certification agreement with NITA, CDACC, CSK and NENAP. The assessment in 2014 revealed that YEP also adopted a uniform curriculum for all the TVET skills courses offered in the Dadaab YEP project. YEP, offers a one-year intensive academic programme where attendance is mandatory and students eventually sit for exams with professional institutions. However, a recent tracer study in 2019 found that 26 percent of the graduates from YEP did not receive a completion certificate.⁶² A reason was not provided on why such low rates occur.

TEACHERS' QUALIFICATIONS

Although YEP graduates were largely satisfied with the competence of the trainers, graduates lamented that there were too few trainers.⁶³ This finding highlights a lack of incentive structure for trainers at VTCs to attract and retain qualified trainers. One option proposed would be increased provision and retention of qualified trainers and the implementation of employment promotion to improve rural livelihoods. This is an important reflection since the tracer study confirmed that the quality of skills acquired is dependent on the capacity of the trainee and the quality of the trainers/craftsmen that provide the training.

- 61 Ibid.
- 62 TVET Mapping Report, NRC- Dadaab Field Office, May 2019
- 63 Tracer Study on Youth Education Pack (YEP) Programme Graduates in Dadaab Refugee Camps and secondary data analysis of relevant skills for specific areas of return in Somalia, NRC, 2017

⁵⁹ TVET Mapping Report, NRC- Dadaab Field Office, May 2019

⁶⁰ Ibid.

LIFE/CORE SKILLS

NRC's TVET approach and focus integrates skills training in the classroom with on-the-job training and apprenticeships. In addition, NRC has integrated life skills and mentorship courses along with functional literacy and numeracy within its curricula. NRC also provides four digital skill tracks. These tracks are implemented by starting from training and skills upgrading, which are combined to link with global markets through Upwork and other platforms. According to a KII from NRC, 83 people have already completed these courses and this number is expected to reach 300 by 2022. The delivery approach of YEP trainings in Dadaab was found to be predominantly IBT (Institutional based training). This means the delivery model is through full-time training in established VTCs, some of which require lot of resources. In addition to being more cost-effective, the Enterprise Based Training (EBT) seems preferred because it is more flexible and tailor-made to address the various needs of participants and employers.⁶⁴

TECHNOLOGY, INNOVATION AND NEW SECTORS

The learning environment in the YEP training centres was found to be generally satisfactory, but some gaps in the learning equipment were found especially in the ICT/computerized secretarial classes. Recreational facilities were found absent and non-gender sensitive up to 2017 in Dadaab.⁶⁵

YEP also provided a number of training opportunities related to green jobs. For example, a handful of young refugees were trained to provide support in solar PV installations and marketing for household, commercial, and institutional use up. In particular, technical assistance in this sector is intended to activate existing middle-range solar home system markets and expand service to other applications, such as smaller systems accessible to a poorer market segment and community applications. Another course that has been offered through YEP is on energy efficient cook stoves.⁶⁶

GENDER EQUALITY

The cultural dynamics that undermine the position of Somali woman in their communities include low value for education among girls, and forced and early marriages. As a consequence, there were often gender stereotypes in the community serving to further entrench professional and income differentials along gender lines.⁶⁷ Additional factors reported to be contributing to low enrolment and completion rates by girls in YEP

67 Ibid.

⁶⁴ Assessment of Youth Education Pack (YEP) Programme in Dadaab & its relevant replicability in Somalia, Infoscope Consulting Ltd, 2014

⁶⁵ Tracer Study on Youth Education Pack (YEP) Programme Graduates in Dadaab Refugee Camps and Secondary Data Analysis of relevant skills for specific areas of return in Somalia, NRC, 2017

⁶⁶ Assessment of Youth Education Pack (YEP) Program in Dadaab & its relevant replicability in Somalia, Infoscope Consulting Ltd., 2014

programmes included: unplanned/unintended pregnancies, security challenges associated with the distance to the YEP centre and lack of social protection and health care measures in the camps.⁶⁸

The most relevant adaptations to the programme were: 1) provision of supportive learning materials, sanitary pads and baby minders;⁶⁹ 2) childcare while they attended the YEP training and 3) provision of food items such as sugar. Yet, no specific project activity focused on the normative issues driving unequal access was reported. In terms of wider inclusiveness, 6.1 percent of graduates interviewed were living with disabilities which is well below the national prevalence of disability among children and young people in Kenya (13.5 percent). In 2017, YEP was found without a detailed strategy to meet the educational needs of people with disabilities (PLWDs).

BRIDGING TO THE LABOUR MARKET

The current government policy is that refugees are not allowed to work in Kenya, and can only be hired by agencies as 'incentive workers', for a fraction of the salary that a Kenyan national would receive in the same position. On the other hand, refugees in Dadaab were also found to have the intention to strengthen ties with Somalia to pursue their economic activities to overcome national limitations.⁷⁰ To address this barrier, YEP piloted a coach programme for young people with established traders and business people operating both in Dadaab town and within the camps to ease mobility.

Given some of these barriers, the employment rate among the YEP graduates interviewed in 2017 was relatively low: 33 percent found a job and only 16 percent were working in the primary field of training.⁷¹ Yet a more recent tracer study conducted in 2019 with 913 past graduates (74 percent respondents from Somalia and 68 percent male) from Dadaab camps and host communities found a much better trend. Over half (61 percent) of the interviewed respondents reported that they were currently working, mostly as self-employed individuals (83 percent of all respondents with employment). This is an indication that young graduates have found more opportunities over time while also confirming that wage employment opportunities remain limited at best.

⁶⁸ Tracer Study on Youth Education Pack (YEP) Programme Graduates in Dadaab Refugee Camps and Secondary Data Analysis of relevant skills for specific reas of return in Somalia, NRC, 2017

⁶⁹ Ibid.

⁷⁰ Assessment of Youth Education Pack (YEP) Program in Dadaab & its relevant replicability in Somalia, Infoscope Consulting Ltd., 2014

⁷¹ Tracer Study on Youth Education Pack (YEP) Programme Graduates in Dadaab Refugee Camps and Secondary Data Analysis of relevant skills for specific areas of return in Somalia, NRC, 2017

INTRODUCTION

On behalf of the Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ), the GIZ Kenya cluster *Displacement and Migration* is working with a range of partners, including government and UN agencies, local and international non-governmental organizations and the private sector, on multiple projects. The aim is to improve living conditions for refugees and host communities in Kakuma, Turkana County. Priority areas are technical vocational training, entrepreneurship, agri-nutrition, conflict management, water and sanitation, sport and energy. The projects illustrated in the study show a limited set of activities implemented by the cluster in Kakuma.

Another relevant initiative was implemented with <u>Pamoja for Transformation</u> (P4T) as part of the Support to Refugees and Host Communities in Kenya project. It aimed to equip both communities in Kakuma with entrepreneurial skills, focusing on young people and women to enable them to grow and expand their businesses. Phase one ran from August 2019 to September 2020. Of the 246 participants, 180 graduated successfully (i.e. they attended sessions regularly and implemented recommendations during coaching sessions). Out of these, 130 particularly well-performing entrepreneurs received small grants to start up and/or scale up their businesses. During the evaluation, 71 percent of respondents were confirmed to have expanded their businesses as a result of the project, and 64 percent were confirmed to be generating more income. As a result of this success, the initiative was extended to March 2022.

MARKET ORIENTATION

All GIZ interventions are based on market assessments in which opportunities and capacities are taken into account to design target group-specific measures. Various assessment methods are applied to identify training needs: 1) desk review; 2) scoping visits to understand the profile of micro and small enterprises (MSEs); 3) in-depth needs assessment and visionary interviews, and surveys with a sample of target participants; 4) focus group discussions with various selected participants and key stakeholders and 5) a pre- and post-training survey to establish skill levels of the selected MSEs. Participants are mobilized and enrolled involving local government officials, community-based organizations (CBOs), a network of youth organizations, youth and community leaders and religious gatherings.

SUPPORT SERVICES

A tailored and flexible skills and business development model that includes business and finance training, life skills training, savings, coaching and creating market access is the central offer of projects implemented by GIZ in this assessment. The training boosts the self-confidence of the target groups, which is needed to run sustainable, income-earning businesses, through workplace coaching and mentoring. The coaching and mentorship sessions are crucial to filling capability gaps and helping the mostly novice micro, small and medium-sized company owners. These women and men can benefit from these sessions to overcome challenges in setting up and managing MSEs.

ACCREDITATION

Wherever possible, courses supported by GIZ in Kenya are accredited. There is a clear link with the institutional authority in charge of verifying that various types of technical training and curricula match the requirements.

TEACHERS' QUALIFICATIONS

There are Capacity Development and Training of Trainers measures involving representatives from host and refugee communities. They become business coaches and mentors and will continue to support the MSEs after the project ends. These representatives are offered training as part of their professional development so they can become experienced and commit to keep accompanying MSEs through coaching and mentoring cycles.

LIFE/CORE SKILLS

GIZ engagement is directed towards strengthening business, entrepreneurship and financial management training designed around competency-based learning experiences, including peer-to-peer learning, best-practice analyses, lectures and group discussion. Entrepreneurship skills consist of basics of business, entrepreneurship and financial management skills like book keeping and business planning. Life skills are part of the training.

GENDER EQUALITY

Gender equality in GIZ interventions is informed by a dedicated gender analysis conducted in 2017/18. There is a deliberate effort to ensure the inclusion of at least 30 percent of women participants, as for all other GIZ projects. At the design stage the challenges hindering women from engaging in MSEs and implemented measures were mentioned as an explicit assessment objective. To further increase the participation of mothers, GIZ provides childcare services, transport, meals and/or stipends on a needs basis.

BRIDGING TO THE LABOUR MARKET

GIZ consolidates linkages between refugees and the host community with other organizations such as producers, financial institutions, entrepreneurs and formal training institutions to increase socioeconomic opportunities.

In addition, the same initiative issued business tool kits. They were distributed to 130 MSEs based on recommendations during the coaching/mentoring phase which followed the training.

CONCLUSIONS

EMERGING PRACTICES

- Promoting TVET graduates to become instructors themselves has proved successful, as the Youth Education programme (YEP) shows. Several graduates received higher-level training from the North Eastern Province Technical Training Institute within YEP and were recruited into the training centres as instructors.
- Booster/motivation incentives such as baby minders and promotion of attendance to completion of training have a significant effect on poor and vulnerable mothers in the camps.
- Retention in and completion of TVET courses in Kenya is encouraged by a combination of pre- and post-training activities, such as career counselling/guidance and apprenticeship.

NATIONAL RECOMMENDATIONS

- Consider feedback from refugees on how to improve TVET programmes. In internal assessments conducted by TVET partners in Kenya, some graduates suggested that longer TVET tracks could be introduced to build expertise in skills that are in high demand (digital and non-digital), and indicated a desire to receive more market information about job opportunities in the camps. Graduates acknowledged that the skills offered are important for a better standard of living, enhancing their livelihoods and that of their households.
- Improve linkages between opportunities for refugees at TVET providers and current labour demand. Thorough market scans (including value chains) can inform TVET providers about market demands and serve to develop targeted training, taking into consideration market saturation. For example, the waste management industry, including recycling, is an immediate market opportunity. Developing training to meet current market demands might lead to a more flexible TVET offer with smaller cohorts and more diverse training courses. This could include the upskilling and reskilling of people in promising sectors.
- Implementing partners should incorporate entrepreneurship instructors and modules specifically for self-employment tracks, since refugees are conditioned to choose self-entrepreneurial models of work to survive. Courses should include the development of savings schemes, financial management skills and basic business development. Start-up tool kits should be linked with financial services providers to sustain promising business ideas, for example, by working closely with Equity Bank and similar actors to develop relevant products and services that integrate starter kits with proper mentorship/coaching.



William at his industrial attachment in Kenya $\ensuremath{\mathbb C}$ ILO / Translieu / Nyaberi

- Ensure that local institutions promote CRRF/GCR initiatives that benefit both refugee and host communities. Limited mobility and constraints in accessing land remain major impediments to the effective labour market integration (for instance in Garissa county). Linkages with communities can also be spurred through new and existing initiatives such as MIT's D-Lab. Another linkage could be created by promoting land sharing to companies that employ both refugee and host communities in order to meaningfully engage in existing and new markets such as in the green economy.
- Consider labour market needs in the country of origin within the development and provision of training courses since many refugees still hold economic relationships with their communities of origin. This can support reintegration upon voluntary return (for example in South Central Somalia), and can ensure that the recruitment of future beneficiaries is matched with TVET skills in demand in their potential areas of repatriation.⁷²

SUMMARY TABLE

SUMMARY

In Kenya, TVET programmes are gaining significant traction among government stakeholders, with over 120,000 individuals (including refugees) enrolled in TVET in 2020 according to the government agency TVETA. Despite this, there are still significant legal restrictions in relation to encampment policies, access to finance and work permits preventing cross-border mobility where economic exchanges can take place. There are sectors in the camps where refugees could benefit from TVET immediately, e.g. waste management, water management and cultivation practices. Outside the camps, the care economy and digital skills can offer entry points.

⁷² Doing business in Dadaab: Market Systems Analysis for Local Economic Development, UNHCR and ILO, 2019

ACTOR 1 KEY CONTRIBUTIONS

One of the projects selected for the study is <u>Refugee Employment</u> and Skills Initiative, which represents a very innovative approach to TVET.

- ITC partnership with Norwegian Refugee Council (NRC) came across as a strong partnership given its presence in the field.
- RESI's innovative approach to digital and information literacy in relation to new sectors have led to successful employment a lot faster than other programmes.

ACTOR 2 KEY CONTRIBUTIONS

Another relevant project that is featured in Kenya is the Youth Education Programme (YEP) implemented by NRC since 2008 in Dadaab refugee camps and other locations. Over the years, NRC has

- Educated over 6,000 young people in different skills and provided them with start-up kits for the various skills taken up.
- 2. Increased employment: a tracer study conducted in 2019 with 913 past graduates in Dadaab camps found that over half (61 percent) of the participants reported that they were employed.

ACTOR 3 KEY CONTRIBUTIONS

GIZ implements several activities in refugee settings. For example, one initiative focuses on strengthening entrepreneurial skills of refugees and host communities in Kakuma.

This initiative has enabled:

- Increased employment: 71 percent of participating micro and small enterprises expanded their business while 64 percent increased their income.
- Linking refugee and host community enterprises increased social cohesion.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The main areas of recommendations at the national level emerging from the analysis relate to:

- 1. increasing skills pathways for certain skill areas in high demand.
- 2. favouring sectors in high demand within the camps, including water/waste management.
- **3.** including courses on entrepreneurship and self-employment, and easing requirements to access financial services.
- 4. facilitating mobility from the camps to access market opportunities.
- 5. strengthening linkages between markets in host communities and countries of origin.

MOST RELEVANT EMERGING PRACTICE

On access to capital, an emerging practice implemented by GIZ is to provide startup kits and capital to participants based on performance, together with coaching and mentoring so that capital invested turns into a sustainable income.



Tailoring graduate Butros selling dresses to her neighbours, Rwamwanja, Uganda © Finn Church Aid / Hugh Rutherford



COUNTRY FINDINGS: UGANDA

UGANDA CONTEXT

REFUGEE ENVIRONMENT AND LEGAL FRAMEWORK

With a population of 44 million,⁷³ Uganda has one of the fastest growing populations in Africa and the second youngest population in the world. The country hosts the largest refugee population in Africa at 1.4 million, in particular 838,323 refugees from South Sudan and 365,883 from the Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC) with more from other East African countries.⁷⁴ It is the fourth largest hosting country in the world. In Uganda, most of the refugees are from South Sudan, the DRC, Burundi, Somalia, and Rwanda. The bulk of refugees remain in designated refugee settlements in 11 districts: Northern and Western districts in the North and West Nile regions, and in Kampala.

Uganda is implementing one of the most progressive refugee policies in the world. First with the Refugee Act (2006) and then with the 2010 Refugee Regulations, the country guarantees refugees fundamental rights and integration, including the right to participate in gainful employment, freedom of movement and right to property. In this scenario, refugees can also benefit from social services provided by the Government of Uganda, including health care and education.⁷⁵ At national level, services provided to refugees are delivered through a governance structure built upon two levels: one of coordination and one of delivery. The Office of the Prime Minister (OPM) is responsible for coordinating and managing the influx of refugees while the planning and delivery of basic services is in the hands of local governments at the district level.

- 74 Ibid.
- 75 See latest Prospect file for Uganda: <u>https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/</u> --dgreports/---ddg_p/documents/publication/wcms_740578.pdf



Tailoring graduate Butros © Finn Church Aid / Hugh Rutherford

⁷³ Country - Uganda. data2.unhcr.org

GOVERNANCE STRUCTURE FOR TVET

To coordinate and facilitate refugees' integration, the Djibouti Declaration in 2017 established minimum regional standards in the field of education. In Uganda, the Business, Technical, Vocational Education and Training (BTVET) system is under the authority of the Ministry of Education and Sports (MoES). In the past, major national TVET policies have been promoted, including the 2008 TVET Act, which provides the TVET institutional and legal framework and the Strategic Plan 2011-2020 *Skilling Uganda* that sets up guidelines to create employable skills and competencies relevant to the labour market, as well as to integrate non-formal TVET into the public TVET portfolio. Uganda continues to refer to Ethiopian and Kenyan qualification systems, suggesting that it might be possible to pursue regional skills and frameworks. The Technical and Vocational Education and Training Policy (MoES, 2019) is guiding through the new framework and guidelines for the future. The policy is an effort to modernize and align Uganda TVET to the East African regional qualification framework for higher education,⁷⁶ which includes TVET qualifications.

Specifically, the post primary sub-sector contains several educational paths: secondary education, business, technical, vocational education and training (BTVET) and non-formal education (NFE). The formal TVET system, integrated in the compulsory educational pathway (up to the secondary level), is composed of a threefold structure, which follows the seven years of primary education. At the higher level, A level leavers are eligible to enrol in various technical courses leading to Ordinary Diploma (two years) and Higher Diploma (two years) certified by universities. Non-formal TVET in Uganda is provided by a wide variety of actors, including national training institutes, non-governmental organizations, the historical artisans, private institutes and training within firms. Non-formal programmes may increase skills and employability, but do not necessarily certify the education received. The informal sector accounts for 75 percent of total employment,⁷⁷ and people acquire skills in informal enterprises, by means of informal apprenticeship, or through relatives and friends. There are currently no interventions aiming to upgrade informal apprenticeship in Uganda.

The informal TVET includes learning resulting from daily life activities, while the workbased learning can be associated with the transmission of relevant skills from experienced craftspeople to learners (informal apprenticeship).

The certification, accreditation and curricula development environment in Uganda is a compound of entities. The Uganda Business and Technical Examinations Board (UBTEB) regulates, coordinates and conducts national examinations and awards Certificates and Diplomas on TVET through the Uganda Certificate of Education (UCE). According to UBTEB's most recent estimates from 2019, there were 556 TVET Institutions with 80,000 TVET candidates enrolled countrywide. The Directorate of Industrial Training (DIT), which is the secretariat of the Industrial Training Board (ITB), has the core responsibility of developing occupational standards, regulating work-based training schemes, applying and expanding the Uganda Vocational Qualifications Framework, accrediting assessment centres, and

77 Ibid.

⁷⁶ https://www.knqa.go.ke/wp-content/uploads/2019/05/East-Africa-Qf.pdf

assessing and awarding Uganda Vocational Qualifications as provided for in the BTVET Act of 2008.⁷⁸ The new TVET policy (2019) restricts the function of the DIT to include regulating industrial training and trainers; developing industrial training curricula; harmonising curricula and certificates of competence; assessing industrial training; development of occupational standards and Assessment and Training Packages (ATPs) for trade testing for the industry and world of work, and awarding certificates in that respect. The new TVET policy also proposes a governance structure which comprises a TVET directorate (in the MoES), a TVET council and a TVET assessment body. The TVET assessment body will streamline all quality assurance bodies currently in existence except for the health training institutions, which will remain under the regulations of the health professional assessment board. All the reforms proposed in the new policy are not yet completed, therefore old institutions and some of their functions still exist.

According to stakeholders, the general perception on TVET is negative. TVET is conceptually stigmatized and considered a lower-level educational path.⁷⁹ Advocacy actions have been conducted with refugees' groups, including follow-up meetings with parents of trainees, stressing the value of preparation and calling for parental help to enable trainees to complete their training. When delivering TVET initiatives to refugees, prior qualification recognition also represents a fundamental issue. Prior recognition on learning is complicated as documentation challenges pose a barrier to sitting exams (since refugees cannot attend exams without a valid refugee ID) and transitioning to secondary education (as students need to produce their primary leaving certificate, which they may not have with them).

TVET teachers' quality, as well as career guidance for TVET trainees, are also areas of concern. Several stakeholders confirmed that connections to the labour market and career guidance are missing. Most TVET teachers and trainers have a pedagogical background instead of practical experience. Initiatives to training under- or unqualified TVET teachers to be able to improve teaching competencies for hands-on training, such as those provided through the Vocational Training Institute (VTI)⁸⁰ of Nakawa, the Uganda Association of Private Vocational Institutions (UGAPRIVI) and the Instructor, Technical Teacher Education and Training (TIET) department in the MoES, aim to address the situation.

INCLUSION OF REFUGEES

The social and economic rights of refugees are outlined in Uganda's Refugee Act (2006) and the Refugee Regulations (2010). In addition, the social inclusion of refugees runs through the National Development Plan II (NDPII, 2015/16–2019/20) and in particular the Settlement Transformative Agenda (STA), through which refugees are considered as a resource to support communities' premises for the development of markets.

⁷⁸ https://dituganda.org/

⁷⁹ Mastercard foundation- A bridge to the future page 20

⁸⁰ http://www.TVET-uganda.org/training-provider/homepages/nakawa-vocational-training-institute/view

The NDP II includes a Settlement Transformative Agenda (STA) to encourage the transformation and development of refugee-hosting settlements in a spirit of mutual change and collaboration with host communities to spur development-oriented initiatives. The Comprehensive Refugee Response Framework (CRRF), produced in 2017 and updated in 2019, encompasses the 2006 Refugee Act, and 2010 Refugee Regulations, and is seeking a multi-stakeholder approach aiming to stimulate the creation of common solutions, which target refugees and host communities.

In Uganda, refugees are targeted in line with the REHOPE⁸¹ strategy, which considers a balance sharing of 70-30 between refugees and host communities. Despite this directive, the inclusion of refugees does not always follow this guideline. Generally, according to interviewed stakeholders, between 30 and 45 percent of refugees participate in TVET programmes. This is due to several factors like language barriers, inclusive environments and geographical limitations to reach TVET centres. To access training, refugees have the opportunity to get scholarships, or they might be able to pay for training with the support of ad hoc financial services and support from development partners or NGOs etc.

MARKET STRUCTURES

Much of Uganda's economy is informal and self-employed, and Uganda's economic operation is focused on micro- and small enterprises. This has a strong impact on the absorption of potential larger formal companies. The high degree of informality does not facilitate responding to market demands. In fact, it depends on people's capacity to deliver services and, in the refugees' context, this varies from settlement to settlement (i.e. due to language barriers). In addition, accessing the market for refugees is not easy, as they either do not have documents that verify their acquired skills or these skills are only accredited in the country of origin, but not in the host country.

Many of the graduates end up in self-employment, especially in the building and construction industry, welding, carpentry, and electrical engineering, and are dependent on temporary and precarious job contracts. Many women rely on customers in tailoring, hairdressing and beauty salons. Where there is excess supply of trained workers in industries, competition is substantial and revenue is far from stable. In terms of opportunities and possibilities of development, the country has a huge potential in the digital marketplace.⁸² When exploring such a sector, it is easy to observe that only a limited offer is produced locally against a huge demand. The development of technology that communities have in different areas of the country should be a driver that stimulates the expansion of the markets.

COVID-19 AND ITS IMPACT ON TVET

The outbreak of COVID-19 has hindered access to, and the delivery of, TVET activities, as well as limiting working opportunities due to the impact of the pandemic on the economy in Uganda. Although there have been difficulties in the implementation, activities have

⁸¹ REHOPE – Refugee and host population empowerment strategic framework, Uganda (2017)

⁸² See the focus box on "Creative industry"

been adapted and modified to ensure their continuation and maintain the momentum of some initiatives. Over 15 million learners have been shut out of classrooms and confined to their homes without access to personal instruction. The Ministry of Education launched a COVID-19 response plan to provide the distribution of home study kits and broadcasting lessons. A call for a comprehensive response to COVID-19 was launched by the social partners, the Federation of Uganda Employers and the National Organization of Trade Unions to measure vulnerable groups who might have been left behind, including refugees.

A recent study⁸³ aimed to assess the impact of COVID-19 on people with disabilities, and came to the conclusion that people were more preoccupied with generating income for their family than contracting the virus. In terms of initiatives rolled up during the first stage of the pandemic, many programmes continued to be delivered through digital platforms. Education-related e-programmes, among others, have come from the National Information Technology Authority-Uganda (NITA-U) - which proposed several initiatives for e-learning, examination and e-teacher portals and SMS services. However, teachers are not trained to work with such tools and techniques. Another notable initiative was proposed by Enabel, the Belgium Development Agency, to the MoES through a distance learning strategy called the Sandbox. It introduced ICT tools and practices, such as SMS and video-conferencing, to facilitate distance learning during and post COVID-19 to boost interaction within the school community.

TVET PROGRAMMES AND ACTORS IN UGANDA

FEATURED ACTORS AND PROGRAMMES: LINKING LEARNING TO EARNING (LL2E) - RWAMWANJA

AGENCY	FCA
FUNDER	MFA
TIMELINE	2015-2023 (overall implementation, that can be extended)
TARGET	2,128 young people (between 2018 and mid 2020 71 percent of graduates find work

⁸³ Light for the World, TRAC FM (2020), The Impact of COVID-19 on Persons with Disabilities in Uganda

INTRODUCTION

Since 2015, with funding from the Finnish Ministry for Foreign Affairs (MFA), Finn Church Aid (FCA) has been implementing the Business TVET in Rwamwanja refugee settlement.⁸⁴ The project is based on the Linking Learning to Earning (LL2E) approach which aims to link training with the labour market by informing decisions through market analysis and collaborating with private entities to facilitate TVET delivery.⁸⁵

The initiative was implemented taking into account the REHOPE strategy guidelines, which set a 70-30 resource sharing between refugees and host communities respectively. The target group selected for this initiative was young people, who are seen as the most vulnerable, in particular those without parents or caregivers, but especially girls with caring responsibility. Of the estimated refugee population of 63,000, 70 percent are young people with no expertise to participate in viable economic activities.

At the beginning of the programme in 2016, FCA constructed a training centre in the settlement and reached 2,128 young people through training in market-led vocational skills. Over this period, nearly 2,130 young people have been trained in market-led vocational skills. A majority of these young people (70 percent) are Congolese refugees. Through FCA's LL2E approach , approximately 1,512 young people, including 62 percent male and 38 percent females, were employed by June 2020 – this includes 86 percent who were self-employed and 14 percent who were in informal/wage employment. Young people are employed in hotels and restaurants, garages, shoe factories, farms and hair salons and with UNHCR Implementing Partners e.g. Save the Children, AVSI, ADRA, AWYAD, ALIGHT, Tutapona, YAN and MTI as community-based trainers, coaches, translators and incentive workers due to skills acquired through TVET training. FCA also supported the trained young people in forming and registering business associations, and some of these provide services in and around the refugee settlement. For example, Minyeto Kwetugura, a youth business association formed after their TVET training, recently won a contract with AVSI/UNHCR to provide services in assembling and repairing bicycles for the local community leaders.

MARKET ORIENTATION

As per the LL2E⁸⁶ approach, the Rwamwanja TVET project has conducted a market assessment to identify market skills gaps and to propose courses that could interest young people with the aim of motivating them and therefore reducing the dropout rates. Assessments have been generally realised on a yearly basis allowing to monitor market trends and to best allocate resources to exploit capacities produced through the TVET. Market assessments have informed curriculum development and determined course offerings, shape the complementary services offered during training and provide information on post-training linkages necessary to improve young people's prospects for a sustainable livelihood. It is noteworthy to mention that due to the limited opportunities available in the

⁸⁴ In South-west Uganda, the Rwamwanja Refugee settlement currently hosts more than 63,000 refugees.

⁸⁵ For more information please refer to: <u>https://www.kirkonulkomaanapu.fi/wp-</u> content/uploads/2014/04/FCA-Impact-assessment-LL2E.pdf

⁸⁶ See annex to observe the model

location of implementation, assessments have not always been adequate. This limitation was addressed through a strong focus on entrepreneurship and the delivering of post-training support in small business start-ups.

SUPPORT SERVICES

Support services are implemented by career counsellors who advise on making the right career choice and make connections with employers and businesses, along with the education path. In this regard, formal orientation and inductions have been provided to support young people to take decisions about their participation in courses and to validate their skills and request prior qualification. To facilitate the recognition of prior qualification (international recognition is quite weak), the Uganda Directorate of Industrial Training delivered assessments for non-formal training/skills. Thanks to this mechanism, candidates completed pre-determined exams and then received award marks for recognition, and certification at a later stage alongside financial aid for fees, accommodation, and course materials.

Social integration for young refugees represents a major challenge. This is dictated by the unfamiliarity with the official language of Uganda, the lack of proof of prior certification and post-trauma deriving from conflict experiences. To facilitate the transition of young people into the TVET programme, the LL2E initiative has shaped supporting courses based on community needs by addressing the challenge of distance between the vocational centre and the communities where trainees live during community-based training. It also provided business skills for guidance on job applications and customer service skills, included tracer studies on graduates and facilitated post-training support to graduates who are unemployed or in need of other forms of support (e.g. additional training, access to networks).

ACCREDITATION

The Rwamwanja TVET training centre was accredited by the Government of Uganda, through the DIT for the validation of learners' skills. Based on the project evaluation (2017), in 2015 and 2016 respectively 95 percent and 100 percent of learners passed accredited DIT exams.

TEACHERS' QUALIFICATIONS

The Rwamwanja TVET project training instructors received business development training to enable them to deliver classes on this subject, thereby providing a more practical orientation to learners. In addition, instructors who have also worked as career counsellors, received dedicated training on this subject.

LIFE/CORE SKILLS

Core skills training has been delivered for a period of four months with the addition of two more in industrial training, setting a basis for future collaboration after the learning period. Curricula have considered the importance of introducing life skills alongside core skills sessions. Life/core skills have been embedded in the curricula to ensure young people could understand communication skills/challenges. Several assisting teachers have been assigned to refugees' student groups and information systems support has been used to

facilitate learning in different languages. However, few learning sessions were taught mainly in English, while exams were proposed only in English, representing a major barrier to Congolese refugees.

TECHNOLOGY, INNOVATION AND NEW SECTORS

An increased interest has emerged toward the expansion of digital skills and a strong curiosity around the capacity of young people to develop and apply new concepts. In fact, ICT sections and material have been introduced at the vocational facilities. An example of the integration of digital skills in courses comes from the collaboration with Mondo,⁸⁷ an Estonian NGO, which set up digital competence classes. Environmental themes and alternative energy solutions have also been identified (e.g. solar), even though not much has been seen in terms of integration and development.

GENDER EQUALITY

In Uganda, vocational schooling is primarily taken up by males, and only one fourth of females attend training courses due to the inadequacy of the curricula proposed or the limited services. The shortage of childcare services is one of the key reasons for the absenteeism of young women during school. Importantly, the project centred on including young women with family obligations through community-based training/activities (satellite centres) is an attempt to make training more available to all young people who show interest. In terms of trainees' selection, the project had a male to female ratio of 55 to 45 and the gender balance is improving.

BRIDGING TO THE LABOUR MARKET

The appointment of a career counselling mechanism provided a guide for trainees and graduates towards gainful employment. According to the project evaluation, 78 percent of graduates find employment within six months. However, the employment rate can fluctuate based on the competencies of graduates and dynamic market needs. Private sector business collaborations have been used to promote on-the-job placement/industrial preparation within private sector businesses, as well as to improve the awareness of key labour market demands among trainees and implementation organizations alike. The students have been supported in facilitating job development for graduates who have finished their industrial training.

Access to finance was observed as one of the main challenges for youth in Uganda because of the cost of lending (with the interest rate up to 20 percent per annum), and related issues to access to finance (security issues, land titles, building titles). FCA has planned to introduce business coaching/incubation to support business starters after they graduate (this will be piloted in 2021).

An emerging practice is proposed through the Creative Industries initiative by FCA. A Creative Industries programme was piloted between 2019 and 2020 in Uganda. FCA decided to launch a pilot phase focusing on two specific industries: game development

⁸⁷ https://mondo.org.ee/en/digitalskills/

and music production. The pilot phase⁸⁸ consisted of practical training delivered by international experts in both game development and music production, to a cohort of 25 young students, mostly from Kampala. Some key preliminary findings of this model indicate that skills training, networking and job creation programmes for creative industries are in high demand. Investments in creative industry skills and livelihood training programmes can boost employment opportunities and future work-life skills of young people, especially in urban contexts. The programme supports the trend of opening up vocational education to modern trades and supports the development of Greening TVET and emerging innovations. Promoting climate-friendly professions will also support the development of greening economies in the long run.



Continuous collaboration with authorities and employers Continuous advocacy and lifelong learning

88 The pilot phase of the Creative Industry initiative is being formalised into a programme, which will be implemented in Uganda as of June 2021 and in Kenya in 2022.

SUPPORT TO SKILLING UGANDA (SSU) PROGRAMME

AGENCY	Uganda Ministry of Education, the World Bank (WB) and GIZ on behalf of BMZ.
FUNDER	Belgian Government, EU Trust Fund and the Irish Government
TIMELINE	2015 — 2021
TARGET	8,000 graduates; TVET policy (2019)

INTRODUCTION

The Support to Skilling Uganda (SSU) programme is a joint initiative promoted by Ireland, the EU and Belgium (Enabel) for a period of six years, from 2015 to mid-2021, in Western Nile Region (Albertine/Rwenzori). The programme collaborates with the Uganda Ministry of Education, the World Bank (WB) and GIZ (on behalf of BMZ). The programme objective is to increase youth employability by enhancing the standard of preparation and learning in the acquisition of skills and by making TVET more sensitive to the requirements of the labour market. SSU helps change the TVET model and the <u>Skilling Uganda</u> Policy towards being guided and market-oriented by the private sector.

The programme has focused on the main axis:

- To propose and finalise a TVET policy⁸⁹ in 2019.
- To fund and partner with multiple agencies to support trainees for the next five to ten years and facilitate the transition and handover to the Ugandan government.
- To promote TVET institutes and centres of excellence in the country as well as to support the government and training structures and educational services by launching Private Public Partnerships (PPP) and linking them with secondary schools.

Different courses have been delivered through both formal (long-term courses, two to three years), non-formal (one to nine months) and instant training (short-term courses of one to four weeks). The courses have been assessed by the Directorate of Industrial Training (DIT). Through the skills development fund, over 5,000 graduates of non-formal training and over 3,000 graduates of instant training have been reached.

MARKET ORIENTATION

Employability and market assessments have been carried out on a regular basis before and after the completion of non-formal training. These have underpinned the analysis of the key trade needs in camps and have also allowed the selection of vocational education and training institutions adequate to deliver training. The assessments also showed that there is

⁸⁹ http://www.education.go.ug/wp-content/uploads/2020/05/FINAL-TVET-POLICY_ IMPLEMENTATION-STANDARDS_IMPLEMENTATION-GUIDELINES_19TH_MAY_2020.pdf

no notable private sector in Karamoja and West Nile to employ the better skilled trainees of these programmes. The labour market is mostly saturated and the chances for employment are extremely low for graduates. In this context, it was suggested that, based on the type of trade and the level of expertise needed, the optimal period of training should last for longer and be more targeted to market demands. In addition, assessment levels of skills needed should be part of regional labour assessment per typology of trade.

SUPPORT SERVICES

Services for refugees in this initiative have been ensured by the support provided by partner NGOs with the objective to integrate in line with the skilling up pattern. Social inclusion was facilitated by the provision of language courses and soft skills training.

ACCREDITATION

Longer-term diploma courses accredited by the National Curriculum Development Centre (NCDC) are intended to be informed by private sector requirements. Instead, TVET's provision is constrained as providers are caught in a web of national and standardized education, credential and (TVET) qualification network systems. The participants in SSU are tested through a modularized accreditation based on competence-based assessment. DIT's certified shorter courses provided by SSU training were designed to leave more space for creativity to innovate and define the trade.

TEACHERS' QUALIFICATIONS

Selected vocational technical institutions delivered training and capacity development to teachers. SSU also equipped the institutes to facilitate and simplify teaching conditions. National qualifications were a requirement to recruit teachers, even though most of the teachers involved had only a theoretical background and not practical teaching. On the other hand, Enabel's SDHR initiative⁹⁰ has provided training assistance to Vocational Training Institutes in ensuring teachers bring work experience. SDF collaborators and members of government workers are involved in delivering a common work-package.

LIFE/CORE SKILLS

Entrepreneurship, bargaining, CVs and jobs skills were all included in SSU training curricula. The importance of entrepreneurship growth is now more visible in vocation and training institutions and SDF initiatives. SSU provided some consideration to life and core skills, primarily in curriculum development and life skills training, mostly delivered through institutional and training environments.

TECHNOLOGY, INNOVATION AND NEW SECTORS

In order to improve and build workplace competencies, the SSU has implemented workbased learning initiatives to close the gaps between the world of training and the world of work. In the refugee settlements in Northern Uganda, a "<u>how to" virtual reality (VR) initiative</u> was launched by Enabel in 2017. This technology was piloted in hand pump mechanics

⁹⁰ https://open.enabel.be/en/UGA/2197/955/u/harnessing-the-power-of-innovation.html



Dorcas, dress making trainee $\ensuremath{\mathbb{C}}$ Finn Church Aid / Hugh Rutherford

training with the objective of providing practical inputs to trainees. The training material was designed by Ugandan companies together with training institutions enabling public-private partnerships. Despite this initiative, most trainees still undertake practice-based learning in person with companies inside or outside their sub-region.

GENDER EQUALITY

Within the SSU, the participation of girls and young women has been limited and remains below 30 percent. In vocational schools, TVET curricula continue to concentrate on male dominant expertise in architecture, design, welding, plumbing, electricity, carpentry, automobile and hydraulics. For female students, the focus is on hairdressing, tailoring and cooking, and serves to sustain the gender-stereotyping of skills. To increase female participation, the SSU has launched career guidance campaigns and radio programmes to encourage girls and women to participate in TVET courses. A Gender Based Violence (GBV) assessment suggests and recommends guidelines and tools to be aligned with the National Policy and Action Plan on GBV.

BRIDGING TO THE LABOUR MARKET

Although microfinance institutions, savings groups and financial services can easily provide start-up capital, access to finance is one of the main challenges to enter into the labour market. After completion of training, the necessity to access capital can be explained by the fact that the majority of graduates have workable skills that are not required or they cannot be absorbed by the formal sector. Sometimes they are even too distant from the locations where training is held in communities.

The SSU conducted tracer studies six months after the graduation period. These studies have been able to identify the degree of absorption of graduates into the labour market and informed the adaption to the implementation, in terms of training changes for demand-driven trades and increasing the level employment of graduates. A relevant finding from a 2019 tracer study focused on the income sources before and after the training programme. It found the income generated through self-employment significantly increased from 13 percent to 33 percent while the income from family support dropped to 22 percent among TVET participants. This indicates entrepreneurship and life skills improved in learners. Overall, 65 percent of graduates have been absorbed in the labour market or self-employment. The remaining group of graduates remain unemployed or engaged in low-skilled labour activities, not related to the followed training path.

CONCLUSIONS

EMERGING PRACTICES

- Higher participation is encouraged by covering fees and associated costs of attending TVET. The distance from TVET centres was resolved by a community-based approach which led to the creation of satellite centres with childcare services in refugee settlements. A stimulating environment, training centres and activities enabled active participation among refugees. Strategies to lower the dropout rate among girls included career guidance and radio programmes to encourage their participation in TVET courses.
- Proficiency testing was promoted to give illiterate trainees the opportunity to demonstrate their practical competences rather than rely exclusively on examination and certification standard approaches. Non-formal/hands-on initiatives were considered to provide an opportunity for both refugees and host communities to follow educational paths and obtain employable skills. Entrepreneurship and life skills alongside hands-on practical experiences largely improved self employment opportunities for graduates.
- Career guidance and counselling have been implemented to connect to work-based learning by multiple TVET actors, responding to accessibility challenges and the necessity to deliver on-the-job training. Implementation of CGC results from initiatives delivered by private, institutional and development actors. Career counselling throughout the whole learning path also facilitates entry into the labour market. CGC also tackles gender-biased career choices as the example of SSU demonstrates.

NATIONAL RECOMMENDATIONS

- Expand the capacity and resources of vocational and technical training institutes to meet the high demand from refugee communities. Stronger collaboration with the public-private sector, awareness raising, and linking with certifying systems such as UBTEB or DIT examinations would also help.
- Extend TVET providers' reach into new skill areas (including digital), to adapt to changing market requirements, since their connections are limited to a restricted set of industries in the private sector.
- Coordinate and develop recognition of prior learning further in coherence with national policies to ease refugees' access to the labour market. Informal and traditional apprenticeship practices should be linked to the same system of recognition, validation and certification of competencies. Development partners could pilot different tools and processes to be evaluated and developed in the future to achieve the most suitable system for national practices. Support services such as language skills promotion should be expanded. Career guidance and counselling should be linked to and developed further with the national CGC system and curricula, including career guidance counsellor training to avoid the fragmentation of CGC services and delivery in the future.

- **Create awareness of gender bias and the needs of people with disabilities** through the provision of community awareness raising, career guidance and counselling, safe transport and safe boarding houses to these vulnerable groups. Increase the equitable access to TVET providers between refugees and host communities. It is important to continue to implement the REHOPE strategy. The provision of TVET should be feasible, meaning that the TVET providers should locate in the refugee settlements.
- Invest in TVET teacher training and develop new teaching methods that match the professional expertise and practical skills in labour markets. Teachers in formal institutions have limited workplace experience and therefore are not focusing enough on practice. Suggested solutions are to provide hands-on teacher training on practical competencies in the trade, cooperate with teacher training institutes and support the practical part of teacher training. In addition, the inclusion of labour market requirements in teacher training curricula should be promoted, which could also include psychosocial support, inclusive education, teachers in crisis context training and e-learning pedagogies. Further training for teachers in career guidance and counselling should be standardised.
- Inform TVET participants about market trends before they enrol on a specific course and offer them options for non-formal and instant training (like the ones delivered in SSU and LL2E) that address immediate employment needs. To ensure that demand meets supply, TVET organizations should ensure career counsellors provide market information to students to help them to make the best decision, support career choices, ensure continuous support during the studies and engage the students with labour market or with entrepreneurship services.

SUMMARY TABLE

SUMMARY

In Uganda, the progressive refugee policies represent an opportunity in terms of integration. Despite the great importance of the informal sector in terms of employment, the non-formal TVET system is still under development. The intrinsic informal nature of the job market based on relationships and connections prevents a more formal recognition of the needed skills and capacities as well as lower labour protection.
ACTOR 1 KEY CONTRIBUTIONS

The <u>Rwamwanja project</u>, based on the Linking Learning to Earning (LL2E) approach, led to:

- Connecting relevant training to labour market needs. Career counselling has connected graduates with employers and help to start their own business.
- Community-based courses, to accommodate distance and childcare needs, provided in the training centres to young mothers.
- 3. Partnerships with other organizations to develop digital skills among a selected group of refugees.

ACTOR 2 KEY CONTRIBUTIONS

The <u>Support to Skilling</u> <u>Uganda (SSU)</u> is a joint initiative funded by Irish Aid, the EU and Belgium cooperation (Enabel) and GIZ. This intervention led to :

- 1. The finalisation of the TVET policy.
- 2. The promotion of TVET centres of excellence through PPP and the provision of instant and short-term courses to refugees focusing on entrepreneurship, bargaining and soft skills trainings.
- 3. An important innovation consisting of a virtual reality initiative, which improved blended learning significantly.

ACTOR 3 KEY CONTRIBUTIONS

 The <u>Creative Industry</u> <u>programme</u>, delivered by Finn Church Aid (FCA). The pilot phase proposed courses on advanced digital skills in game design and music production and contributed to building an understanding that multicountry collaborations are possible given the size of the market demands for these digital skills and limited regulation in place

RECOMMENDATIONS

The main areas of recommendations at the national level emerging from the analysis relate to:

- 1. capacity of vocational training institutes to meet the demand.
- 2. need for TVET providers to expand into new skills areas (including digital).
- 3. better coordinated efforts by TVET providers to standardise RPL and certification.
- **4.** need for more awareness raising on gender bias and special needs and for more equitable access to TVET for refugees.
- 5. requirement for teachers to have experience of the private sector.
- 6. informing TVET candidates about labour market trends before enrolment.

MOST RELEVANT EMERGING PRACTICE

A promising practice relates to a FCA pilot project that confirmed the great potential of markets associated with advanced creative industries skills and going beyond the national level.



© Finn Church Aid / Hugh Rutherford



GLOBAL RECOMMENDATIONS

In light of the evidence from the five countries and various programmes taken into account for this study, the list below offers a general overview of key recommendations that apply to each thematic area selected for this study. The validity of these recommendations might require some degree of contextualisation but the general orientation of each is in line with the emerging findings overall. In addition, more granular evidence available in terms of impact and refugee profiling was limited to a short amount of time and multiple partners to represent. For future research, it is recommended to deepen the evidence-based dialogue that can inform programme designs and strengthen the community of practice that this study attempted to initiate as a first step.

PARTNERSHIPS

- Learn from each other and work together: TVET actors, including NGOs, must learn from interventions by other actors. Multi-actor dialogue between multilateral/ bilateral funding agencies (for example the World Bank, BMZ, EU agencies), national authorities and trade unions and chambers of commerce can expand the role of TVET actors within programmes, embedding multiple components targeting both supply and demand of the labour market. This will facilitate better coverage, more harmonized practices and the best usage of each partner's strengths.
- Strengthen horizontal exchange: TVET programmes tend to operate in national silos thus extending the dialogue regarding their role through regional platforms and initiatives can trigger the sharing of good practice and lessons learnt among TVET actors.
- Seek innovative financing solutions for TVET: Examples of this would include national and international public-private partnerships for TVET provision, training funds, investments into innovative development finance, and embedding TVET in public and private infrastructure investments, including green works.

INCLUSION OF REFUGEES AND IDPS

- Understand barriers with more and better disaggregated data: In order to facilitate the inclusion of refugees and IDPs in TVET programmes and the labour market, capacities of data collection and data monitoring need to be strengthened. This entails but is not limited to data on legal status, age, gender, disabilities, TVET enrolment and completion rates.
- **Translate inclusive national policy documents into regulatory frameworks** that recognise the status of refugees and forcibly displaced people and enable their legal inclusion in TVET and skills recognition services and their access to the formal labour market. Multi-stakeholder partnerships can support this endeavour.
- Strengthen TVET bodies for inclusive TVET systems: Advocate and support national authorities to address common challenges that affect the situation of refugees and host communities (quality of TVET, labour market orientation, neglected role of the private sector) while recognizing the specific vulnerabilities of refugees (language, psychosocial etc.).
- Support non-formal training and the upgrading of informal apprenticeship as pathways to formal TVET and support the development of TVET systems towards harmonized and integrated systems at national level.
- Value the socioeconomic potential of refugees and IDPs, recognising their skills and strengthening their motivation to lead a self-determined life.
- Include refugees and IDPs in programming cycles so that their situation and needs are fully taken into account and their voice heard at all stages of programming and implementation.

- Scale-up inclusive TVET programmes with multiple partners: Many inclusive TVET programmes remain in the low thousands, most likely because of high costs or low societal value. Increased attention to public-private partnerships, better integration of TVET components into infrastructure investments through on-the-job training and apprenticeship and linking TVET to larger flagship programmes focused on labour market strengthening is needed.
- Value prior learning: Advocate and support national authorities to better regulate and enhance the recognition of prior learning (RPL) experiences prior to and upon admission in TVET institutions as an important first step to identify potential skills areas and interests of refugees.
- Provide psychosocial support and promote social cohesion through TVET when setting up integrated TVET courses with refugees and members of host communities. Support the provision of further training in this regard to teachers and trainers.

TEACHER TRAINING AND TRAINING OF TRAINERS

- Value teachers and trainers: Qualified teachers are scarce in areas of humanitarian crisis, therefore retention strategies and incentivising the recruitment (through higher salaries, social recognition and continuous training) might entail additional benefits. Strengthening standards of teacher training with regard to the integration of refugees should be taken up by ministries and teacher training colleges.
- Support formalized TVET teacher training: This needs investment by governments and donors. Formal teacher training is important for the quality of TVET and the perception of the TVET teacher's work. It is a key factor for appropriate guidance of refugees. Besides hard skills, TVET teachers should be trained in pedagogies, didactics and intercultural communication, as well as training of TVET management and supervision staff. Promote the inclusion of TVET teachers in the national Teachers' Policies.
- Develop skills for conflict-sensitive teaching, psychosocial support and inclusive education with teachers and trainers to strengthen cohesion and peaceful coexistence between refugees and host communities.

LABOUR MARKET ORIENTATION

 Improve the image of TVET: As the general perception about TVET often tends to be negative, a greater effort and targeted measures to shift perceptions could be conducive to increasing the profile of skills acquired. This is true for learners and employers. This can be done through meetings with the community prior to new enrolments where young learners are informed and can discuss career pathways, employment trends and further training prospects of chosen trades with private sector representatives.

- Understand labour markets better: When designing TVET programmes for refugees, TVET actors need more real-time and systematic evidence on the evolution of markets, on the issuing of work permits and other risk factors that could hamper access to the formal and informal labour market in vulnerable communities. TVET actors should work together to produce strong labour market assessments and share this information with refugees. This information can serve to adapt the TVET offer to real local employment needs and provide solid employment perspectives to refugees.
- Involve the private sector in the design of learning content: Ensure the involvement of employers in the design of flexible and easily upgradeable curricula and learning material for refugees and host communities, both for formal and non-formal training provision (for occupations they can legally be active in) which should reflect the skills needed in the labour market. If perspectives of return to the country of origin exist, the training in the host country can/should already support reintegration processes. TVET institutes can benefit from stronger linkages with professional development programmes and curricula led by private stakeholders, governments, IOs, NGOs etc., for example in the context of value chain and market development.
 - **Encourage work-based learning schemes** for refugees and members of the host community such as paid apprenticeships to strengthen the involvement of local employers and hence increase labour market orientation. Lack of or weaknesses in regulations for internships or apprenticeships (e.g. accident insurance for the students during the placement, on-the-job-training) also prove to be a challenge. Formalising arrangements with employers to ensure TVET courses lead to a recognised work experience can create an incentive for the employer and TVET graduates to maintain the relationship.



Elizabeth (c) gets pampered at Lucien (L) her son in law's hair salon shop, Ramawanja Settlement, Uganda © Sumy Sadurni

LIFE/CORE SKILLS AND SUPPORT SERVICES

- Include life/core skills within skills standards and TVET courses. Life/core skills
 often include skills related to teamwork, communication, critical thinking, problemsolving, negotiating or a proactive work attitude, and should be embedded in TVET
 provision. In some cases, they also include literacy and basic numerical skills.
- Offer career guidance, counselling and mentoring before, during and after TVET programmes. This is key to improving completion rates and effective support to TVET learners, in particular those who require a more individualized approach. Mentors could be senior teachers, alumni or senior students, specialized staff from the TVET centres and in-company trainers and small business owners who would be trained in career guidance and counselling to fulfil the role of career counsellors. If employment services exist, they can play an important role in supporting career guidance, counselling and mentoring services. Standardized training for career guidance counsellors in teacher training institutes would ensure the quality.
- **Offer language, literacy and cultural courses where needed**: Other support services can include language, literacy, basic numeracy and cultural/ integration courses for refugees to better prepare them for TVET.
- Build confidence and attitude of refugees: Life/core skills are in deficit since most refugees are not necessarily receiving adequate psychosocial support alongside their vocational skills training. More intentional actions are needed to build the confidence and the attitude of refugees with respect to the labour market.

GENDER EQUALITY AND INCLUSION OF VULNERABLE GROUPS

- Consider specific access barriers: Age and distance should not become discriminatory factors to access TVET opportunities when designing TVET interventions. The design of TVET programmes can include support services to overcome barriers to access TVET opportunities (e.g., safe boarding houses and transport, assistant teachers for language adaptation), and take into consideration the most suitable duration, timing and location for learners.
- Set-up financing schemes for vulnerable groups: Attending training can be costly for refugees and vulnerable host community populations. Work-based learning schemes such as paid apprenticeships, and financial aid in the form of loans, grants, scholarships or tool-kits are good solutions to overcome financial barriers.
- Promote female enrolment: Sociocultural issues still exist strongly and affect women in accessing training and their occupational choices that are often influenced by traditional gender roles. TVET institutes should be promoting female enrolment in all courses as a core priority through focused career guidance aimed at reducing the gender bias related to each profession.

- **Ensure a safe learning environment:** Safety concerns and gender-based violence still plague refugees' communities and prevent women from attending the training at TVET institutes and participating in work opportunities. Raise awareness within the communities, follow a holistic approach, provide safe spaces for women, consider flexible training hours, ensure safe accommodation, and transport options and ensure adequate childcare provision during training and working periods.
- **Consider disabilities in providing TVET:** TVET institutes should accommodate the needs of people with disabilities more explicitly by working more closely with other actors such as the Ministries of Labour and specific commissions for disability, and disabled people's organizations (DPOs). These actors should incentivize access to TVET programmes for people with disabilities by facilitating admission criteria, providing accessible training facilities and reasonable accommodation where required, and supporting their transition to employment.

RECOGNITION AND ACCREDITATION

- Bring recognition of prior learning and mutual recognition of skills and qualifications at national, regional (and global) level: This is of the highest importance. Countries should strengthen their national systems for the recognition of prior learning to ensure that skills and qualifications that people possess are recognized in national labour markets, opening opportunities for further learning and accessing formal labour markets. Regional Economic Communities such as IGAD could accelerate efforts to facilitate the recognition of qualifications across countries, enhance mobility at the regional level and improve the opportunities of return to the country of origin.
- Make sure courses are accredited and recognised: Accreditation should also be open for blended learning programmes, a mix of face-to-face and virtual courses. Recognition of non-formal training provision should also be strengthened through arrangements with employers and guidelines from TVET national authorities.

BRIDGING TO THE LABOUR MARKET

- **Build stronger linkages to the private sector:** TVET actors can provide refugees with stronger linkages to the private sector by setting up job-seeking services and work-based learning schemes in the offer and by expanding the role of private sector actors when defining learning objectives and tests to ensure their buy-in.
- Support self-employment: Lack of access to finance to invest in small businesses remains a major barrier. This goes beyond enabling a favourable policy environment. Instead, seek cooperation with microfinance providers and institutes and risk management facilities, and provide start-up kits. Business development and incubation services should be made available for longer periods. In addition, group enterprises such as cooperatives should be encouraged.

• **Facilitate transitions to work for the most vulnerable:** In order to facilitate transitions from training to work, and to retain the refugee within the company/sector they have trained in, financial incentives including wage subsidies, especially for the most vulnerable, or toolkits and support to companies, should be considered.

TECHNOLOGY, ENVIRONMENT AND INNOVATION

- Consider high-tech and low-tech solutions: The importance of digital teaching and learning has increased rapidly due to the COVID-19 pandemic and needs to be further developed. Thereby it is important to offer not only high-tech but also low-tech solutions.
- Invest in digital skills: Digital skills are increasingly in demand and multiple institutes are investing in this area. Yet, the number of refugees benefiting from training is still limited since it is very time and resource intensive. Investment in digital skills and infrastructure requires a significant amount of funding, strategic partnerships, and capacity building.
- Support connectivity, and ICT courses: A number of TVET institutes offer ICT courses but the market might be much larger. Connectivity to ensure blended learning and ICT courses is an important area of investment and precondition for refugees to benefit from emerging skills in the digital economy. In the short, medium and long term, up-skilling and reskilling TVET measures will be important. Digitalization and ICT courses are a key factor in this.
- Greening TVET for a just transition to green markets: Add climate-sensitive content to curricula, promote resource efficient sectors such as renewable energies, circular economy, bioeconomy, sustainable water management, etc. and offer re-skilling and upskilling courses in growing sustainable economies.



Rhama in a practical class on welding at the East Africa Institute of Welding (EAIW) in Kitengela, Kenya © ILO / Translieu / Nyaberi



REFERENCE LIST

PUBLICATIONS

Abdelkarim, A. (2019). TVET in Sudan: government negligence, employers' response and challenges of reform under cluttered socioeconomic conditions.

Abebe Girum, Tigabu Degu and Gebrehiwot Ageba (2018b). What drives productivity change in the manufacturing sector? Evidence from the metalworking industry in Ethiopia. Working Papers 020, Ethiopian Development Research Institute.

Aita S. (2008). Employment and labour law in the Arab Mediterranean countries and the Euromediterranean partnership.

Assessment of Youth Education Pack (YEP) Programme in Dadaab and its relevant replicability in Somalia. Infoscope Consulting Ltd.

Assessments for integrated, market-oriented trainings and partnership with public TVET Colleges in Shire and Mai-Tsebri Towns, Tigray, Ethiopia. MEGEN Power (MGP) Ltd. (2020)

BMZ (2017). Increasing income for the world's poorest refugees and their hosts.

British Council (2018). Inclusion of refugees in technical and vocational education and training.

BTC (2019). Annex to the Support to Skilling Uganda intervention (SSU): integration of the Karamoja region. TFF SSU-Karamoja (16 033 1T)

Commonwealth of Learning (2020). Strategies for blended TVET in response to COVID-19.

Council of the European Union (2016). Interinstitutional File: 2016/0289 (NLE)

DTDA (2019). Labour market profile Uganda.

Girum Abebe and Tsegay G Tekleselassie (2018). National TVET Policies and Systems in Ethiopia: current opportunities and challenges.

GIZ (2019). E4D/SOGA – Employment and Skills for Eastern Africa. An innovative public-private partnership for development.

GIZ (2019). Gambella GIZ-QEP Implementation opportunities and limitations assessment report. Menelik Anbesse.

GIZ (2019). Youth, Employment, Skills (YES) Annex I to the Contribution Agreement CRIS No. T05-EUTF-HOA-SD-54

GIZ (2020). Labour market scan report for technical, vocational and occupational skills training for refugees and host communities in Kakuma refugee camp and Kalobeyei settlement scheme in Turkana county.

Hassan, F. (2019). Technical Assistance to the EU Delegation for Cooperation in Sudan- supporting job creation and economic growth in Africa - jobs and growth compact for Sudan. House W.J. (July 2018). Labour market assessment in the crossborder area between Kenya, Ethiopia and Somalia.

| IFC (2018). Kakuma as a market place.

ILO (2016). A tracer study of Technical and Vocational Education and Training Institute graduates in Khartoum State.

ILO (2016). Guiding principles on the access of refugees and other forcibly displaced persons to the labour market.

| ILO (2019). Sector skills strategy for the garment sector in Ethiopia.

ILO (2019). State of Skills Kenya.

ILO (2020) Skills for Trade and Economic Diversification (STED) in the chemicals and cosmetics manufacturing sector In Jordan.

ILO (2020). Integrated labour market assessment in Jigjiga and Kebribeyah.

ILO (2020). Potential of skills development and labour mobility IGAD region 2020- A scoping study covering Djibouti, Ethiopia, Kenya, Somalia, South Sudan, Sudan, and Uganda.

ILO (2021). ILO support to Syrian refugees and host communities: Jordan, Lebanon, Turkey, Iraq and Egypt.

ILO and UNDP (2013). Skills development in Sudan.

ILO and UNDP (2014). Report of the empirical research on informal apprenticeship for the Darfur States.

Intergovernmental Authority of Development (IGAD) (2020). Regional education policy framework.

JICA (2018). Ex-Post Project Evaluation, 2016: Package I-7 (Sudan, South Sudan, Rwanda)

Kattaa M.(2018). Syrian refugees' status in the Jordanian labour market.

Light for the World, TRAC FM (2020). The impact of COVID-19 on persons with disabilities in Uganda.

Livelihood Working Group (2019). Report on psychosocial responsiveness in livelihoods programming.

Mastercard foundation (2019). A bridge to the future.

Ministry of Education and Sports Uganda (2019). Technical vocational education and training (TVET) Policy.

NRC (2017). Tracer study on Youth Education Pack (YEP) programme graduates in Dadaab Refugee Camps and secondary data analysis of relevant skills for specific areas of return in Somalia.

NRC (May 2019). - TVET mapping report for Dadaab Field Office.

NRC and RESI (2019). The Refugee Employment and Skills Initiative in Kenya. Rebuilding lives through trade: unlocking market opportunities for refugees and their hosts.

Pamoja For Transformation (2020). Needs assessment report.

PROSPECTS (2019). Vision Note for a new partnership between the Government of Netherlands, IFC, ILO, UNHCR, UNICEF and the WB Uganda.

Ramadan, A. (2019). Challenges and opportunities of TVET in developing countries: A case study of Sudan.

REHOPE (2017). Refugee and host population empowerment strategic framework, Uganda.

TVETA (Aug 2020). Technical and Vocational Education and Training Authority Newsletter.

TVETA (Sept 2020). Technical and Vocational Education and Training Authority Newsletter.

UNESCO (2015). Proposal for the revision of the 2001 Revised Recommendation concerning Technical and Vocational Education.

UNESCO (2016). Strategy for Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) (2016-2021)

UNESCO (2018). Policy Paper 37: What a waste: ensure migrants' and refugees' qualifications and prior learning are recognized.

UNESCO (2019). Nairobi Declaration and Call for Action on Education.

UNESCO-UNEVOC International Centre for Technical and Vocational Education and Training (2014). World TVET Database- Uganda.

UNEVOC (2019). TVET Country Profile Jordan.

UNHCR (2019). Ethiopia Country Refugee Response Plan 2019-2020.

UNHCR (2019). Global Framework for Refugee Education.

UNHCR (2019). Kampala Declaration on jobs, livelihoods and self-reliance for refugees, returnees and host communities in IGAD Region.

UNHCR (2019). Refugee Education 2030 - a strategy for refugee inclusion.

UNHCR (2019). Refugee livelihoods and economic inclusion 2019-2023 Global Strategy Concept Note.

UNHCR (2020). Poverty Alleviation: Increasing income for the world's poorest refugees and their hosts.

UNHCR, ILO (2019). Doing business in Dadaab: Market Systems Analysis for local economic development.

Wales J., Khan A. and Nicolai S. (2020). Strengthening coordinated education planning and response in crises - Ethiopia case study, ODI.

OTHER WEBSITES

MONDO WEBSITE	https://mondo.org.ee/en/digitalskills/
NTC MUBENDE & KABALE, IMPROVE SECONDARY TEACHERS' EDUCATION IN THE NATIONAL TEACHERS' COLLEGES OF KABALE AND MUBENDE	https://open.enabel.be/en/ UGA/2197/955/u/harnessing-the- power-of-innovation.html
RCMRD, WEATHERING THE STORM IN TVET TRAINING AMIDST COVID-19	https://rcmrd.org/weathering-the-storm- in-tvet-training-amidst-covid-19
UNHCR, JORDAN COVID-19 RESPONSE AND PREPAREDNESS (SEPTEMBER 2020)	https://reliefweb.int/report/jordan/ unhcr-jordan-covid-19-response-and- preparedness-september-2020

UNHCR, KEY FIGURES UGANDA

https://reporting.unhcr.org/Uganda





Graduate Boutto opened a shop with the money he earned from training other refugeees in boda boda repair \odot Finn Church Aid / Hugh Rutherford



ANNEX

KEY ANALYTICAL DIMENSIONS

THEMATIC AREAS	SPECIFIC ASPECTS FOR THE ANALYSIS
	Access to national TVET system
	Equal treatment between categories of learners
	Recognition of prior learning and qualification
INCLUSION	Mobility and portability of credits
	Labour protections in the formal economy
	Investments in teaching and learning resources
	Market evaluations on hard and soft skills in demand
MARKET ORIENTATION	Alignment between existing certification and market needs
	Selection criteria to favour market-oriented programmes
	Bridging between TVET and support courses
	Sensitising parents and communities on advantages of TVET
SUPPORT SERVICES	Formal orientation to students
	Academic and career guidance/mentorship
	Cost support for students to attend classes
	National accreditation of TVET programmes
ACCREDITATION	International accreditation of TVET programmes
	in light of regional or international mobility
	Competency frameworks for TVET professionals
TEACHER TRAINING	TVET teacher education and training on learners' needs
	Professional development of TVET teachers and trainers
	Inclusion of life skills and competencies in curricula together
	with communication, writing, speaking and presentation skills
LIFE/CORE SKILLS	Digital and information literacy
	Critical thinking skills
	Respect for diversity and inclusivity skills

	Connectivity of facilities
1	Fequipment used for TVET programmes
	ncentives for employer to create inclusive workplaces
	artnership in the public and private sector for on- ne-job learning opportunities for entry-level roles
	lignment by employers between individual pecialization and paid trainings/internships
	access to entrepreneurship schemes and self- mployment services, including financial inclusion
J	ob search and CV writing services for students
	ntry points for networking, marketing and usiness planning for students
I F	qual access to TVET programmes between girls and
GENDER EQUALITY	oys without gender bias in programme selection
AND INCLUSION OF	leasures in place to equalize access and
p	articipation of vulnerable learners
l Ir	nclusion of programmes for environmental
	ustainability, climate change adaptation/mitigation
L	inkages between TVET and green jobs
	lended learning methods to promote flexibility
	nd access to excluded groups
s	olutions to expand accessibility
	xistence of active partnerships including the rivate sector, the public sector, civil society
	rganizations and development agencies.
	rivate sector: to link national curriculum with
PARTNERSHIP	narket demand and provide financial support
	ublic sector: to enable the link between econdary and tertiary education systems
C	SOs: to support students and communities
D	evelopment partners: to support TVET programmes

KEY INFORMANT INTERVIEW TOOL

SPECIFIC ASPECTS FOR THE ANALYSIS

GUIDING QUESTIONS FOR KII

INCLUSION: WHAT IS THE LEVEL OF ACCESS OF REFUGEES TO TVET AND THEIR INCLUSION IN TERMS OF RECOGNITION OF PRIOR QUALIFICATION AND LABOUR PROTECTION ONCE THEY TRANSITION INTO THE LABOUR MARKET?

ACCESS TO NATIONAL TVET SYSTEM	What do you think is the degree of access by refugees, returnees, asylum seekers and stateless individuals to TVET programmes? Do you have any source to quantify the access by segment of refugees?
EQUAL TREATMENT BETWEEN CATEGORIES OF LEARNERS	Is there equal access to TVET services (internship, career counselling, job placement) between refugees, returnees, asylumseekers and stateless learners?
LABOUR PROTECTIONS IN THE FORMAL ECONOMY	Does your organization advocate for the inclusion of refugees in the formal economy? What practice, tools and approaches work to ensure the inclusion of refugees from an institutional perspective?
INVESTMENT IN TEACHING AND LEARNING RESOURCES	 What kind of platforms do you know/do you use to share learning resources from TVET programmes with students?
	 To what extent do you use digital learning, e-learning or blended learning techniques, given the COVID-19 crisis? What other digitization methods do you use?

MARKET ORIENTATION: WHAT KIND OF MARKET ASSESSMENTS HAVE YOU DONE/BEEN INVOLVED IN TO ALIGN THE TVET CERTIFICATIONS/ MODULES WITH MARKET DEMANDS? WHAT KIND OF SOFT AND HARD SKILLS ARE MOST IN DEMAND? SHARE DOCUMENTATION IF POSSIBLE.

MARKET EVALUATIONS ON HARD AND SOFT SKILLS IN DEMAND	Have you conducted or been involved in market assessments and/or employer surveys to identify trends in demand for hard and soft skills at the national level and for specific sectors? Could you share the latest report or connect us with a focal point to gather this information?
ALIGNMENT BETWEEN EXISTING CERTIFICATION AND MARKET NEEDS	Are the TVET certifications and programmes you are involved in being re-aligned with the ongoing market trends/changes and demands? Are employer representatives and chambers involved to some extent? Can you share some examples?
SELECTION CRITERIA TO FAVOUR MARKET- ORIENTED PROGRAMMES	Have you witnessed or been involved in the phase-out of a TVET programme that did not reflect emerging market demands? If so, for which programmes and for what kind of occupational profiles?

SUPPORT SERVICES: WHAT KIND OF BRIDGING SERVICES BETWEEN TVET PROGRAMMES AND JOB OPPORTUNITIES ARE YOU CREATING/DELIVERING/SUPPORTING?

BRIDGING BETWEEN TVET AND SUPPORT COURSES	Can you provide examples of support courses or pre-apprenticeship programmes aimed at preparing prospective TVET students to meet the requirements for entry? From your experience, how can refugees best bridge from pre- to TVET courses?
SENSITIZING PARENTS AND COMMUNITIES ON BENEFITS OF TVET	 Does your organization sensitize refugees from secondary education and their parents about the benefits, prospects and added value of TVET programmes as an alternative to tertiary education or other forms of training, or finding a job straight after secondary education?
	 How do you sensitize youth learners and their parents? Do you use promotion campaigns through social media or open days at schools?
FORMAL ORIENTATION TO STUDENTS	What kind of formal orientation and guidance course does your organization or partner organization offer to new TVET students?
ACADEMIC AND CAREER GUIDANCE/MENTORSHIP	Does your organization or partner organization provide any of the following:
	academic support
	career coaching, guidance and orientation
	• psychosocial support (MHPSS) to TVET learners
	Mentorship or student buddy programmes
	Where can I access more documentation about these forms of support?
COST SUPPORT FOR STUDENTS TO ATTEND CLASSES	 Can TVET learners from a vulnerable and disadvantaged background access financial assistance, receive scholarships or fee waivers based on their income situation or state benefits?
	• Is there a policy or regulatory document describing the details of these forms of assistance that you/someone you know can share?
	 Do vulnerable students receive financial support for local transportation, accommodation and daily meals?
	What about compensation if they lose their income while studying at a TVET school?

ACCREDITATION: DO THE TVET PROGRAMMES YOU ARE SUPPORTING LEAD TO A NATIONAL ACCREDITATION, OR INTERNATIONAL ACCREDITATION?

RECOGNITION OF PRIOR LEARNING AND QUALIFICATION	Is there a policy regulation or legislative act in the country that allows for equal recognition of qualifications acquired in the country of origin from refugees? What does the RPL process look like?
	Please specify the stage of RPL. Does your country or the TVET programme:
	fully recognize qualifications?
	 partly recognize qualifications?
	 recognize only credits or units towards a qualification?
	 allow exemption from an academic prerequisite for entering the formal education and training system or from all or part of the curriculum?
	allow certificate of labour market competencies?
MOBILITY AND PORTABILITY OF CREDITS	Do you know about TVET curricula/programmes adapted to ensure the portability of credits across institutions and organizations? Can you share more information about them?
NATIONAL ACCREDITATION OF TVET PROGRAMMES	What are the nationally-led TVET programmes in your country? Does your organisation support refugees' enrolment/bridging / completion and job placement in those?
INTERNATIONAL ACCREDITATION OF TVET PROGRAMMES IN LIGHT OF REGIONAL OR INTERNATIONAL MOBILITY	Do the TVET programmes your organization supports ensure an international or at least a sub- regional or national accreditation and certification? If so, for which country and occupational profile?

TEACHER TRAINING: DO YOU HAVE A COMPETENCY FRAMEWORK FOR TVET TEACHERS AND HOW DO YOU REVIEW IT/IMPLEMENT IT IN YOUR CONTEXT?

COMPETENCY FRAMEWORKS FOR TVET PROFESSIONALS Do you know/are you involved in the application of a TVET competency framework to TVET teachers? If so, could you share the resource or a contact to access this info?

TVET TEACHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING ON	What kind of TVET training for teachers does your organization support/deliver?
LEARNERS' NEEDS	• What about time-limited job placement opportunities with employers? Do teachers use continuous training offers and when do these offers take place?
	 How could we access a resource describing the content of these training opportunities?
PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT OF TVET TEACHERS AND TRAINERS	What kind of support do TVET teachers receive from their principals to describe, track and achieve their professional objectives? What about teacher performance? Who could provide some documentation on how this is done?

LIFE/CORE SKILLS: DOES THE TVET PROGRAMME YOU ARE DESCRIBING/REFERRING TO INCLUDE LIFE SKILLS, IT/INFORMATION LITERACY AND CRITICAL THINKING SKILLS?

INCLUSION OF LIFE SKILLS AND COMPETENCIES IN CURRICULA TOGETHER WITH COMMUNICATION, WRITING, SPEAKING AND PRESENTING SKILLS	What kind of life skills are included in the offer of the TVET programmes that your organisation supports/ delivers? Is there any documentation you/someone you know can share to detail this information?
CRITICAL THINKING, SOLUTION-BASED AND INNOVATIVE SKILLS	What kind of critical thinking, solution-based and innovative skills do TVET programmes offer? Who could share more details about the curriculum for these types of skills?
RESPECT FOR DIVERSITY, EQUALITY AND INCLUSIVITY SKILLS	Do TVET programmes you support/deliver provide foundational principles to respect diversity, equality, inclusion and social cohesion? Is there any resource to describe how these principles are communicated?

TECHNOLOGY AND INNOVATION: CAN TVET COURSES INCLUDE DIGITAL SKILLS AND CAN THEY BE DELIVERED TO REFUGEES? WHAT IS THE GENERAL CONNECTIVITY OF TVET FACILITIES? ARE BLENDED LEARNING METHODS AVAILABLE IN TVET PROGRAMMES CONSIDERING THE CURRENT CONTEXTUAL CHALLENGES?

DIGITAL AND INFORMATION LITERACY What kind of digital and information technology skills do TVET programmes offer? Who could share more details about the curriculum for these skill sets?

INTEGRATION OF ICT IN TVET	Are TVET courses in the programmes/ institutes you support delivered online? What platform are you using?
	How did you teach during COVID-19 lockdown situations?
CONNECTIVITY, POWER AND IT EQUIPMENT USED FOR TVET PROGRAMMES	 How do the TVET programmes ensure that all students have adequate internet connectivity, electricity, and access to online content?
	• Are the TVET institutes equipped with IT infrastructure such as tablets, notebooks, etc. to respond to students' needs? What kind of facilities are available?
BLENDED LEARNING METHODS TO PROMOTE FLEXIBILITY AND ACCESS TO EXCLUDED GROUPS	Do the TVET programmes you support also include blended learning methods to promote flexibility in access and to adapt with the contextual changes (COVID-19). How much has it changed in the past year and were there related challenges/successes to deal with restrictions?
SOLUTIONS TO EXPAND ACCESSIBILITY	What are the future plans to expand remote access to TVET content and what investment is your organization/partner organization undertaking to enable this transition? What could be the challenges in this expansion?

BRIDGING TO LABOUR MARKET:

- 1. Are there incentives for TVET learners to invest in their own enterprise and access financial and employment services in line with market demands?
- 2. Are there incentives for employers to create inclusive workplaces and treat refugee learners the same as other candidates?

INCENTIVES FOR EMPLOYERS TO CREATE INCLUSIVE WORKPLACES

- Do you know of incentives given to employers to include TVET learners with specific vulnerabilities in their workplace? Could you share some examples?
- Are you aware of incentives given to employers (with inclusive workplaces) who employ TVET graduates with special needs?
- Does your programme provide incentives to employers who hire ordinary TVET graduates?
 If so, which incentives and have you tracked whether a young person remains hired with an employer after incentives were cut?

PARTNERSHIP IN THE PUBLIC AND PRIVATE SECTOR FOR ON-THE-JOB LEARNING OPPORTUNITIES FOR ENTRY-LEVEL ROLES

INVOLVEMENT OF SOCIAL PARTNERS

INVOLVEMENT OF TRADES UNIONS

ACCESS TO ENTREPRENEURSHIP SCHEMES AND SELF-EMPLOYMENT SERVICES, INCLUDING FINANCIAL INCLUSION

> JOB SEARCH AND CV WRITING SERVICES FOR STUDENTS

ENTRY POINTS FOR NETWORKING BETWEEN STUDENTS AND PROSPECTIVE EMPLOYERS

- Are there partnerships between the public and private sector that you know of, which are meant to provide on-the-job- learning experiences and entry-level opportunities?
- What about employer needs surveys or how do you trace the needs of employers in TVET?
- To what extent are chambers, cooperatives and MSME representatives involved?
- Does your programme contribute to the formulation of Memorandum of Understandings (MoU) between the government and the private sector?
- Does your programme undertake trace studies to know what students do after graduation and where they end up?
- Are social partners actively involved in the design and execution of TVET training?
- If so, in what kind of areas are they involved, e.g. curriculum development, certification, onthe-job training, job placements, collective bargaining of TVET contracts, etc. at different levels (national, regional and local)?
- To what extent are trades unions or workers' representatives involved at national, regional and local level?
- Do you know about/are you involved in initiatives to ensure TVET students can access entrepreneurship and self-employment support services?
- Are marketing, product design, customer communication and business development services (e.g. courses, mentorship, practical placements) also offered to TVET learners? Can you share some examples?

Do TVET programmes that you know of offer job search and CV-writing services for students? How can we access some documentation to describe these services and their effectiveness?

Is your organization or a partner organization involved in the delivery of TVET programmes organizing networking events between students and potential employers as well as career fairs?

GENDER EQUALITY AND INCLUSION OF VULNERABLE GROUPS: HOW ARE THE TVET PROGRAMMES IMPLEMENTED TO ENSURE GENDER BIAS IS REDUCED AND DISABILITIES ADDRESSED WHEN PROVIDING TVET SERVICES?

EQUAL ACCESS TO TVET PROGRAMMES BETWEEN GIRLS AND BOYS WITHOUT GENDER BIAS IN PROGRAMME SELECTION	What kinds of measures/policies/processes are in place in TVET programmes to ensure equal access for girls and boys to the programme selection? What about gender mainstreaming activities such as enabling child-care facilities, safe study and working environment, safe transportation, support with non-traditional occupations, etc.?
MEASURES IN PLACE TO EQUALISE ACCESS AND PARTICIPATION OF VULNERABLE LEARNERS	What kinds of measures/policies/processes are in place in TVET institutes you know of/support to ensure vulnerable learners (e.g. with disabilities) can have equal access to the selection process and can participate throughout the programme?

ENVIRONMENT: WHAT KINDS OF SKILLS LINKED TO GREEN JOBS AND ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY ARE SUPPORTED THROUGH THE TVET PROGRAMME?

INCLUSION OF PROGRAMMES FOR ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY, CLIMATE CHANGE ADAPTATION/ MITIGATION

> LINKAGES BETWEEN TVET AND GREEN JOBS

Do you know about TVET programmes that include modules on environmental sustainability and specific skills related to climate change adaptation/mitigation? Can you provide some examples and how can we access more documents describing their content?

Do you know about TVET programmes that include specific technical skills training linked to the green economy, for example renewable energies? Can you share some examples and resources/contact points to gather more documentation on this?

PARTNERSHIPS: DESCRIBE ANY PARTNERSHIP IN YOUR CONTEXT TO ENABLE THE SCALE AND GROWTH OF TVET PROGRAMME (FROM PUBLIC, PRIVATE, CSO, MULTILATERAL, NGO AND OTHER ACTORS' ANGLE)

EXISTENCE OF ACTIVE PARTNERSHIPS INCLUDING THE PRIVATE SECTOR, THE PUBLIC SECTOR, CIVIL SOCIETY ORGANIZATIONS AND DEVELOPMENT AGENCIES. Do you know of TVET programmes that are supported through a multi-donor and multi-agency approach? Could you share some examples/ names of these programmes and additional focal points to provide more information? PRIVATE SECTOR: TO LINK NATIONAL CURRICULUM WITH MARKET DEMAND AND PROVIDE FINANCIAL SUPPORT

PUBLIC SECTOR: TO ENABLE THE LINK BETWEEN SECONDARY AND TERTIARY EDUCATION SYSTEMS

> CSOS: TO SUPPORT STUDENTS AND COMMUNITIES

DEVELOPMENT PARTNERS: TO SUPPORT TVET PROGRAMMES Are there private sector-funded initiatives in partnership with other actors to review the national curriculum in line with market demands and adjust programmes? How are these initiatives translating into a change in TVET programmes?

Are there public sector-led initiatives in partnership with other actors to enable a link between secondary and tertiary education systems? How are these linkages operationalized? How can we access more documentation on these initiatives?

Are there CSO-led initiatives in partnership with other actors that are focused on supporting students and communities? How can we access more documentation on these initiatives?

Are there development partner-led initiatives working with other actors to improve TVET programmes? How can we access more documentation on these initiatives?



Unaccompanied minors take part in a 3D building workshop organised by Faros NGO with the support of UNHCR © UNHCR / Achilleas Zavallis



United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees Public Health Section Division of Resilience and Solutions Rue de Montbrillant 94 CH-1201 Geneve Switzerland

T: +41 22 739 8433 F: +41 22 739 7344 E-mail: hqphn@unhcr.org

www.unhcr.org

The boundaries shown on the maps do not imply official endorsement or acceptance by the United Nations.

Cover photo: © UNHCR/Jerry de Mars

UNHCR © 2021